The Age of Surveillance Capitalism and its Impacts on Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan

Amna Munawar Khan [*]   Sakeena [+]   Mariam Asif [‡]

Abstract: *The study is intended to describe the newly emerging wave of cyber security threats under the conception of Surveillance Capitalism, which was initially defined by a Harvard university professor, Shoshana Zuboff. The idea of Zuboff emphasizes the use of various formats of data collected from different android software applications that can help regulate the political, social, and economic orientations of the targeted nations. The relevance of Surveillance Capitalism in the nuclearized subcontinent portrays a different picture of the South Asian strategic environment in which New Delhi and Islamabad are the archrival nations. The Indian offensive policies obsessed with AntiPakistani behaviour have launched a massive campaign on the mainstream social media platforms generally, and Twitter particularly. The use of countless fake social media accounts containing inaccurately maintained material for propagating purposes has become a major offensive tool of New Delhi against Islamabad. The Indian strategic community, preoccupied with the critical elements of internal Pakistan issues, is trying to mislead social media users by spreading manipulating facts about the critical nature of civil-military relations in Pakistan. Therefore, the paper's central theme revolves around the strategic dimension of Zuboff's concept of Surveillance Capitalism and its application to the decades-long Pakistan-India rivalry under the shadows of social media accounts generally and Twitter particularly.*

Introduction

The rise of surveillance capitalism and its emerging role in world politics has become an undeniable reality for the whole international community in which all states are equally vulnerable. Analogous to many other states, the emerging digital infrastructures of Pakistan are consistently pushing the whole Pakistani nation toward a global digital order where the different formats of data collected from various android software applications have become a serious concern for the government. The dramatic rise of smartphone applications and unprecedented growth across the country have fabricated a complex network of digital communication channels. The information consisting of personal detail, location identification, and changing patterns of public opinions about specific political and social developments has become a profitable market product with the rise of smartphone users in Pakistan.[1] The data obtained from various android users can easily be used for various political objectives, which are generally called information warfare. An appropriate application of information warfare under the broader conception of surveillance capitalism can be seen in New the Delhi-Islamabad hostility in which the Indian strategic community is trying to disrupt Pakistan's civil-military relations. The manipulation of data acquired from the digital world has become the most useful weapon for New Delhi against Pakistan.

[*] M. Phil Scholar, Department of Defense and Strategic Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad, Pakistan. Email: amnaakhan74@gmail.com *(Corresponding Author)*
[+] Lecturer, Department of Political Science, Women University Swabi, KP, Pakistan.
[‡] Lecturer, National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

In the presence of growing multi-layered levels of hostility, the government officers from New Delhi and Islamabad are strong-minded in pursuing rival values in cyberspace. The combination of territorial and non-territorial spheres of hostility between the governments of both sides has pushed both nations towards a modern way of warfare through started various ferocious socio-political campaigns. These campaigns have been considered the most effective weapons in the age of digital realities in social media, where the Indian offensive role is leaving worse impacts on the Pakistani people through controlling social media platforms in the face of Twitter. The widespread culture of using media through smartphone technologies has increased in South Asia dramatically in which. Indian and Pakistani societies started using social media in their routine life. The massive use of social media has led India to mislead the Pakistani people about various political, social, and economic affairs of the state. Additionally, the Indian fake social media accounts in the form of different communication digital networks have started debating the sensitive aspects of Pakistani society critically. The focus of such media campaigns in cyberspace, where the mainstream corporate sector of India can purchase sensitive information through Twitter accounts for use as an effective war tool in the non-traditional domain of undermining the presence of Pakistan in regional and extra-regional affairs.[2] The information collected through various sources can become an effective product in the global economic markets where the digital data modified in a product can let the states defeat the enemy from the internal (Rabia, A. 2020 ; Drazen, J., & Alasdair, P. 2019).

system through launching various social media campaigns on various critical issues. In Pakistan, the focus of such campaigns is civil-military relations and their histrionic growth in the country. The Indian –sponsored these campaigns have started spreading inaccurate and manipulated information based on various fake and modified facts and figures, intensifying the nature of civil-military relations in Pakistan, which is a modern warfare way.

