

- 
- **Global Social Sciences Review (GSSR)**      ▪ **Vol. VII, No. II (Spring 2022)**      ▪ **Pages:** 502-512
- 
- **DOI:** 10.31703/gssr.2022(VII-II).48      ▪ **URL:** [http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2022\(VII-II\).48](http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2022(VII-II).48)
- 
- **L- ISSN:** 2520-0348      ▪ **p- ISSN:** 2520-0348      ▪ **e-ISSN:** 2616-793X
- 
- **Citation:** Naz, F. L., Wahab, A., & Raheem, A. (2022). Challenges & Suggestions of Online Teaching: Opinions of Public and Private Universities in Pakistan. *Global Social Sciences Review*, VII(II), 502-512. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2022\(VII-II\).48](https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2022(VII-II).48)
- 



Cite Us



## Challenges & Suggestions of Online Teaching: Opinions of Public and Private Universities in Pakistan

Farah Latif Naz <sup>\*</sup>

Abdul Wahab <sup>†</sup>

Abdul Raheem <sup>‡</sup>

### Contents:

- [Introduction](#)
- [Challenges of Online Teaching](#)
- [Significance of the Study](#)
- [Objectives of the Study](#)
- [Research Question](#)
- [Literature Review](#)
- [Problems of Online Teaching](#)
- [Methodology](#)
- [Results and Data Analysis](#)
- [Discussion and Conclusion](#)
- [Recommendation](#)
- [References](#)

**Abstract:** *Online learning has transformed higher education. Many empirical studies have been done on the challenges with online courses, but few have presented an overview. We reviewed the literature using Cooper's framework. Concerns were found to be common in three large groups: online students, teachers, and people who make materials. Online education had problems because students had different ideas about what was expected of them, their level of preparedness, and their level of engagement. Teachers had to deal with problems like getting used to their new roles in the classroom and having trouble with time management and how to teach. Considerations for content development, the role of instructors in content creation, the use of multimedia in content, the importance of instructional methods, and more came up during this research. Higher education institutions can help both teachers and students get past these problems by giving them opportunities.*

**Key Words:** Online Teaching, Public and Private Universities, Pakistan, Education, Students, Teachers, Online Education

### Introduction

Ratnasari (2012) says that online teaching is a way to teach that uses the Internet, computer networks, and each student's computer to help with instruction and education. And e-education is a way of education where students can access course materials through the Internet, an intranet, or some

other form of electronic media. Classroom instruction is one area that has been changed by the faster pace of technological progress. Online education is a new way to learn. Instead, teachers and students can study together from anywhere and at any time, removing a barrier to education that used to be impossible to get around. An online

---

<sup>\*</sup> Lecturer, Department of Education, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.

Email: [Farahlatif@bzu.edu.pk](mailto:Farahlatif@bzu.edu.pk) (*Corresponding Author*)

<sup>†</sup> Lecturer, Institute of Education and Research, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan.

<sup>‡</sup> Department of Disaster Management and Development Studies, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan.

classroom is different from a regular classroom because there is no one-on-one interaction. So, it is very important for teachers to explain their courses well so that students can reach their goals. But technical problems and barriers affect teachers and students in developing countries more than they do in other places (Eltahir, 2019). Literature has pointed out a number of problems with using technology in education. For example, in Saudi Arabia, some of the biggest problems are poor communication between students and teachers, ineffective help, a lack of infrastructure, and a lack of ICT expertise (Aljaber, 2018). Low levels of digital self-efficacy and limited access to the internet are also the main reasons why ICT isn't widely used in Pakistani universities (Albirini, A. 2006b). Another study found that there are three main things that make it hard for ICT to be used effectively in higher education: the learner, the teacher, and the development of content (Kebritchi et al., 2017).

