

p-ISSN : 2708-2091 | e-ISSN : 2708-3586

DOI(Journal): 10.31703/gsr
DOI(Volume): 10.31703/gsr/.2024(IX)
DOI(Issue): 10.31703/gsr.2024(IX.I)



www.gsrjournal.com

GSR
Global Sociological Review

GSR



GLOBAL SOCIOLOGICAL REVIEW
HEC-RECOGNIZED CATEGORY-Y

VOL. IX, ISSUE I, WINTER (MARCH-2024)



Double-blind Peer-review Research Journal
www.gsrjournal.com
© Global Sociological Review

Article title

The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by
Freny Manecksha

Global Sociological Review

p-ISSN: 2708-2091 e-ISSN: 2708-3586

DOI(journal): 10.31703/gsr

Volume: IX (2024)

DOI (volume): 10.31703/gsr.2024(IX)

Issue: I (Winter-March 2024)

DOI(Issue): 10.31703/gsr.2024(IX-I)

Home Page

www.gsrjournal.com

Volume: IX (2024)

<https://www.gsrjournal.com/Current-issues>

Issue: I-Winter (March-2024)

<https://www.gsrjournal.com/Current-issues/9/1/20234>

Scope

<https://www.gsrjournal.com/about-us/scope>

Submission

<https://humaglobe.com/index.php/gsr/submissions>

Google Scholar



Visit Us



Abstract

Kashmiri literature highlights the major themes of oppression and the continuous struggle by Kashmiris in their cause for independence. Millions of Kashmiris have suffered from human rights violations by Indian troops. Among them, the most disturbed are women and children. This paper focuses on the narratives of Kashmiri women and how they spend their lives in Indian-occupied Kashmir while highlighting the theoretical underpinning of female subalterns. In which women are suppressed, oppressed, and kept voiceless among their people. In Kashmir, women have been raped, assaulted, and marginalized by Indian troops and to lower their voices they are given the amount of ex gratia which acts as a bandage to heal the wounds. The paper will explore how Indian troops have colonized the land how they have been treating women in Kashmir, and what role women play in their call for azadi.

Keywords: Kashmir, Kashmiri Women, Narratives, Subaltern, Marginalized

Authors:

Salman Ali: MPhil Scholar, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Ummer Awais: (Corresponding Author)

MPhil Scholar, Department of Anthropology, Griffith University, Australia.

(Email: umarawais099@gmail.com)

Summia Masood: Lecturer, Department of English Language and Literature, University of Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Pages: 133-142

DOI: 10.31703/gsr.2024(IX-I).12

DOI link: [https://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gsr.2024\(IX-I\).12](https://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gsr.2024(IX-I).12)

Article link: <http://www.gsrjournal.com/article/A-b-c>

Full-text Link: <https://gsrjournal.com/fulltext/>

Pdf link: <https://www.gsrjournal.com/jadmin/Author/31rvIolA2.pdf>

Citing Article

12	The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha						
	Author	Salman Ali Ummer Awais Summia Masood		DOI	10.31703/grr.2024(IX-I).12		
Pages	133-142	Year	2024	Volume	IX	Issue	I
Referencing & Citing Styles	APA	Ali, S., Awais, U., & Masood, S. (2024). The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha. <i>Global Sociological Review</i> , IX(1), 133-142. https://doi.org/10.31703/gsr.2024(IX-I).11					
	CHICAGO	Ali, Salman, Ummer Awais, and Summia Masood. 2024. "The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha." <i>Global Sociological Review</i> IX (1):133-142. doi: 10.31703/gsr.2024(IX-I).11.					
	HARVARD	ALI, S., AWAIS, U. & MASOOD, S. 2024. The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha. <i>Global Sociological Review</i> , IX, 133-142.					
	MHRA	Ali, Salman, Ummer Awais, and Summia Masood. 2024. 'The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha', <i>Global Sociological Review</i> , IX: 133-142.					
	MLA	Ali, Salman, Ummer Awais, and Summia Masood. "The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha." <i>Global Sociological Review</i> IX.I (2024): 133-42. Print.					
	OXFORD	Ali, Salman, Awais, Ummer, and Masood, Summia (2024), 'The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha', <i>Global Sociological Review</i> , IX (1), 133-42.					
	TURABIAN	Ali, Salman, Ummer Awais, and Summia Masood. "The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freney Manecksha." <i>Global Sociological Review</i> IX, no. I (2024): 133-42. https://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gsr.2024(IX-I).11 .					



