

Governance Issues Among Provincial and Federal Governments: A Causative Analysis of Pakistan and Way Forward Amid COVID-19

Sehrish Qayyum*

Umbreen Javaid †

Abstract

Anxiousness among the world governments is high in emerging after the lockdown due to the COVID-19 pandemic for stabilizing their economies. Countries like Pakistan feel this pressure much higher due to the prevailing informal economy, poverty, free media, and conspiracy theories. Dissolution of critical services powers under the 18th amendment of 'The Constitution of Pakistan 1973' underscored differences among provincial autonomy. In this situation, estimation of federal government's responsibility in crisis management, the role of NDMA, delayed creation of NCOG, and options for 'smart' lockdown was the dithering by the Federal govt which caused initial damage. Pakistan has a snacking history of 'basic democracies,' 'devolution of powers, and consolidated instructions for provincial administrative working from the Federal governments. This paper aims to study the impact of 'Mix-Messaging' in power exercise is studied under qualitative method with discourse analysis to find reasons behind governance challenges and way forward to deal with governance challenges during COVID-19 ranging from in-person to e-governance systems.

- DOI: 10.31703/gssr.2021(VI-I).22
- Vol. VI, No. I (Winter 2021)
- Pages: 233 – 239
- p- ISSN: 2520-0348
- e-ISSN: 2616-793X
- ISSN-L: 2520-0348

Key Words: 18th Amendment, COVID-19, Governance Capacity, NCOG, Mix-Messaging Crisis

Global Response to COVID-19 Pandemic

The spread of the Covid-19 pandemic was a preventable matter in case of active global preparedness. But unfortunately, loopholes were found in the chain of vigilance, response, and reaction. "Independent Panel for Pandemic Preparedness and Response, Covid-19: Make it the last pandemic" states that the international watch system was low paced while the situation got worse due to underpowered World Health Organization (WHO) and absence of political leadership (Wise, 2021). The report was prepared by a 13-member panel comprising of experts who worked for more than eight months on the areas, i.e., reasons of sprout and spread of pandemic, responses, and reactions around the globe. This report was valued when at World Health Assembly-2020 in May DG WHO authorized it.

According to the report, the COVID pandemic appeared to be a wake-up alarm as "the 21st century's Chernobyl moment." Although somehow the global system sustained through the COVID crisis, but repetition of such infectious pathogen spread would turn everything upside down. Many reports regarding health crises have been presented

at the platforms for UNO and WHO, but what was needed was in-time caution to be prepared for such pandemic. According to reports, the clinicians in Wuhan quickly spotted clusters of unusual pneumonia in December 2019, but WHO was slow in responding (Wise, 2021). Due to this passive movement, emergency declaration got delayed for a week, which has to follow the international health regulations. Unnecessary red-tapism has resulted in current chaos due to uncontrolled pandemic spread. Why were states plunged in chaos? The answer lies in the response of states driven by an approach of "wait and see" around the globe. While the declaration of a global health emergency much late than February of 2020 is considered a "Lost month" as no preventive measures and containment steps were taken to counter COVID-19 spread (Wise, 2021). Visible state-level countering efforts came under notice when hospitals began to exhaust due to patient overload. While the countries have weak health systems and those not taking the pandemic seriously faced potential impacts of the COVID-19 outbreak.

*Assistant Professor, Pakistan Navy War College, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

†Professor, Faculty of Behavioral & Social Sciences, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Looking into the efforts made by global powers including the USA, Canada, Germany, UK, France, i.e., calling lockdowns, quarantines, work from home, government emergency cash programs, etc., other developed countries, although not having that much political influence performed well during counter COVID-19 measures like, South Korea countered COVID-19 spread by implementing comprehensive "Anti-Pandemic Arsenal" which includes the prompt formation of disaster management team, rapid increase in the testing facility by public-private joint ventures, appropriate re-allocation of various capitals and thorough 'contact tracing' to avoid subclinical or symptomless community transmission (Oh, 2020). Public commitment for cooperation in response to transparent risk communication resulted in the development of new behavioural protocols. Why it's worth highlighting? Because this commitment was without imposing forced measures and least negative impact on the economy. One important learning from this global instance is that the central leadership of South Korea responded rapidly and responsibly by unique stability between science and democracy. Civic engagement helped to curb the imperfect information for collective dealing against any possibly uncertain prospect crisis (Oh, 2020). High compliance in South Korea towards the new normal is due to the centralization of government and public sense of responsibility, which is a true depiction of democracy. As the country has not employed a tactic of lockdowns as a prompt response to the pandemic outbreak. According to the South Korean government, it was a western populist approach by "victim-blaming" culture (Oh, 2020). They understood well that the first case had not been ostracized because it would not only impact citizen compliance but influential technocrats to counter the COVID-19 crisis. So, in simple words, innovation in social support by a centralized government and single command principle was the core behind a successful strategy to counter the pandemic.

