Local Governments and the Provision of Health and Education within Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: An assessment of the Tiebout Hypothesis

Fahim Nawaz[*] Kalsoom Inam[†] Shagufta Shaheen[‡]

Abstract

This paper traces the working of various local governments within the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province of Pakistan in terms of efficiency while providing health and educational facilities. Only those districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa having a population of at least one million, were taken into account. The performance of six district local governments in the field of education and health was thoroughly analyzed. The main focus was to assess whether local governments were efficient in the provision of the required services or otherwise. In the context of this study, local governments were perceived as firms, each aiming at the efficient provision and welfare of their respective communities / localities. Annual time-series data for the period 2004 to 2015 was taken. The study revealed the performance and efficiency of each of the selected district governments. The study also confirmed the validity of the Tiebout Hypothesis in terms of the local governments of KP in relevance to the provision of health and educational services. The district government primarily revolves around the needs and aspirations of the common people. This system can perform better if properly implemented and monitored in light of the gross root level input.

Key Words: Local Government, Tiebout Hypothesis, Health, Education.

Introduction

Within the contemporary nation-state system, the government performs a diverse set of functions. Primarily, it set and execute public policy and exercise administrative and political authority through a set of institutions. In addition, it direct, control and channelize the distribution and provision of resources within the state. The distribution of resources, in turn, varies in accordance with the type and tiers of the government. For instance, democratic governments usually have a three tiers' system namely the federal, state and local, all within an over-reaching political orientation (Mustafa, 2011). This division allows for cohesion within the

---

[*]Lecturer, Department of Economics, University of Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan.
 Eamil: fahim.nawaz21@gmail.com
[†] Undergraduate Student, Department of Economics, University of Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan.
[‡] Deputy Director, DMS-IV, GHQ, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

different federating units along with a mechanism for sharing numerous responsibilities. Pakistan following its inception, started as a centralized federation thereby confining most of the subjects to the center. The centralization was mainly instituted for managing the ethnic conflict, a feature typical of the post-colonial divided countries. However, historical evidence has shown that local governments serve as an optimal platform for the inter-ethnic negotiations as well as for quarantining the ethnic conflict (Faiz, 2018). Local government refers to the smallest municipal unit which is creature of the state and is bestowed with the political will, resources and functions for welfare of the people (Lugar, 2007). Local governments enable a greater competition within different communities for provision of local public goods. This competition ensures efficiency in accordance with the similar phenomenon in case of competing firms under market mechanism (Tiebout, 1956). Decentralization in the form of local governments, played a significant role in transformation of many economics across the globe. This was more evident from the case of post 1989 East and Central Europe (Young & Kaczmarek, 2000).

Pakistan have a varied history of local governments which in most cases, were patronized by military dictators (Khan & Khan, 2015). The first of all such experiences was the Basic Democracies (BD), a four tier framework, consolidated by the then military ruler, General Ayub Khan. Another sequence of decentralized local governments was introduced by General Zia-ul-Haq in 1979, which consisted separate local bodies for rural and urban areas. The structure of local governments was again modified in 2001 by General Pervez Musharraf (Khaliq, 2012). In the post democratic transition of 2008, which established civilian rule in Pakistan, local bodies elections could not be arranged. The passage of the Local Governments Act in 2013 paved way for the aforementioned election in Pakistan. This established local governments across the various provinces of Pakistan. This study focuses on the local government institutions within the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province of Pakistan. Specifically, the efficiency of various local governments in the provision of health and education vis-à-vis improvement in public welfare, is assessed.

Methods and Procedures

In order to assess the performance of local governments in the provision of health and educational services with the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, a comparative and compresence methodology was adopted. Data on the variable of interest for the period 2004 till 2015, was extracted from Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement (PSLM), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) Bureau of Statistics, Pakistan Economic Survey, Ministry of Finance (Pakistan) and the Development Statistics of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Variables of the Study

In this study, the performance of the local governments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been assessed by taking into account the indicators related to education and health, which are as following:

- *Enrollment ratio*
  The net enrolment rate (NER) in primary education is the ratio of the number of children of age 4-9 who are enrolled in primary education to the total population of children of same age group, expressed as a percentage (UIS, 2018).

- *Number of schools*
  Number of schools is another indicator for evaluation of education. District wise comparison of number of schools revealed the performance of different local governments in the provision of education.

- *Number of Basic Health Units (BHUs)*
  Number BHUs has been used as an indicator for evaluation of health. District wise comparison of the number BHUs reveals the performance of different local governments.