In the age of persistently emerging realities of globalization, the modern techniques of warfare are primarily linked to technological advancement in the cyber world. The unstoppable process of globalization in the international system has pushed all the states towards a worldwide digital order under the widespread promotion of smartphone technologies. Parallel to the rising digital scenarios of the cyber world in the international system, the hostile attributes of different rival pairs have been transferred to cyberspace, where territorial borders matter less for states. The reflection of such scenarios in the South Asian regional political order can easily be assessed in the form of Islamabad-New Delhi hostility. Apart from acquiring an improved defence structure on the basis of nuclear weapons, the hostile attitude of both nations toward each other has dragged Islamabad and New Delhi into the world of digital realities. In the world of varying political attitudes of the states, the process of globalization has pushed the historical rival designs of nations have been shifted into cyberspace. The multi-layered security challenges in the digital world have started portraying an awful picture of the South Asian region where hostile nuclear powers have jumped into cyberspace. The rising significance of technologically advanced communication networks across the globe has provided a number of cyber weapons in the world of the internet. While developing its defensive mechanism in the digital world through acquiring cyber weapons, the leaders from New Delhi are strong-minded in decisively undermining the position of Pakistan in the global economic order. Therefore, the main objective of this research paper is to provide a glimpse of surveillance and its impacts on the South Asian security environment. The Indian digital malpractices obsessed with anti-Pakistani policies mainly targeting the civil-military relations of Pakistan, which is the specific case study in the paper. The paper is particularly emphasizing the dramatic rise of smartphone users and their overwhelming role in the world of android software applications. Due to the presence of numerous android applications available across the world of digital values, the research has emphasized the role of Twitter is becoming an important element in cyberspace.

What is Surveillance Capitalism

The concept of Surveillance Capitalism

explains an economic system at the global level based on various market trends in cyberspace. The spread of business communities in the digital landscape of the international system formulates a widespread culture of data collected from different android applications, selling and purchasing values. The personal data gathered from different smartphone software applications are usually based on sensitive information, personal details, and location tracing material which could be used as an effective tool for dominating the political, social, and economic affairs of states. The notion of Surveillance Capitalism emphasizes an economic market in the international system linked to a global corporate network in cyberspace where the business of data trading has become a most profitable activity. The data modifying techniques in the digital world have been recognized as an effective product for making a profit with the rise of smartphone users across the world. The dramatic rise of smartphone users in different countries has created a digital culture of various android software applications which are collecting various types of information for trading purposes. The spread of smartphone technology across the world has made all states equally vulnerable in cyberspace, where territorial borders do not matter for corporate societies. In this way, the active participation of the leading corporate companies in the world of digital realities has created an international environment of data trading which could be used for various economic purposes. The personal data consisting of various materials can be modified into attractive profit-making products which could be used to dominate the foreign markets by regulating the socio-economic orientations of a specific nation.

The concept of Surveillance Capitalism was initially introduced by a Harvard University professor of business school. She defined and explained the idea of digital market trends in her book The Age of Surveillance Capitalism: *The Fight for a Human Future at the New Frontier of Power*. Shoshana Zuboff, an American social psychologist, explores the modern notion of market trends in the form of the digital revolution – leaving worse impacts on the entire international economic order. The formulation of such a market environment at the global level, initially explained by Zuboff under the academic survey 'The Digital Declaration', is a scholarly explanation of new warfare strategies in cyberspace. In the world of rapidly evolving world of digital realities, the whole international has started empowering the role of the corporate sector in cyberspace, where the trade of computerized data has become a most profitable commodity. The formulation of data as a profitable business product will be helpful for states in dominating and enhancing influences in the mainstream economic affairs of rival nations. The further extension of Zuboff's work leads the whole debate toward more utilizations of the digital data acquired from different android software applications. The varying patterns of data consisting of specific information about a particular nation would be helpful in the future for regulating of political and strategic environments of targeted states. The use of sensitive data will later enable the states to control the political and social tendencies of the rival nations under the intense globalized culture of the whole globe. In a strategic completion of two states, the data acquired from different digital sources will be helpful in dominating the political and social affairs of rival states for the achievement of strategic objectives. The achievement of strategic objectives in the decades-long conflicts between different archrival nations has fabricated a different strategic environment in which the borderless- digital culture in different regions has become an undeniable reality for the whole international system.