### **Challenges of Online Teaching**

---

In a traditional classroom, students would sit in rows of desks and take notes while paying close attention to the professor. As students became more involved in education through conversations and presentations, the teacher's role changed to that of a guide. The quick change from traditional classroom education to online education caught many teachers and students off guard. Teachers often don't know enough about computers and technology to run online courses well. Only a small number of professors had official training in how to use computers and information, let alone how to use online tools to teach (Nancy P. Hunt & Roy M. Bohlin. 1995). People's lack of knowledge and technical skills could make it hard for them to learn online. Not only does online education have to deal with technical problems, but it also needs to find ways to teach that work for a wide range of students (Sithole, Mupinga, Kibirige, Manyanga & Bucklein, 2019). Teachers who use online platforms need a variety of ways to keep their students interested and up-to-date. Teachers with and without a lot of experience need to learn how to make, teach, run, and evaluate online courses well as part of their

professional development. When there aren't many ways to connect to the internet, as there are in many poor countries, the problem gets worse. According to research done at a university in Botswana, students and teachers have a lot of trouble using online resources for teaching and schoolwork because they only work sometimes (Kangro, A., & Kangro, I. 2004). According to the research, online education requires a lot more time than traditional classroom instruction (Assareh & Bidokht, 2010; Kozma, R. B. 2005).

### **Benefits**

---

Online courses have been effective for pupils who do best when left alone (Mumtaz, S. 2000). One student who utilized online education was quoted in a Kirtman study as saying, "It's more self-guided, so I can spend more time on the topics I need help with and less time on concepts I can grasp fast" (Kirtman, 2009, p. 110). Independent students frequently employ a number of cognitive and metacognitive strategies to achieve their academic objectives (Mumtaz, S. 2000., p. 126). Self-regulated students are more likely to apply time management skills, study course materials regularly, ask for and receive assistance from teachers and peers, fulfill deadlines, and engage in metacognitive reflection on their learning (Mumtaz, S. 2000). Students can accommodate their studies to their own schedules, which is one of the advantages of online education. This is certainly an attractive feature of online education. Students can utilize the many advantages of online learning by doing their homework whenever and wherever it is most convenient. Both teachers and students reported that the new approach, which eliminated the need to worry about matters such as traffic and parking, allowed them to think more clearly and was less distracting (McCarney, J. 2004). One high school instructor remarked, "Since time is not a constraint, we can... Since our online meetings may go as long as necessary, I no longer feel as like I'm missing out by not attending class in person" (McCarney, J. 2004, p. 36). Some public high school systems, such as Michigan's, require students to complete at least one online course in order to graduate (Rajagopalan, I. 2019). As the number of high school students

enrolling in online courses rises, an increasing number of colleges and universities allow both high school and college students to receive credit for the same online course. Depending on the course, either a college professor or a high school instructor can instruct high school pupils (Rajagopalan, I. (2019). The qualitative research conducted by Dana Thomson during the 2008–2009 school year revealed that students enjoy and value having more options and freedoms in online courses. One person stated, "I can take classes that my school does not provide, and I can work when I have spare time or less assignments in school" (McCarney, J. (2004). Recent efforts have been made to provide high school students with courses that, if passed, can count toward both high school and college graduation requirements. By leveraging federal funding "to support programs that provide secondary students the opportunity to take university courses in disciplines like math, science, and foreign languages while still enrolled in secondary institutions," many schools are making it simpler for high school students to attend college (Rajagopalan, I. (2019), p. 4). As job rivalry increases, it is crucial that students have access to a variety of educational opportunities, such as courses in a variety of degree programs given by a variety of colleges and institutions. Although students desire more options, university budgets continue to shrink. A cost-benefit study demonstrates that utilizing a hybrid approach in large introductory groups could significantly reduce teacher compensation expenditures over time (Chijioko J. Evoh (2014, p. 1). "Interactive education online," a new trend in online education, makes it possible to learn in the comfort of your own home as if you were in a classroom (ILO). "ILO" refers to "highly sophisticated" and "interactive" online courses "where machine-guided education can replace some (but typically not all) of the traditional face-to-face instruction" (Bowen, et al., 2014, p. 97). ILO collects data on a huge number of students and uses that data to provide each student with personalized counsel and recommendations. Teachers can use ILO to track their students' development, enabling them to provide "more targeted and effective coaching" (Bowen et al.,

2014, p. 97) to assist their students to apply what they've learned more effectively. Machine-led classes may not be able to replace in-person instruction, but they could be useful for providing immediate feedback and tracking each student's progress. Students in "small, rural, or impoverished socioeconomic school districts" (Chaney, 2001, p. 21) may have additional opportunities to learn because of online courses. People are concerned that the United States is losing its competitive edge in the worldwide market for high school graduate-producing nations. If there were more affordable solutions, a portion of that concern could be alleviated (Bowen, et al., 2014). Distance education has the potential to bring about the long-awaited revolution in education by removing the financial and geographical constraints that have prevented certain students from receiving a quality education until now.