Pressures on Pakistan amid COVID-19 Outbreak

The impact of the COVID crisis is measured based on disturbance range and instability from social to economic level. Covid-19 pandemic resulted in systemic shock impacting socio-economic to the socio-political arena of the state. Systemic shock may convert to septic shock if counter-crisis measures are time efficient and targeted. Pakistan is witnessing multiple intricate crises ranging from economic and climatic to the social and, above all, security crises due to terrorists' threats. Direct communication and interaction of mitigation

authorities with victims of crisis is base for the crisis management mechanism. Before developing a mitigation strategy against emerging non-traditional security threats, it is necessary to understand the nature of the crisis and the extent of its disastrous implications.

Secretary of U.N. general assembly labeled the covid-19 pandemic as a "threat to humanity" (Guterres, A., 2020). The covid-19 pandemic has affected 220 countries, with 173,550,455 reported cases extending its fatal implications to the whole population of the planet earth (WHO, 2021). The covid-19 pandemic crisis led to stringent measures such as nationwide lockdowns, transportation stagnation, and business shutdowns. In such cases, governments had to make decisions of uncertainty and vulnerability due to prospect implications of counter-covid measures. Research reveals that Pakistan's sensitive geographic position is prone to natural calamities due to sharp climate change, i.e., floods, temperature rise, glacier melting, water scarcity, elevated ocean levels, and seismic movements, etc. Pakistan's gauge has just reached a water shortage of about 1000 cubic meters per capita (Baloch, S., 2018). Annual natural calamities measured in Pakistan include dry spells, avalanches, landslides, floods, cyclones, and seismic shocks (Idress, I., 2021). Apart from the fact that the impact of natural hazards cannot be ignored but copulating these issues with the pandemic crisis has further worsened the situation owing to economic and social factors. Karachi being the economic hub of the state, needs concrete consideration as it is almost defenseless towards environmental changes, i.e., increasing saltiness and oceanic levels (Idress, I., 2021).

Another dimension among crises is poverty coupled with the pandemic crisis. A Series of communiqué published by the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE) estimate that poverty rates in Pakistan will increase from 23.4 to 59 %, with an addition of 75 million people to the poverty line due to trickle-down effects of the Covid-19 crisis (PIDE, 1, 2020). It would result in 125 million people living below the poverty line in the state, putting strain on the economic system (PIDE, 1, 2020). PIDE carefully states that imminent recession and negative GDP growth will worsen the situation to an extent where it becomes almost unmanageable. Due to complete lockdowns, 18.5 million people employed under the 'vulnerable employment sector' were affected at once. Even partial lockdowns are affecting 12 million of the population in the form of labor workforce, losing their jobs (PIDE, 4, 2020). IMF has given a target to receive loan/aid installment for the year 2021

demands tax revenue of Pr. 5.1 trillion, far more than expected in FY20 ([IMF, 2020](#)). These figures with the ongoing stumbling position of the economy seem unachievable. Facts highlight the incompetence of state policies that are resultless in meeting poverty control targets not only due to the Covid-19 crisis but previously followed fiscal policies.

According to a report by the U.N., the Economic stress of pandemic may further decelerate GDP growth by 3%, lagging the agricultural sector due to lockdowns and transportation limits with a dearth of access to inputs for planting season ([UNDP, 2020](#)). Most of the impact of the Covid-19 crisis would be on the population already striving with poverty and food security and already prevailing NTS threats, i.e., 42 million out-of-school children (Pakistan have second-largest figures after Nigeria) (Hunter. R., 2020), 17 million missing routine vaccination of children under the age of 5 years ([UNDP, 2020](#)), 40 million people already suffering from food insecurity now escalated with additional 2.45 million after pandemic crisis ([UNDP, 2020](#)). Here the governance capacity to mitigate the mounting crisis is questioned. The government's standing can be perceived with the convictions about its ability, goals, history, and mission that is installed in its audience network ([Carpenter. D.P., 2010](#)). It is an aggregate impression of the public authority's previous activities and accomplishments and its present capacity to convey significant outcomes to various demanding sectors ([Christensen. T. & Laegreid. P., 2015](#)).