In the age of globalization, the concept of Surveillance Capitalism has directly linked to the rise of globalized values structured in a digital market culture emphasizing the trade of digitally modified data. The data usually acquired from countless social media applications have become a common tool for regulating the socio-political trends of a particular will let different nations propagate the sensitive areas of the nations. The most effective tool for collecting information based on public opinions regarding major political developments of a specific nation is associated with the social media platform, which has encircled the whole globe. Therefore, the conception of Surveillance Capitalism has

indirectly explained its relevance to the worse impact of social media in the form of discussing the serious internal and external issues of a state negatively. The objective of misleading the nations in a specific direction could not only contain the substantial potential for regulating the political opinions of the public, but it could also propagate various political scenarios of a specific nation. The data gathering from social media accounts has highlighted the role of various digitally formulated information communication networks, which have grown dramatically across the globe. In this way, the notion of Surveillance Capitalism explains an updated format of cyber security threats under the shadows of data commercialization in the global economic system. (Shoshana, Z. 2020). The updated versions of cyber security threats under the notion of Surveillance Capitalism can empower the rival nations to use the sensitive information acquired from several social-media applications the meeting different strategic objectives.

Rise of Social Media and Twitter

The rising level of social media platforms in the world of countless android applications has emerged as an important element for the enhancement of the active role of people in the digital world. The dramatically increased level of social media accounts across the world has become an unquestionable feature of the contemporary world in which territorial borders matter less for the social media account holder. A massive wave of social media accounts has encircled the whole globe, and people located at different corners of the world are rapidly developing their social media values by maintaining their social media accounts. The government of different political regimes is also facing problems in controlling the rising extent of social media users due to the spread of smartphone technologies in society. Societies of different social and political, ethnic, and religious backgrounds are increasing their dependence on social media channels. In other words, people from different parts of the world have started using different formats of social media because the significance of social media cannot be denied in the contemporary international system. The overwhelming wave of social media platforms

generally, and Twitter specifically, has emerged as an effective tool for increasing the role of humans in world politics. With the help of a Twitter account, an individual can express his/her position on various social, political, and economic issues without respecting their ethnic and social affiliations to a particular cultural group. The varying patterns of their opinions on mainstream national, regional, and international issues further let Twitter users participate in evolving global politics. The active participation of individuals of different nationalities has developed an international environment of different cyber values where the states are using their social media accounts as an effective political tool for influencing and affecting the people. (Kate, F. 2019).

Given the situation mentioned above, the Pakistani nation has been growing under the influence of social media accounts due to the unprecedented growth of smartphone users in the country. The government of Pakistan is trying to manage effective regulating control over the increasing rate of android software applications. The Pakistani nation has accepted the global digital environment where the conventional notions of different social values have been transformed. The societal trend all over the world, including in Pakistan, has changed ed nature of citizens because of the expanding digital patterns of the global world order. The idea of citizen has become the concept of Netizens under the borderless characteristics of the cyber world where the geographically separating factors between the nations matter less for smartphone users. The conception of Netizens refers to an internet-dependent life of an individual in which he/she prefers to use different social media channels in his/her life. (Ronda, H. 2019). The use of different social media applications generally, and Twitter particularly, has facilitated the different individuals living under different political administrations. While ignoring their political and ideological affiliations associated with a particular nation or culture, the people living in a world of digital societies always prefer to allow android applications to access their locations and cell phone memory. In this way, the use of social media accounts in the broader social media world has intensified the lives of the Netizens by compelling them to prefer the use of social media over their daily

routines. (Michael, H., & Ronda, H. 2021). Twitter is one example that has been selected to study in this paper because a massive wave of Twitter accounts from various directions of the world has shifted the lives of the people in the cyber world. On the one hand, Twitter has become a preferred social media account for people across the globe. On the other hand, the different nations living under different hostile designs have been convinced of the use of Twitter as a political tool for shaping and reshaping the lives of its users.

The Politics of Twitter

The contemporary international system is witnessing a global political order structured on the digital attributes of varying societies. The leading state authorities have started preferring the role of Twitter in their decades-long hostile interactions due to the rise of technological advancements in the main information communication networks. Under the framework of globalization, the improvements in the information communication channels have been considered a push in the field of social media internationally, and the leaders of different nations have accepted the emerging role of digital platforms for expressing their thoughts on major political developments in regional and global affairs. In addition to facilitating the life of a common man, the leaders from different nations having strictly offensive positions against their rival states or the gatherings of rival states are convinced of the political role of social media platforms in the digital world. The strategic communities of the different states have adopted new areas for impacting the internal environment of the states under the principle of modern warfare. The updated tools of modern warfare have been observed as the most effective methods of defeating the opposite nations through using different social media tools. (Arafatul, I. 2016). Thus, Twitter has appeared globally as an actual operational area of warfare in which the leaders of different states with offensive strategies are using Twitter as an appropriate political tool.