### Significance of the Study

---

The idea behind this study was to find out what problems teachers face when teaching online. It was founded with the hope that its results will help both policymakers and teachers. Researchers hope that teachers will use the results of this study to their advantage, that it will help them deal with problems they've run into while teaching online, and that it will help them get used to new technologies and think of creative ways to use them to help students learn both online and offline.

### Objectives of the Study

---

1. Identify problems with online education in Pakistan.
2. Examine solutions to Pakistan's online education difficulties.

### Research Question

---

1. What are Pakistan's online education implementation challenges?
2. What are the solutions to the challenges facing the implementation of online education in Pakistan?

## **Literature Review**

---

When we say "online education," we really mean doing educational activities on phones, laptops, computers, and other devices that students have access to. Singh and Thurman (2019) say that using the internet for virtual education makes education easier by making it more flexible, creative, and student-centered. Not only is it cheaper for students in rural and remote areas, but it can also help make education fairer by making it available to anyone with an internet connection. So, now that WHO has said that it is a key tool for meeting educational needs around the world, it is easier to provide education, especially in poor countries (Ihmeideh, F. M. 2009). After being closed for a short time, schools reopened and started using new ways to deal with the situation in the area, such as using online education platforms like Microsoft Teams, Zoom, and Google Classroom. As everyone tried to get used to the new situation, education at home became the norm for the whole region. This gave students more confidence in themselves and their skills, and it also kept universities in touch with their students (Agnoletto & Queiroz, 2020). Kurdistan's education system had to change and adapt to new ways of teaching so that it could use the resources it had to make online education possible since many people in the country stayed at home to work in other fields. This was the best way to meet the government's social distance standards without having to try to change universities. This way of doing things has both pros and cons for everyone in the education system. On the one hand, this method can give students a more personal, meaningful educational experience that helps them stay connected to their homes and communities while still letting them use the technology available to them. Lim said that changes were needed for the students, the teachers, and the administration (Lim, C. P., & Chai, C. S. 2008). This is because the situation is so unpredictable that almost all universities and other higher education institutions have had to change their policies to include virtual education pedagogy.

## **Definition of Online Teaching**

---

A common definition of online education is "remote learning" via the World Wide Web.

Ratnasari (2012) says that online teaching is a way to teach that uses the Internet, computer networks, and each student's computer to help with instruction and education. eEducation is education that takes place through electronic media like the Internet, an intranet, or another type of computer network. Online education can be broken down into two main types: Asynchronous Methods As the name suggests, synchronous training happens at the same time. The training is called "synchronous" when both the teacher and the student are educated at the same time. This makes it easier for teachers and their students to talk back and forth, whether they are connected online or not. Training Most of the time, international seminars and conferences are where synchronous e-education is used. b) "Not at the same time" training, or "asynchronous" training. Now, it's possible to get training at a time that works for the person getting it, not for the person giving it. Because of the many benefits it offers to students, this type of online education is becoming more and more popular. Harris, S. (2002) says that online teaching is a way of teaching that uses web-based media to help teach and learn without the direct participation of teachers and students. When education happens through the Internet and related technologies, teachers and students can keep in touch and work together even though they are in different places. Also, Long, S. (2001) says that online education is often called "e-education," which is a combination of the words "electronic" and "education." E-education is the process of teaching people new information and skills using electronic devices like computers and cell phones. E-education is any educational activity that uses electronic devices like computers or cell phones to teach people new information and skills. Loveless, A. (2003) says that terms like software education, multimedia education, computer-based education, online education, and distant education are all related to e-education (2014:2). From Ahmad's research, here is an example: (2020:24) The term "online teaching" refers to any kind of instruction that takes place over a network connection, like the internet. For online education to work, you need to know about the content, distribution channels, and infrastructure