As formerly highlighted, Pakistan is an agricultural country, while lockdowns are putting strain over targeted production limits of textile products for revenue generation. This situation will have negative implications on foreign reserves resulting in currency devaluation. In 2018 GDP growth of Pakistan was 5.8%, which now, due to inexperience government and the covid crisis, has declined to 0.98% and may decline further ([Khan. M.Z., 2020](#)). While a fiscal deficit of 9.2 % has reached 15% as a result of lopsided pandemic policies ([Haider. M., 2020](#)). Stagflation refers to an economy that is experiencing a simultaneous increase in inflation and stagnation of economic output. Gallup survey enlists that amid covid-19 and economic stabilization strife, it is forecasted that the unemployment rate would surge by 28% with an estimation of 6.65 million individuals unemployed in the financial year 2020-21 ([Gallup, 2020](#)).

Besides all such debate on fiscal deficit and debt-relief options, Pakistan's government policy is lagging in managing stagflation due to economic

strife. Stagflation can further worsen the situation if not controlled and countered timely by revising the economic policy. Yellow journalism supporting fabricated figures for economic stabilization in FY21 may create a threat of economic collapse as, on one side state is seeking an IMF debt plan ([Rana. S., 2020](#)), and on the other side, the finance commission is sharing solid figures of improvement and revenue generation amid COVID-19 crisis ([Finance Commission, 2020](#)).

18th Amendment and Provincial Autonomy

Pakistan's legal history has shown a sharp turn for reshaping provincial autonomy and removing all aspects from concurrent lists under the Eighteenth Amendment of the constitution. Concurrent list's administrative subjects have been handed over to the provinces by increasing autonomy in internal affairs ([Hassan, 2010](#)). This abrogation of the concurrent list has trickled down to an endless list of issues for integration among federating units. This effort has created more controversy regarding provincial autonomy. This controversy received answers with claims that increased provincial autonomy has subsided federal government without adding something valuable to the provincial autonomy ([Ezdi, 2010b](#)).

While another discussion further aggravated the justification of the eighteenth amendment (~part of concurrent list abrogation), that provinces demanded four subject's autonomies with federal government marking dissatisfaction from autonomist groups. Protest against autonomy provision was seen from "Sindh Nationalist and Progressive Alliance" and centrist political parties (Dawn, 2010, April 5).

Article 146 of the constitution of 1973 was fine enough to consider the transfer of operational responsibilities and resources to the provincial government ([Anwer, 2010](#)). Anyhow, this new 18th Amendment demands a more mature provincial government to avoid governance capacity lapse. The mature provincial government is pertinent as new autonomies will be responsible for encountering expenditures, i.e., social welfare, efficiency levels and facilities for poor population groups etc. Moreover, the appointment of governors and service chiefs vested to Prime Minister has increased concerns of favouritism in the political domain, compromising national interests ([Anwer, 2010](#)).

Presumed Response from Federal Government: Governance Issues Amid COVID-19 Shock

In view that how the 18th Amendment has created greater confusion among the federal government and provincial autonomies to deal with a health

emergency, a few important governance gaps are discussed. Mixed-messaging from federal to provincial government appeared to be a considerable governance gap during the COVID-19 outbreak. However, Sindh was too quick to call lockdowns to control the spread of pandemics when the federal government was muddling on the decision to call countrywide lockdowns ([Sen. A.K., 2020](#)). Punjab was in greater coherence with the federal government on this decision. While Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (K.P.) was the first to declare a health emergency in February 2020 in wake of the first death due to a pandemic in the province ([Sen. A.K., 2020](#)). Despite low resources, Balochistan government responded well, but the implementation of lockdown was so late that Shia pilgrims from Iran entered into Pakistan's territory without COVID-19 tests and quarantine precaution to control the spread ([Sen. A.K., 2020](#)).