Cite Us



The Narrative of Oppression and Struggle Among the Women of Kashmir: A Subaltern Study of Behold, I Shine by Freny Manecksha

Authors:

Salman Ali: MPhil Scholar, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Ummer Awais: (Corresponding Author)
MPhil Scholar, Department of Anthropology, Griffith University, Australia.
(Email: umarawais099@gmail.com)

Summia Masood: Lecturer, Department of English Language and Literature, University of Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Abstract

Kashmiri literature highlights the major themes of oppression and the continuous struggle by Kashmiris in their cause for independence. Millions of Kashmiris have suffered from human rights violations by Indian troops. Among them, the most disturbed are women and children. This paper focuses on the narratives of Kashmiri women and how they spend their lives in Indian-occupied Kashmir while highlighting the theoretical underpinning of female subalterns. In which women are suppressed, oppressed, and kept voiceless among their people. In Kashmir, women have been raped, assaulted, and marginalized by Indian troops and to lower their voices they are given the amount of ex gratia which acts as a bandage to heal the wounds. The paper will explore how Indian troops have colonized the land how they have been treating women in Kashmir, and what role women play in their call for azadi.

Keywords:

[Kashmir](#), [Kashmiri Women](#), [Narratives](#), [Subaltern](#), [Marginalized](#)

Contents

- [Introduction](#)
- [Literature Review](#)
- [Research Methodology](#)
- [Discussion](#)
- [Conclusion](#)
- [References](#)

Introduction

Since the partition, the region of Kashmir has been a disputed territory between India and Pakistan. American scholars Joseph J. (Hobbs and Christopher L 2003). Salter in their book *Essentials of World Regional Geography*, also talks about the geopolitical condition of Kashmir after the three wars which were fought between India and Pakistan over the region.

Hobbs and Salter state that: “Kashmir has been occupied by both countries and they both backlash each other of occupying the land illegally” (47). For decades, the region has been wracked by political instability and a bloodbath of violence due to insurgencies and intense militarization.

War conflicts and political uncertainty in the region have led to multiple problems for residents and



individuals. Even the long brutal and terrorizing history of Kashmir's conflict with India is filled with ambiguous, gloomy, and unresolved stories that are the outcome of military violence against these common masses. The acts of terror against the civilian population are not limited to political repression but also include extrajudicial killings, rapes, curfews, torture, and enforced disappearance in the region (48). This paper focuses on how women remain doubly marginalized by patriarchal structures and mistreated by the Indian military in particular Indian Occupied (Kashmir [2022](#)).

Women are frequently stereotyped as easy prey in armed conflict because of their vulnerability and gender. (Seema Kazi [2015](#)), in her article "Gender and Militarization in Kashmir" states, that over the past decade, Kashmiri women have been the victims of oppression by colonial power and have undergone severe trauma of rape, and harassment; "their sons have been killed, and their husbands are disappeared" (3). The torture, killings, and rape of this section of society are known to all, where women are the worst hit by both the state and the patriarchal nature of society. Regrettably, they have been symbolized as wives in grief, half-widowed, martyr's mothers, and women victims of rape.

In highlighting the ideas of society, literature plays a key role. As S. Keerthika, an Indian critic, mentioned in her article "Literature and Society: How Literature Reflects Society" "Literature creates a huge impact on the development of society, the political system, and the ideas of human experience (471). Kashmiri literature has a rich tradition of powerful female voices who contribute to the idea of freedom for Kashmir through modern and artful expression. Followed by Hanifa Began, Taj Begam Benzu (collection of short stories) and Shamla Mufti's collection of plays, *Aes Lukh (We, the people)*, and many more.

This paper studies Frency Manecksha: *Behold, I Shine* as a case study in the context of Kashmir's anti-social struggle and women's oppression in this realm. As an editor and independent journalist, Frency Manecksha is from Mumbai India, and has written her first debut book on Kashmiri women's perspectives,

while visiting the region in 2010. Her book *Behold, I Shine: Narratives of Kashmir's Women and Children* comprises 10 different documented stories that explore how territorial conflict between India and Kashmir has disturbed the lives of women and their children. Manecksha has also exonerated the military brutalities, particularly against women in Kashmir, which viciously suppress female sexuality, and her voice against the violence. She also depicts how women and children both are supposed to be innocent in war, but in the case of Kashmir, it is not the same.

The theoretical underpinning of this paper is done through Spivak's idea of the "Female Subaltern", where she explores the idea of double marginalization and oppression faced by postcolonial women while addressing the colonized states in third-world countries (260). Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak is a postcolonial theorist, who has tried to challenge the legacy of colonialism in third-world countries. In her famous essay *Can the Subaltern Speak?* Spivak has intentionally connected the term subaltern with lower-class people, especially women who belong to third-world countries and cannot speak on their own. In her essay, Spivak draws attention to the need to analyze issues and behavior of colonial women with their history. In other words, Spivak highlights the problems and politics of the representation of women among marginal and oppressed groups.

This study attempts a Subalternist representation of females in Manecksha's book *Behold, I Shine* in terms of how women of Kashmir remain double marginalized, and their voices are oppressed politically. The present study is also motivated by the desire to trace how sexual violence against females is being portrayed by an Indian journalist while questioning and exposing her native state. Secondly, through analysis of the real-life narratives of female characters as the experiential center of the violence present in the book.

Research Question

- What are the narratives of oppressed Kashmiri women that are addressed in Manecksha *Behold, I Shine*?