technologies that are needed. Online instruction also requires that both students and teachers have access to the internet and that there are systems in place to keep everything in order. b) How easy it is for students to use its services, like print, download, etc. c) Being able to get help from tutors if you have trouble education d) The main function of the web is to help teachers and students work together in a positive way. e) Having a way to learn that people with different levels of education can use. Evaluation of a set of teaching methods (f) The way this is done (g) What the hosts have to say. Because so many people choose to take classes online, it's important for teachers to give their students interesting things to study. Less desire to learn because of unchecked teaching in the classroom and bad parenting. When making educational content, teachers are told to use well-supported materials and infrastructure. Teachers who want to use the online education method must have a reliable way to connect to the internet. Teachers in online classes must be available at all times in case a student has questions about the course material or needs help with any part of online education. Online classes make it hard for teachers to tell if their students have learned anything because they don't get much feedback on what they're being taught. Teachers expect students to ask questions and give answers as they go through the lessons, but students in online classes often just accept the information they are given without questioning it. Huang (2020:9) (2020:9) In online education, students can get a wide range of education materials right away (e.g., video, audio, document, etc.). They can also choose to have a teacher organize, guide, and grade their own education. Since a one-way exchange of information between a teacher and a student in an online classroom doesn't lead to education, it's important that teachers and students always talk back and forth with each other, whether they're online or not. Because teachers and students don't talk back and forth, online teaching is less effective. This includes problems that teachers solve during online teaching, which wasn't what was planned when it was put in place.

## Problems of Online Teaching

Due to the pandemic, everyone, including professors and students, has to work and study from home right now. But because of the pandemic, students are less interested in education, and many of them now see online education as an extra burden. This leads to a number of things that cause problems in online education. Kling, R. (2000) says (Teachers don't understand the problem at hand, which makes it hard for students to think critically about it. Because of the wrong way of teaching students to understand problems, they are bored and find it hard to do their work. Not being able to understand things in online teaching is a sign of a bigger problem, which is that students aren't willing to take an active role in their own education. Even though online teaching means that students and teachers can't be in the same place at the same time, students will still need teachers with good problem-solving skills because they will always have problems with their online coursework and materials. Teachers should be able to explain ideas clearly so that their students don't get bored. They should also be able to help their students learn how to solve problems. When online classes are only done online, students lose interest in education and don't understand the challenges that come with it. According to Cholin, V. S. (2005b), the following are some problems that online teachers have to deal with: Schools usually give their students and teachers access to the Internet (via a "data package") and encourage them to use online education programs. b. Problems with getting to the Internet, both for teachers and students, and a general lack of knowledge about online education. Unfortunately, this means that many students and teachers cannot use online teaching because they do not have access to the internet. This is because there are problems with the internet access network in many places. Teachers and students must understand how online teaching works before they can be trained to use it. When some teachers and students don't understand how online teaching works, it causes a lot of problems in online teaching. Milya Sari says (2014:128) that online education has both pros and cons. 20 Web-based instruction works best when students are able and motivated to learn; b. many

students have trouble getting access to web-based instruction; c. students quickly lose interest and motivation if they can't get to information because they don't have enough hardware and bandwidth. Students need a guide to help them sort through the huge amount of information on the Internet and find what they need. When the Internet is used as a teaching tool, bad connections can stop lessons. e. f. One of the worst things about online education is that there isn't much interaction between teachers and students or between students. That is, a student's success in education depends on his or her ability and motivation. So, the more motivated a student is to learn, and the better the student is at education, the more successful the education will be. This is one of the problems with online teaching. Online instruction must deliver all subject material through the internet, which makes it hard for students who don't have the right technology to take part. Some students and teachers find today's online education boring because the network goes down so often and they can't get to the material. Some students and teachers lose interest in teaching and education quickly because they don't have the right tools. Since there is so much information online, students really need some kind of direction to help them find the right information. Another problem with online education is that communication infrastructure often gets in the way of education. The lack of interaction between students and teachers is a problem because it makes it hard for the teacher to teach and for the students to ask questions and learn from them. According to the above theories, online education has many problems, such as teachers and students who don't know how to teach online, teachers who don't know how to teach online in a way that helps students understand the material, students who get bored with online education, and students who don't understand the subjects being taught. As a result, many schools don't have enough bandwidth to teach online, and many students and teachers don't have enough data plans to teach online. The Good Things About E-Education for Teachers Based on their research, Baylor and Ritchie (2002) came to the conclusion that the use of instructional technologies could help the teacher explain new

ideas in the classroom in a more complete way, which in turn would help the students understand those ideas more completely. Because of this, kids learned more, teachers got better at using technology in the classroom, and the classroom as a whole became more efficient. He then talked about how modern ways of teaching are different from older ways, pointing out how important it is to teach information and skills. Teachers can also improve how they teach by using e-education tools like movies, interactive software, and computers. It can help with the lack of resources and teachers, especially in the science field, which is very important because of how important it is to improve the quality of education. Alkhatabi et al. (2012) say that the main job of a teacher is to create a large number of skilled workers. E-education, which uses modern information technology well, is now often seen as the best way to learn something new. Teachers and students both benefit from improvements in multimedia and e-education technology that make it easier to use a wide range of tools and services.