The above-mentioned situation can easily be traced to the South Asian political order, where the regional security environment is persistently intensifying in the age of a globalized digital environment. The overwhelming wave of globalization has inaugurated a new era of strategic competition between Islamabad and New Delhi. The leaders from both sides are convinced of the objective of dominating each other in cyberspace due to the skyrocketing level of smartphone users in both countries. The emergence of android software applications in the form of smartphones has pushed both nuclear nations of South Asia into the world of numerous social media applications. The debate on cyber security threats through data trading attributes of global financial trends is dependent on the use of social media applications where Twitter stands above its peers. The use of Twitter accounts for propagating various facts and figures associated with various sensitive issues has become a common trend in the decades-long rivalries of nations located in different regions. Thus, the politics of Twitter has been recognized as the most common domain of inflexible nations' standings of the states he cyberspace in all regions, including South Asia. The pair of nuclear weapons states from South Asia has jumped into the emerging politics of Twitter, where the countless features of psychological warfare have emerged as an important domain of fighting. Indian offensive behaviour in the world of countless social media applications has started launching fake Twitter accounts for the propagating of sensitive information about Pakistan linked to serious topics. The debates on sensitively serious topics usually show the Indian negative connotation and explanations of civil-military relations in Pakistan. Analogous to several other counties from different regions, the Pakistani nation is witnessing a disturbing nature of the civil-military equation in the country. In response to the ongoing sensitive nature of the debate on the equation of civil-military relations in Pakistan, the Indian media campaigns on Twitter are leaving negative impacts on Pakistani society, where the people have started relaying the information received from different Twitter accounts. Thus, the Twitter politics between New Delhi and Islamabad has activated the Indian aggressive role in the South Asian regional digital order where the Indian strategic planners are augmenting the unbalancing nature of civil-military relations in Pakistan.

South Asian Future in Cyberspace

The decades-long hostile interaction of both New Delhi and Islamabad against each other has its roots in the history of the subcontinent when the British withdrawal from South Asia under the global wave of decolonization. The initial leadership of India decided to undo the partition of the subcontinent by negating the presence of Pakistan in regional politics. The quest to oppose Indian aggressive regional postures led the Pakistani leaders to strengthen their defence against Indian hostile designs. The Indian regional policy cemented in a multidimensional approach has compelled the security establishment of New Delhi to obtainable offensive security capabilities to defeat Islamabad in regional politics. The objective of diminishing Islamabad's standing on different issues led instructed New Delhi to adopt various defence strategies against Pakistan in social, economic, and political affairs. Under the broader theme of Indian strategic thinking, the leading architectures of Indian defence policy preferred to polish the strategic muscles of the states in various directions. (Meirav, Mishali-Ram 2019). The swelling of defence capabilities of New Delhi has initiated different strategic campaigns in the traditional and non-traditional domains. As a result, the Indian hostile foreign policy toward neighbouring states constructed on several dimensions of anti-neighbourhood policy has inaugurated an ending strategic competition in the nuclearized subcontinent. The Indian security establishment is intended to defeat the role of Pakistan in the regional and extra-regional spheres by using new means of warfare.

The Indian strategic planners are strong-minded in generating negative debates on the serious security issues associated with the internal and external environments of Pakistan. The strategy for generating undesirable debate on different internal sensitive matters has led the Indian security establishment to collaborate with the IT industry for the achievement of strategic objectives through the launching of massive fake Twitter accounts. The expanding wave of clandestinely functioning countless Twitter accounts is exploiting the Pakistani society to start a culture of critical discussions on various internal issues generally and maintain irrational positions on the nature of civil-military relations in Pakistan. The negative purpose of the status of civil-military relations in Pakistan is less likely to diminish in the future do New Delhi's stubborn position on various strategic issues of regional and global importance. The active role of the Indian IT industry will empower the Indian political leaders in influencing the Pakistani nation based on various socio-political and socio-economic orientations of the general public. The combination of orientations will further motivate the Indian business community in the digital world to purchase the sensitive information collected from Twitter as well under the modern conception of Surveillance Capitalism. In this way, the concept of Surveillance Capitalism is intended to complicate the regional security environment of South Asia, where the neighbouring hostile nations equipped with nuclear weapons have willingly jumped into the world of digital realities.