The health sector's capacity to deal with emergencies was unveiled when hospitals and ICUs were filled, and increasing death toll was reported. Lack of basic functional health equipment, doctors, and paramedical staff was adding insult to injury in global health emergencies (Rabiya. J. 2020). Formally, the health sector has been so lethargic that no specialized training for health professionals was ever provided regarding the pandemic crisis. For years, no effort was made to make machinery functional, worth billions present in hospitals. Repair and maintenance of Health care equipment were lagging which was categorically revealed during COVID crisis ([Diaa. H. & Sattar. A., 2020](#)). Moreover, Media played a role to increase public stress by creating pandemic fear and a lot of conspiracies, i.e., increasing death rate, burying corps in far off places, not touching dead bodies of COVID victims, and religious semantics calling this as a curse of Almighty over people, etc. ([Welle. D., 2020](#)). News from every province should not have been telecasted in individual capacity to portray disorientation at the national level. Gallup survey mentioned that a good chunk of the population, some 55% believe that covid surge is just exaggeration and it has nothing to do with reality, which resulted in the second wave of COVID-19 in the country ([Welle. D., 2020](#)).

Another major issue of unemployment with a direct impact on daily wage earners was observed. Gallup states that covid-19 and economic stabilization strife would result in increasing unemployment by 28%, leaving 6.65 million people unemployed in F.Y. 20-21 ([Gallup, 2020](#)). The high unemployment rate was observed due to the sudden and uncontrolled spread of COVID-19, and the government call for urgent lockdown to curb the

spread. Governance gaps raise question of governance legitimacy and capacity which was directly impacted after the 18th amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan ([Zaman. A. et al. 2018](#)). This amendment revised legitimate capacities between federal and provincial governments to deal with the internal affairs of provinces. The situation resulted in the rising of new "Power Devolution" challenges during the COVID-19 crisis.

Causes of Delayed Response to COVID Crisis

As discussed earlier, the federal government and provincial autonomies appeared to be in a state of confusion due to the 18th Amendment. The powers of handling internal affairs, emergency expenditures, and increasing capacity to combat natural disasters were vested into provincial governments. Besides, provincial governments were looking at the federal government to announce the lockdowns to counter the COVID-19 spread. But initially, lockdowns were unappreciated by the federal government due to business halting and the probability of not spreading pandemic to the extent it spread ([Soomro, 2020](#)). Later, the absence of a centralized approach was delayed that could help federal and provincial governments to converge issues and develop a counter mechanism. The state's incumbent risk communication strategy appears to be weak as political elites did not pay heed to the warning of medical experts of the country ([Reuters, 2020](#)). According to health expert Dr. Qaisser Sajjad, Secretary-General of Pakistan Medical Association, Pakistani politicians have politicized a pure health issue. Both the Government and opposition parties were calling for rallies. While masses were without wearing masks and violating pandemic SOPs, which resulted in a sudden surge of pandemics around the country and an increased death toll ([Latif, 2020](#)). Moreover, Epidemiologists were not converged to study the causes and consequences of the pandemic spread and possibilities to cure. This resulted in a missing pool of pandemic experts resulting in nearly collapse and exhaustion of hospitals. Front line medical staff seems quite less than the requirement. Rather than political schism and polarization, COVID shock demands for the scientific community, which would have done a data-based assessment to counter covid and to mention areas of weakness.

The biggest lapse was the lack of centralized and uniform strategy at once, i.e., spread tracing, testing, and quarantining of COVID victims. Even the Chief Justice of Pakistan stated that the army of ministers and advisors could not do anything visible to counter the COVID-19 spread ([Soomro, 2020](#)). Lack of leadership and democratic norms appeared

to be a serious issue surging the governance incompetence.

State Response to COVID Crisis

Among all the counter-COVID initiatives, the most important was the creation of the information and operation center "NCOC-National Command and Operation center" to collect updated information across Pakistan on April 25, 2020. Its one-window procedure helped to collate analyses and processes according to the ongoing crisis to provide relief to masses at the earliest (NCOC, 2020). The creation of tertiary care hospitals, isolation wards, quarantine facilities, and increasing laboratory testing capacity were major efforts under NCOC.