### **Teachers' Outcomes**

---

Hess, F. M., & Leal, D. L. (2001) say that teachers who use E-education take a more constructivist approach to teaching, give students more freedom in the classroom, and lecture less. E-education makes it easier to use effective education methods and transfer what you've learned to new situations. This is because most of the time, students who use computers for school are doing very stimulating and focused education activities. They worked harder and longer at their jobs and took on more ambitious projects. Teachers who use E-education are more likely to get their students involved in active education, problem-solving activities during project-based education (which requires more logical thinking), peer-to-peer discussions about their work, and regular information-gathering, information-synthesizing, and information-sharing activities. Guthrie and Wigfield (2000) say that collaborative projects get students more interested in school (2000). In general, students do better in school when they are motivated to do their best. He goes on to say that the age of science and



technology is here to stay and is quickly spreading to all parts of education around the world. To improve student outcomes, the availability of technology must be combined with a larger push for change. Adding technology to the education system is a complicated process that involves making changes to policy, building new infrastructure, changing the curriculum, and training and preparing administrators, students, and teachers.

## Methodology

This investigation takes place in the field and uses a qualitative method. In this study, the researcher

wanted to find patterns in the literature about "Challenges & Suggestions of Online Teaching." Qualitative research is a way to find out how different people and groups see a certain social or human problem and how important they think it is to them. The goal of this study was to look at the pros and cons of online education to see if there are any specific methods that can help teachers in this field. The information for this study came from questionnaires given to teachers. For this study, teachers were given a questionnaire to fill out and send back. The instructors were given a confidential survey that asked them about the course's structure, the pros and cons of working online, and the best ways they've found to deal with problems.

## Results and Data Analysis

**Table 1.** Distribution of Respondents by Gender

Type of Respondents	Frequency (f)		Percentage (%)	
	Male	Female	Male	Female
Govt	75	75	50%	50%
Private	75	75	50%	50%
Total	150	150	100%	100%

The above table reveals respondents' gender. The table reveals that male and female teachers each make up 50% of the sample.

**Table 2.** Academic Qualification of Teachers

Sr. No	Academic Qualification	Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)
1	PhD	200	90
2	M. Phil	100	10
Total	-	300	100%

The above table shows that 10% of teachers have an M.Phil. degree, and 90 % have PhD degree.

**Table 3.** Availability of Desktops

Category	Yes		No		$\chi^2$	P (2-tailed)
	f	%	f	%		
Public	76	90	8	10	1.405	.236
Private	64	80	3	20		

$p > .05$  &  $df = 1$

If we generalize from the data above, we find that 90% of public schools and 80% of private schools

provide desktop computers to their instructors in their computer laboratories, while 10% of public

schools and 20% of private schools do not. Since there is no statistically significant difference between the two groups, the Chi-squared test result stands.  $2(1, N=151) = 1.405, p > .05$ . According to the

statistics, classrooms in both public and private schools have access to a comparable number of desktop computers for instructional use.

**Table 4.** Availability of Internet

Category	Yes		No		$\chi^2$	p (2-tailed)
	f	%	f	%		
Public	83	99	1	1	1.512	.211
Private	64	96	3	4		

$p > .05$  &  $df = 1$

According to the data above, only 1% of public institutes and 4% of private institutes do not have Internet connection. A chi-square (2) test reveals no statistically significant difference between the two

groups:  $2(1, N=151) = 1.512, p > .05$ . Statistics suggest that there was no difference in Internet connectivity between public and private schools.