- *Number of dispensaries*
  Number dispensaries has been used as indicator for evaluation of health. District wise comparison of the number dispensaries reveal the performance of different local governments.

Theoretical Framework

This study pertains to the impetus for the establishment of local governments and relies on the framework known as Tiebout Hypothesis. This hypothesis draws analogy from the case of competing firms operating under the market mechanism. Each firm having profit as its motive, competes the other firms operating in the market for provision of goods / services and attraction of customers. In the similar fashion, communities are considered as firms. Each community government competes its contemporaries for serving the people in the best possible manner. This competition ensures the efficient provision of various public goods and services along with the welfare of the communities. In the context of the present study, the performance of local governments within Khyber Pakhtunkhwa is assessed in the provision of health and educational services. Only those districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa having a population of at least one million, were studied.

Results and Discussion

Data pertaining education and health in relation with the local governments was assessed for evaluating their performance. The results are reported as under:

Education

Education is an indispensable component of human development and a basic right of every citizen. Education is considered to have a strong correlation with social and economic development of a country. The educational performance of various local governments within Khyber Pakhtunkhwa during the period 2001 – 2015, is reported as under.

District Charsadda

Charsadda is one of the important districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The enrollment ratio at primary level within the said districts over the course of various local governments is given as under:

Table 01: District Charsadda's Enrollment Ratio at Primary Level

Period	2004-05	2006-07	2008-09	2010-11	2012-13	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	51	50	54	65	71	70

Source: PSLM 2004-15

Table 01 shows the enrollment ratio of district Charsadda for the age group of 4-9 years. The increase in enrollment ratio from 2004-09 is very meager i.e. from 51 to 54 percent while from 2009 to 2013 the enrollment ratio of students jumped from 54 to 71 percent. It shows during the later period 2009 to 2013, the district government performed very well.

Educational availability can also reveal the performance of state apparatus, which in this case is in the form of local governments. District Charsadda's figures:

Table 02: District Charsadda's Schools for Primary Level

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Schools	973	969	1002	585	987	985

Source: Khyber Pakhtunkwha Bureau of Statistics

Table 02 shows the number of schools of district Charsadda at primary level. The number of schools at primary level improved from 2009 to 2013 i.e. 973 to 987. It shows the District government of Charsadda performed well.

District Mansehra

The enrollment ratio for Mansehra district is given below:

Table 03: District Mansehra's Enrollment Ratio at Primary Level

Period	2004-05	2006-07	2008-09	2010-11	2012-13	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	60	64	70	65	73	75

Source: PSLM 2004-15

Table 03 shows the enrollment ratio of district Mansehra for the age group of 4-9 years. The increase of enrollment ratio from 2004-09 is very impressive i.e. from 60 to 70 percent while from 2009 to 2013 the enrollment ratio increased from 70 to 73 percent. It shows during the initial period 2004 to 2009, the district government performed well.

The educational availability in terms of number of schools for district Mansehra is given below:

Table 04: District Mansehra's Schools for Primary Level

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Schools	2185	2183	2016	1402	2029	1899

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 04 shows the number of schools of district Mansehra at primary level. The number of schools at primary level reduced from 2009 to 2013 i.e. 2185 to 2029. It shows the District government of Mansehra performance was not good.

District Mardan

The enrollment ratio for district Mardan is given below:

Table 05: District Mardan Enrollment Ratio at Primary Level

Period	2004-05	2006-07	2008-09	2010-11	2012-13	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	59	65	58	62	75	75

Source: PSLM 2004-15

Table 05 shows the enrollment ratio of district Mardan for the age group of 4-9 years. The decrease of enrollment ratio from 2004 to 2009 is very meager i.e. from 60 to 70 percent while from 2009 to 2013 the enrollment ratio of students has significantly increase from 58 to 75 percent. It shows during the later period 2009 to 2013, the district government performed well.

The extent of educational availability in Mardan is given as under:

Table 06: District Mardan's Schools for Primary Level

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Schools	1306	1328	1334	810	1410	1425

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 06 shows the number of schools of district Mardan at primary level. The number of schools at primary level increased from 2009 to 2013 i.e. 1306 to1410. It shows the District government of Mardan performed well.