Despite mismatching and lack of coordination among federal and provincial governments, the Federal Government took stringent actions when the first COVID case was reported on February 26, 2020, including suspension of unnecessary international traveling, postponement of the Pakistan Super League cricket matches, and celebrations of the Pakistan Day (Farooq, S. et al. 2020, a.) Besides, a public crisis was declared with lockdowns, isolation, suspension of public transportation, closure of educational institutions, offices, OPD's in hospitals, and the religious gatherings. The government tried to limit the negative impacts of the lockdown with an "Emergency Cash Program" to meet the essential demands of around 12 million individuals who were liable to endure the most (Farooq, S. et al. 2020, a.). Other countering measures include the initiation of the volunteer Taskforce named "Tiger Force" for the enforcement of government-led counter-COVID measures (Krishankutty, P., 2020). This initiative was based on the notion that more than 45% of the population resides in slums, and more than 29% lives below the poverty index (Farooq, S. et al. 2020, b.). During the global health emergency, the local population including the daily wagers was more prone to food insecurity due to lockdown rather than the devastation caused by the pandemic.

Recommendations

Research proposes recommendations to halt the spread of pandemics and to deal with governance issues amid COVID-19. At first, NCOC should be made permanent as NCOC appears to be a miracle, although delayed, to counter pandemic surge. It needs to integrate disaster management departments. Natural disasters should be separated

from health and social emergencies. Permanency of NCOC would help for preparedness to counter prospective pandemics. Though the threat has not been ended, yet provision of vaccines is now a major task for NCOC and the federal government. In this perspective, Pakistan may get benefit from the 'Covax' initiative of WHO to distribute vaccines worldwide. 'Vaccine Passports' and 'Vaccine-ID's' should be made inevitable not only for international but with in-state movement too. The people who are not registered, such as Afghan refugees along with other people without identity cards, must be made liable to produce vaccine confirmation certificates before entering working areas. It will help to find out unregistered people particularly Afghan refugees within the country.

Pakistan should impart efforts to be part of the 'Global health threats council' to submit its reservations and issues responsible for pandemic spread within the region. It would help to increase sense of responsibility among citizens and enhance the validity of uniform risk management strategy. Medical experts should be converged to develop a 'Disease Surveillance System' to publish reports over diseases within the state along with the extent of spread and severity to establish ready combat system in case of a similar emergency. "National Emergency Preparedness Plan" (NEPP), as per WHO guidelines, should be prepared to highlight national efforts to combat future health threats impacting socio-economic realms.

Precisely recommending, the government should establish an 'online workforce information centre' (OFFICE) to investigate increased unemployment due to lockdowns and an unstable economy. OWFICES will help to gather targeted information about the available workforce and skilled persons to be employed at the required place. Moreover, it would help to estimate unemployment among skilled and educated people. Small industries and enterprises should be promoted to increase employment opportunities rather than planning time-taking strategies for emergency employment kiosks. Moreover, internet provision in far furlong areas is necessary owing to the fact that during lockdowns, routine businesses were shifted to online systems (~E-Systems). During lockdowns, students faced the biggest issues in learning due to the absence of internet. With the situation getting better, some concrete strategy needs to be developed for in-person learning as online-education systems are creating learning poverty among primary and middle-class students.