**Table 5.** Differences of opinions are based on the type of university (public or private).

Variable	Public		Private		T	Sig
	N	Mean	N	Mean		
Organizational support in facilitating online education	586	1.95	118	2.22	3.2	0.00
Instructors' role in facilitating online education	586	2.35	118	2.58	2.6	0.00
Positively influential factors in online education	586	2.73	118	2.90	2.11	0.03
Negatively influential factors in online education	586	3.30	118	3.33	0.71	0.75
Students' preference for online classes in the future	587	1.81	118	1.91	0.88	0.37

There were three indicators that demonstrated the substantial variation in viewpoints depending on institutional affiliation: (Table4). Various students had different perspectives about "University input/level of support," "positively impacting elements," and "instructors' role in providing online education" in the context of remote learning. However, regardless of the type of university they attended, everyone was in agreement that it was a horrible idea. There was a significant difference between the satisfaction levels of students at private and public universities on the assistance they received from their respective institutions (private universities: mean = 2.22, public universities: mean = 1.95) Students in the private sector were more satisfied with "faculty involvement during online education" than with the institutional backing they received. Students at private institutions reported a slightly higher level of satisfaction (mean = 2.58) with the "role of the faculty in online education"

than those at public institutions (2.35). Private university students reported slightly higher levels of happiness (mean = 2.9) than their public university counterparts (2.73).

### Discussion and Conclusion

The main reason the researcher did this study was to find out more about how hard it is to teach online. The researcher did this by talking to professionals in the field of education and government officials in Pakistan about their own experiences with distance education. During the middle of the school year, universities were closed. So, classes had to go on, even though there were clear problems. Low bandwidth in the area, not enough electricity, and not having the right hardware and software were just some of the problems teachers had to deal with. Also, the researcher found that some students and teachers



didn't have the skills they needed to manage education systems well and were limited by both time and location. In response to these problems, participants said that the regional Ministry of Education had put in a lot of work to ensure continuous education and finish the curriculum on time. The study showed the current state of affairs, which can't be changed anywhere, not just in Pakistan. Since the pandemic hit Pakistan, it has had many effects, one of which is that it has hurt the country's education system.

Even though there are some problems, research shows that online education is generally good for both students and teachers. More research on a larger scale is needed to get a more accurate picture of the pros, cons, and best strategies. Ideally, more instructors and online courses should be involved. It's possible that people who took this survey had a different online education experience than others who have taken similar courses. Due to the small size of the sample, this study can only be used to generalize about a small group of college students.

## Recommendation

The following are the recommendations that the researcher offers:

1. The government should look at how other countries have done well and use those examples to build its own platforms that all government agencies can use.
2. The government should think about increasing funding for higher education to improve infrastructure, especially information and communication technology (ICT) infrastructure and other education management systems at all colleges and universities.
3. Because teachers who don't know how to read or write and teachers who don't have

much experience were found to be major causes, it was suggested that the ministry of education improve their skills by giving them regular training. The focus of these classes should be on two main things: (1) giving participants specialized instruction to help them become skilled with a wide range of digital tools, and (2) creating a supportive education environment. The pedagogy classes they take allow them to update how they teach and grade their students. Procedures could be taken from countries that are more advanced.

4. The government and businesses should improve the current infrastructure to avoid problems with internet connectivity. Teachers need constant access to the internet in the classroom, whether they live in a big city or a small village.
5. Problems with Internet connectivity can be avoided if the government and commercial enterprises work together to make it better.
6. All teachers, whether they live in a big city or a small town far away, must have reliable access to the internet in the classroom.
7. The U.S. Department of Education might pay for the money needed to keep computer labs running smoothly.
8. Computer labs can be used in a planned and efficient way if the HEC and upper-level administration and management work together.
9. It is suggested that similar research be done in other parts of Pakistan, both at the secondary and tertiary levels and with public and private funding.