District Peshawar

The enrollment ratio for district Peshawar over the course of various local governments is given as under:

Table 07: District Peshawar's Enrollment Ratio at Primary Level

Period	2004-05	2006-07	2008-09	2010-11	2012-13	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	54	54	59	37	72	68

Source: PSLM 2004-15

Table 07 shows the enrollment ratio of district Peshawar for the age group of 4-9 years. The increase of enrollment ratio from 2004 to 2009 is very meager i.e. from 54 to 59 percent while from 2009 to 2013 the enrollment ratio of students jumped

from 59 to 72 percent. It shows during the later period 2009 to 2013, the district government of Peshawar performed well.

The number of schools, which in turn, reveals the performance of the local governments in terms of educational availability in Peshawar is given as under.

Table 08: District Peshawar's Schools for Primary Level

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Schools	1022	1059	1061	652	988	1023

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 08 shows the number of schools of district Peshawar at primary level. The number of schools at primary level reduced from 2009 to 2013 i.e. 1022 to 988. It shows the District government performance was not good.

District Swabi

The extent of schools at district Swabi is as under:

Table 09: District Swabi's Enrollment Ratio at Primary Level

Period	2004-05	2006-07	2008-09	2010-11	2012-13	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	57	53	63	37	78	74

Source: PSLM 2004-15

Table 09 shows the enrollment ratio of district Swabi for the age group of 4-9 years. The increase of enrollment ratio from 2004 to 2009 is 6 percent i.e. from 57 to 63 percent while from 2009 to 2013 the enrollment ratio of students improved from 63 to 78 percent. It shows during the later period 2009 to 2013, the district government of Swabi performed well.

In the similar fashion, the number of schools at Swabi district are as under:

Table 10: District Swabi's Schools for Primary Level

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Schools	1022	1024	1040	613	1027	1038

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 10 shows the number of schools of district Swabi at primary level. The number of schools at primary level improved from 2009 to 2013 i.e. 1022 to1027. It shows the District government performed well.

District Swat

The enrollment ratio for district swat is reported as under.

Table 11: District Swat's Enrollment Ratio at Primary Level

Period	2004-05	2006-07	2008-09	2010-11	2012-13	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	47	53	39	55	61	70

Source: PSLM 2004-15

Table 11 shows the enrollment ratio of district Swat for the age group of 4-9 years. The decrease of enrollment ratio from 2004 to 2009 is 8 percent i.e. from 47 to 39 percent while from 2009 to 2013 the enrollment ratio of students jumped from 39 to 61 percent. It shows during the later period 2009 to 2013, the district government of Swat performed very well.

Similarly, the number of schools for the said district are given.

Table 12: District Swat's Schools at Primary Level

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Enrollment (%)	1213	1253	1276	858	1324	1337

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 12 shows the number of schools of district Swat at primary level. The number of schools at primary level improved from 2009 to 2013 i.e. 1213 to1324. It shows the District government performed well.

Health

Investment in health has a long term beneficial effect. It improves health outcomes, reduces poverty and contributes in promoting economic growth. The performance

of local governments in the provision of health services (in terms of number of BHU's and dispensaries) within Khyber Pakhtunkhwa is discussed below.

District Charsadda

Table 13: Number of Dispensaries in District Charsadda

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Dispensaries	8	8	8	8	7	7

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 13 shows number of dispensaries of district Charsadda. Number of dispensaries from 2009 to 2013 decreased i.e. 8 to 7 percent. It shows poor performance of the local government.

In relevance to BHU's, the following picture is presented.

Table 14: Number of BHUs in District Charsadda

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of BHU's	44	44	44	44	44	43

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 14 shows number of BHUs of district Charsadda. Number of BHUs from 2009 to 2013 remain same i.e. 44. It shows ineffective performance of the local government.

District Mansehra

Table 15: Number of Dispensaries in District Mansehra

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Dispensaries	59	59	59	59	60	60

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 15 shows number of dispensaries of district Mansehra. Number of dispensaries from 2009 to 2013 improved by one number i.e. 59 to 60. It shows effective performance of the local government.

Table 16: Number of BHUs in District Mansehra

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of BHU's	60	60	50	59	58	49

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 16 shows number of BHUs of district Mansehra. Number of BHUs from 2009 to 2013 reduced by two numbers i.e. 60 to 58. It shows poor performance of the local government.

District Mardan

Table 17: Number of Dispensaries in District Mardan

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Dispensaries	17	17	17	17	17	17

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 17 shows number of dispensaries of district Mardan. Number of dispensaries from 2009 to 2013 remained same i.e. 17. It shows ineffective performance of the local government.

Table 18: Number of BHUs in District Mardan

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of BHU's	49	49	49	49	49	49

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 18 shows number of BHUs of district Mardan. Number of BHUs from 2009 to 2013 remained same i.e. 49. It shows ineffective performance of the local government.