Conclusion

The emerging role of social media platforms in the world of digital values has become one of the undeniable realities of the contemporary international system, where people are very active in expressing their varying positions on social media. The level of expression in the digital networks of social media has emerged as an essential element of human life in which the lack of social media accounts has been marked as a symbol of backwardness. Humans from different parts of the world living under different political administrations are convinced of the rising role of social media accounts in their lives, and Twitter has become the most popular platform in the world of countless social media networks due to its widespread promotion in the world. In this way, the spread of Twitting trends across the globe has been recognized as an effective warfare tool through which the leaders of different nations can mislead the opposite states with the help of specific information. In other words, the manipulating of specific information and the creation of fabricated data based on varying political materials have been considered the most effective method of influencing the society of the rival nation. A

comprehensive study of such values reveals different dimensions of the South Asian regional security environment in which both nuclear weapon states will actively intensify their rival patterns of bilateral interaction in the world of digital realities. The digital reflection of India-Pakistan strategic competition under the conception of Surveillance Capitalism (Joanna, K. 2019). Has become an essential feature of the regional security environment of South Asia.

While living in a post-Westphalian system of the modern state, the government of Pakistan cannot manage to escape from the emerging globalized patterns of the international system. With the unquestionable forces of transnational values in the globalized international culture of the twenty-first century, the government of Pakistan is required to update its conventional digital infrastructure. Moreover, a comprehensive campaign to counterbalance the emerging wave of cyber security threats in the form of Surveillance Capitalism because the rise of Zuboff's ideas is intended to encircle the South Asian security environment where the Indian leaders are determined to propagate various sensitive issues generally, the critical nature of civil-military relations particularly. For the effective management of rising levels of smartphone users under the shadows of social media networks, Islamabad is further needed to regulate the challenging role of social media platforms generally, including Twitter accounts.

References

Arafatul, I. (2016). *"How Indian and Pakistani Media are Covering Kashmir Unrest,"* DW. https://www.dw.com/en/how-indian-and-pakistani-media-are-covering-kashmir-unrest/a-19562791

Drazen, J., & Alasdair, P. (2019). *"Facebook, Twitter Sucked into India-Pakistan Information War,"* Reuters. https://www.reuters.com/article/us-india-pakistan-socialmedia-idUSKCN1RE18N

Joanna, K. (2020). *"Shoshana Zuboff: 'Surveillance Capitalism is an Assault on Human Autonomy'",* The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/oct/04/shoshana-zuboff-surveillance-capitalismassault-human-automomy-digital-privacy

Kate, F. (2019). *"In India-Pakistan Conflict, there's a Long-Simmering Online War, and Some Very Good Hackers on Both Sides,"* CNBC. https://www.cnbc.com/2019/02/27/india-pakistan-online-war-includeshacks-social-media.html

Michael, H., & Ronda, H. (2021). *"Netizens: On the History and Impacts of Usenet and the Internet,"* First Monday. https://firstmonday.org/ojs/index.php/fm/article/view/606/527

Meirav, M. (2019). *Conflict Change and Persistence: The India-Pakistan and Arab-Israeli Conflicts Co Joanna Kavenna, "Shoshana Zuboff: 'Surveillance Capitalism is an Assault on Human Autonomy'",* The Guardian, https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/oct/04/shoshana-zuboff-surveillance-capitalismassault-human-automomy-digital-privacy

Rabia, A. (2021). *"The Future of India-Pakistan Nuclear Rivalry,"* South Asian Voices, May 21, 2020, https://southasianvoices.org/the-future-of-the-india-pakistan-nuclear-rivalry/

Ronda, H. (2019). *"The Netizen as the Emerging New Form of Citizenship,"* Columbia University, http://www.columbia.edu/~hauben/china2019/Wuzhen-talk-2019.pdf

Shoshana, Z. (2020). *"You Are Now Remotely Controlled: Surveillance Capitalists Control the Science and the Scientists, the Secrets and the Truth,"* New York Times. https://www.nytimes.com/2020/01/24/opinion/sunday/surveillance-capitalism.html