## References

- Ahmad. (2020). *A text book of computers* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.) Lahore: West Park. Publishing.
- Albirini, A. (2006b). Teachers' attitudes toward information and communication technologies: the case of Syrian EFL teachers. *Computers & Education*, 47(4), 373–398. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2004.10.013>
- Baylor & Ritchie (2002). ). *ICT Capability and Initial Teacher Training*. In M. Monteith, *ICT for Curriculum Enhancement* .113–126. Bristol: Intellect Ltd.
- Baylor & Ritchie. (2002). Teachers' attitudes towards information and communication technologies: *The case of Syrian EFL teachers, computers and education*, 5(2), 373–398.
- Chaney, (2001). *Benchmarking access and use of ICT in European schools 2006. Final report from Head Teachers and classroom teacher surveys in 27 European countries*. Germany: European Commission.
- Chijioke J. Evoh. (2014). Policy networks and the transformation of secondary education through ICTs in Africa: The prospects and challenges of the NEPAD E- schools initiative. *International Journal of Education and development using information and technology*, 3(1), 64–84
- Cholin, V. S. (2005b). Study of the application of information technology for effective access to resources in Indian university libraries. *International Information & Library Review*, 37(3), 189–197. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iilir.2005.07.002>
- Gülbahar, Y. (2007). Technology planning: A roadmap to successful technology integration in schools. *Computers & Education*, 49(4), 943–956. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2005.12.002>
- Guthrie & Wigfield. (2000). *Teaching and Learning Online: Communication, Community, and Assessment. A Handbook for UMass Faculty*. Office of Academic Planning and Assessment.
- Harris, S. (2002). Innovative pedagogical practices using ICT in schools in England. *Journal of Computer Assisted Learning*, 18(4), 449–458. <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.0266-4909.2002.00256.x>
- Hess, F. M., & Leal, D. L. (2001). A Shrinking “Digital Divide”? The Provision of Classroom Computers across Urban School Systems. *Social Science Quarterly*, 82(4), 765–778. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/42955759>
- Huang. (2020). *Teachers' use of educational technology in U.S public schools 2009*. National Centre for Education Statistics. Institute of Education Science, U.S Department of Education. Washington DC.
- Ihmeideh, F. M. (2009). Barriers to the use of technology in Jordanian pre-school settings. *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, 18(3), 325–341. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14759390903255619>
- Kangro, A., & Kangro, I. (2004). Integration of ICT in Teacher Education and Different School Subjects in Latvia. *Educational Media International*, 41(1), 31–37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0952398032000105076>
- Kling, R. (2000). Learning About Information Technologies and Social Change: The Contribution of Social Informatics. *The Information Society*, 16(3), 217–232. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01972240050133661>
- Kozma, R. B.(2005). National Policies that Connect ICT-Based Education Reform to Economic and Social Development. *Human Technology*, 1(2), 117–156. <http://www.humantechnology.jyu.fi>
- Lim, C. P., & Chai, C. S. (2008). Teachers' pedagogical beliefs and their planning and conduct of computer-mediated classroom lessons. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 39(5), 807–828. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2007.00774.x>
- Long, S. (2001). Multimedia in the Art Curriculum: Crossing Boundaries. *International Journal of Art Design Education*, 20(3), 255–263. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-5949.00274>

- Loveless, A. (2003). Making a Difference? An Evaluation of Professional Knowledge and Pedagogy in Art and ICT. *International Journal of Art Design Education*, 22(2), 145–154. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-5949.00350>
- Mason, R. (2000). From distance education to online education. *The Internet and Higher Education*, 3(1–2), 63–74. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s1096-7516\(00\)00033-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/s1096-7516(00)00033-6)
- McCarney, J. (2004). Effective models of staff development in ICT. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 27(1), 61–72. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0261976042000211801>
- Milya, S. (2014). Teach Support: Preparing teachers to use technology. *Principal Leadership*, 1(9), 35–39.
- Mumtaz, S. (2000). Factors affecting teachers' use of information and communications technology: a review of the literature. *Journal of Information Technology for Teacher Education*, 9(3), 319–342. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1475939000200096>
- Nancy P. Hunt & Roy M. Bohlin. (1995). Events and Practices That Promote Positive Attitudes and Emotions in Computing Courses, *Journal of Computing in Teacher Education*, 11(3), 21–23, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10402454.1995.10784263>
- Rajagopalan, I. (2019). Concept of Teaching. *Shanlax International Journal of Education*, 7(2), 5–8. <https://doi.org/10.34293/education.v7i2.329>
- Ratnasari, A. (2012). *Studi Pengaruh Penerapan E-learning Terhadap Keaktifan Mahasiswa dalam Kegiatan Belajar Mengajar Studi Kasus Universitas Mercu Buana Jakarta*. In Seminar Nasional Aplikasi Teknologi Informasi (SNATI).
- Salma, D., Ariani, D., & Handoko, H. (2013). *Mozaik Teknologi Pendidikan: ELearning*. Jakarta: PT Fajar Interpratama Mandiri, 2103.
- Thurman. (2019). Shopping for technology. *Educational leadership*, 53(3), 55–63.