District Peshawar

Table 19: Number of Dispensaries in District Peshawar

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Dispensaries	53	53	53	53	52	52

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 19 shows number of dispensaries of district Peshawar. Number of dispensaries from 2009 to 2013 reduced by one number i.e. 53 to 52. It shows weakness in the performance of the local government.

Table 20: Number of BHUs in District Peshawar

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of BHU's	48	48	48	48	48	48

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 20 shows number of BHUs of district Peshawar. Number of BHUs from 2009 to 2013 remained same i.e. 48. It shows ineffective performance of the local government.

District Swabi

Table 21: Number of Dispensaries in District Swabi

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Dispensaries	10	10	13	13	9	9

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 21 shows number of dispensaries of district Swabi. Number of dispensaries from 2009 to 2013 reduced by one number i.e. 59 to 60. It shows bad performance of the local government.

Table 22: Number of BHUs in District Swabi

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of BHU's	40	40	40	40	40	40

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 22 shows number of BHUs of district Swabi. Number of BHUs from 2009 to 2013 remained same i.e. 40. It shows ineffective performance of the local government.

District Swat

Table 23: Number of Dispensaries in District Swat

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of Dispensaries	18	18	18	18	19	19

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 23 shows number of dispensaries of district Swat. Number of dispensaries from 2009 to 2013 improved by one number i.e. 18 to 19. It shows effective performance of the local government.

Table 24 Number of BHUs in District Swat

Period	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
No. of BHU's	41	41	41	41	42	41

Source: KP Bureau of Statistics

Table 24 shows number of BHUs of district Swat. Number of BHUs from 2009 to 2013 improved by one number i.e. 41 to 42. It shows effective performance of the local government.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The study examined the performance of local government system in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province of Pakistan with special emphases on the provision of health and educational services to the general public. By evaluating the

performance of six district government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in the sphere of education, it is concluded that the performance of district government Charsadda was good in terms of at primary level and also in regard to the number of primary schools. The performance of district governments Peshawar and Mardan were also good. Whereas the performance of district governments Swabi and Swat were the best among the selected districts as they shown remarkable improvement in the indicators of educational performance. However, the performance of district government Mansehra was poor in the enrollment ratio as well as number of schools. In relevance to health, the performance of district governments Swat and Mardan were good among the selected ones, while the performance of district government Charsadda was very poor in the similar aspect. The overall performance of district government Mansehra, Peshawar and Swabi was good. However, they shown a decline in terms of the indicators of health. The study confirms the validity of the Tiebout Hypothesis in terms of the local governments of KP in relevance to the provision of health and educational services. The District local government primarily revolves around the needs and aspirations of the common people. This system can perform better if properly implemented and monitored in light of the gross root level input. Further, the elections of the local government institutions must be regularly held so as to ensure consistency, which is vital for optimal performance and service delivery.

References

Faiz, A. (2018, April 16). *Opinion: The 18th Amendment, Federalism and Ethnic Politics in Pakistan*. Retrieved from UNDP: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/hiv_aids/development-advocate-pakistan--volume-2--issue-1/opinion--the-18th-amendment--federalism-and-ethnic-politics-in-p.html

Khaliq, M. (2012). *Local Government System in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa A Historical Analysis.* Peshawar: Support to Good Governance in Pakistan Programm.

Khan, S., & Khan, U. (2015). Local Government in Pakistan Tool for Legitimacy: A Case Study of Gen. Ayub Khan's BD System. *The Discourse*, 49-62.

Lugar, M. (2007). The Role of Local Government in Contemporary Economic Development. *Toward a 2015 Vision of Land - A Celebration of ICLPST's 100 Regular Sessions* (pp. 1-10). Taiwan: Lincoln Institute of Land Policy.

Mustafa, U. (2011). Fiscal Federalism in Pakistan: The 7th National Finance Commission Award and its Implications. *PIDE Working Papers* , pp. 1-5.

Tiebout, C. (1956, October). A Pure Theory of Local Expenditures. *The Journal of Political Economy, 64*(5), 416-424.

UIS. (2018, April 17). *Net enrolment rate*. Retrieved from UNESCO Institute for Statistics: http://uis.unesco.org/en/glossary-term/net-enrolment-rate

Young, C., & Kaczmarek, S. (2000). Local government, local economic development and quality of life in Poland. *GeoJournal, 50*(2-3), 225-234.