References

- Anwer, K. (2010). *One System, Not Four*. Dawn. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1003777/one-system-not-four>
- Baloch, S. (2018). *Water crisis: why is Pakistan running dry?* Delle Watch. <https://www.dw.com/en/water-crisis-why-is-pakistan-running-dry/a-44110280>
- Carpenter, D. P. (2010). *Reputation and Power: Organizational Image and Pharmaceutical Regulation in the FDA*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Christensen, T., & Lægred, P. (2015). Reputation Management in Times of Crisis. Pp. 95–117. *Organizational Reputation in the Public Sector*. London: Routledge.
- Diaa, H. & Sattar, A. (2020). *Pandemic panic in Pakistan: 'people are just literally fighting for beds*. National Public Radio. <https://www.npr.org/sections/goatsandsoda/2020/06/19/878896370/pandemic-panic-in-pakistan-people-are-just-literally-fighting-for-beds>.
- Ezdi, A. (2010a, February 18). *Reforming' the constitution, Part II*. The News.
- Ezdi, A. (2010b, March 15). *A Flawed Constitutional Package*. The News.
- Farooq, S., Haider, S. I., Sachwani, S., & Parpio, Y. N. (2020b, June). Insight into COVID-19 Responses and Initiatives from Pakistan. *Journal of the College of Physicians and Surgeons Pakistan*, 30(1), 50–52. <https://doi.org/10.29271/jcpsp.2020.suppl1.s50>.
- Farooq, S. et.al. (2020a). Insight into COVID-19 responses and initiatives from Pakistan. *Journal of the College of Physicians and Surgeons Pakistan*, 30(1), S50–S52. <https://doi.org/10.29271/jcpsp.2020.Supp1.S50>
- Finance Commission, (2020). *Summary of the Economy*. http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey/chapter_20/Executive_Summary.pdf
- Gallup. (2020). *Unemployment Situation in Pakistan*. <https://gallup.com.pk/post/30603>
- Guterres, A. (2020). *This is the moment of Set-Up for the vulnerable*. <https://www.un.org/en/un-coronavirus-communications-team/moment-step-vulnerable>
- Haider, M. (2020). *Major relief from IMF: Coronavirus expenses not to be part of budget deficit*. The News International.
- Hassan, A. (2010, April 1). *Parties Strike Accord on 18th Amendment*. Dawn.
- Idress, I. (2021). *Areas and population groups in Pakistan most exposed to combined effects of climate change, food insecurity and COVID-19*: K4D, GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
- IMF, (2020). Country Report: Pakistan. Pp 14-15. <https://www.imf.org/en/Countries/PAK>
- Khan, M. Z. (2020). *Revised revenue target achievable only if activity resumes: FBR*. Dawn. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1551219/revised-revenue-target-achievable-only-if-activity-resumes-fbr>.
- Krishankutty, P. (2020, April 2). Pakistan's Corona Relief Tiger Force gets 90,000 volunteers in two days' *The Print*. <https://theprint.in/world/pakistan-launches-corona-relief-tiger-force-gets-90000-volunteers-in-two-days/393388/>
- Latif, A. (2020, December 17). *Pakistan: "Politicization" of COVID-19 leads to confusion*. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/pakistan-politicization-of-covid-19-leads-to-confusion/2080214>
- NCOC. (2020). *National Command Operation Center*. <https://ncoc.gov.pk/sitrep.php>
- Oh, J. (2020, 12 18). It should be democracy that fills the gaps in the science. *Med-Global*, pp. 3-8.
- PIDE COVID-19 BULLETIN No. 1 (2020). COVID-19 in Pakistan: Caring for the Poor and Vulnerable. Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, https://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/PIDE-_-COVID-Bulletin.pdf.
- PIDE COVID-19 BULLETIN No. 13, (2020). Labour Market and COVID-19: Provincial-Level Analysis of Vulnerable Employment Across Sectors. Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, https://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/PIDE-_-COVID-Bulletin-13.pdf.
- PIDE COVID-19 BULLETIN No. 4, (2020). Sectoral Analysis of the Vulnerably Employed: COVID-19 and the Pakistan's Labour Market. Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, https://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/PIDE-_-COVID-Bulletin-4.pdf.
- Rana, S. (2020). *Pakistan seeks rollover of half of \$28b debt*. Express Tribune, 14 April 2020, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2197495/2-pakistan-seeks-rollover-half-28b-debt/>

- Reuters. (2020, April 22). *Doctor's appeal for a strict implementation of the lockdown*. <https://www.physiciansweekly.com/pakistani-doctors-urge-government/doctors-appeal-for-a-strict-implementation-of-the-lockdown-to/>
- Sen, A. K. (2020). *Pakistan's Battle with Coronavirus reveals governance challenges*. United States Institute of Peace.
- Soomro, A. (2020, April 10). *Pakistan Delays Decision on Lockdowns*. <https://www.news18.com/news/world/pakistan-delays-decision-on-lockdown-until-tuesday-as-coronavirus-cases-rise-to-5478-2576401.html>
- UNDP, (2020). *In Pakistan, Pandemic can push millions more into Poverty*. <https://www.undp.org/press-releases/pakistan-pandemic-could-push-millions-more-poverty>
- UNDP. (2020). *PVE and Strengthening Social Cohesion* / UNDP. <https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/news-centre/speeches/2020/pve-and-strengthening-social-cohesion.html>
- Welle, D. (2020). *How denial and conspiracy theories fuel coronavirus crisis in Pakistan*. <https://www.dw.com/en/how-denial-and-conspiracy-theories-fuel-coronavirus-crisis-in-pakistan/a-53913842>
- Wise, J. (2021). *Independent Panel for Pandemic Preparedness and Response. Covid-19: make it the last pandemic*. BMJ.
- Zaman. A. et.al. (2018). *18th Amendment & Provincial Autonomy: Challenges for Political Parties*.