- How women are doubly marginalized by patriarchy and their voices are politically subaltern?
- What are the roles played by Kashmiri women in the struggle for independence of Kashmir in *Behold, I Shine*?

Objectives

- To investigate the narratives of oppressed Kashmiri women as addressed in *Behold, I Shine*.
- To highlight the role of patriarchal structures and states in perpetuating the marginality of Kashmiri women.
- To provide insight into the role of Kashmiri women and their struggle for independence of Kashmir in the book *Behold, I Shine*?

Literature Review

Kashmir has been a place of terror and chaos. The political violence has continued to impact the everyday lives of people, as the state has become more marginalized. The daily lived experience and the variety of violence have numerous impacts on the subjection of women demonstrated in gender-based violence and marginalization in the political arena. *Behold, I Shine* is a recently published book by Frency Manescha, who witnessed the condition of women and children in Kashmir. The importance of Kashmiri literature is not as popular or recognizable on the international platform because of its territorial conflict. The popularity of this book is in vail. Still, many book reviews on different media platforms are present.

A review, "Kashmiri Women Articulating Stories of Resistance in France Manecksha's *Behold I Shine*", by Dr. Rizwan Akhtar and Khurshid Alam from Punjab University Lahore, Pakistan, highlights the idea of the art of storytelling in the Kashmiri diaspora. Akhtar et al state that Manecksha as a front-line journalist has taken the burden of women and children in Kashmir, through narrating the untold stories of those who are the victims of sexual abuse, violence, torture, and trauma over the decades. They state that "a

groundbreaking book harboring and navigating stories of women and children with brave statements with a proper reference is what makes this book a class" (90). As a place in Kashmiri Literature, with intense suffering, this book still manages to show how women emerge as winners, with redefined identities against tremendous odds.

Furthermore, an Indian critic Arshie Qureshi in her review "*Behold, I Shine: How Kashmiri women navigate their tales of loss in conflict*" on Feminism in India states that "Beautiful and conflict zone", are the two descriptions that Manecksha in her book *Behold, I Shine* has portrayed while portraying the narratives of Kashmiri women who are facing violence within their homeland. Qureshi states that Manecksha basically compels the audience to look beyond the beauty of the land and to hear the conflict in order to bring out the voices of oppressed females within Kashmir. Moreover, Qureshi also talks about the taboo remotely related to sex and sexual violence (rape and harassment) that the Manecksha manages to picture against her militants, and requires a lot of trust-building and guts.

Similarly, another book review on Amazon by Bani Sodermark from Sweden, states that appearance is mostly deceptive and Kashmir is not an exception. Basically, Manecksha's book explores a very subtle picture of a society divided between freedom and misunderstood religion. She states that "there are many cases of violence and the number of half widows has risen to a greater extent, which is alarming. *Behold, I Shine* is a compilation of such stories of resistance and courage that can give you goosebumps" (2017). The (green [2011](#)) Valley of Dreams which was once peaceful is now a hub for violence and terror. Sodermark also criticized the political insurgency in the region that has physically rampaged the lives of Kashmiri women on an anti-Islam basis.

Even during an interview with an Indian magazine named, *Wande Magazine*, the author Frency Manecksha speaks about her journey in composing her book *Behold, I Shine*. She said that she had faced many difficulties while interviewing people

and writing a book. She had to face a shortage of funds, and it was not safe for her to stay in the valley for a long time. She also states that the very first idea for writing this book on women and children in Kashmir was an outcome of three or four journal articles written on "the impact of militarization on women" (1). Manecksha also states that reading Cabeiri de Bergh Robinson's book *Body of Victim, Body of Warrior: Refugee Families and the Making of Kashmiri Jihadists*, was an eye-opener time, as it challenged her earlier notions of jihad. That helps to understand how the Islamic concept of social justice and the fight against all forms of oppression can be the bedrock on which the Kashmir struggle is based.

From the above-given discussion, it is concluded that Manecksha's *Behold, I Shine* has not been critically analyzed by any serious academic research. The major themes in the book are female oppression, marginalization, objectification, sexual abuse, and women's role in the struggle for independence in Kashmir. This primitive study focuses on deploying narratives of Kashmiri women and fills the gap by critically analyzing the book through Spivak's idea of female subaltern; how women are marginalized and kept voiceless in a terrorizing state of Indian Occupied Kashmir.

Theoretical Framework

Bill Ashcroft, Griffiths, and Tiffin in their book, *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader*, referred to the term subaltern as the "13 non-commissioned military troops who are subordinate to the authority" (33). Although the term 'subaltern' has several meanings in social sciences, it has become an operative research concept through the work of Italian Marxist, Antonio Gramsci (1891-1937) in the late 1930s. (David 2003). Ludden professor of history in his book, *Reading Subaltern Studies*, states that Gramsci utilizes the term subaltern for "groups and classes" (68); proletarian any group of inferior rank on ethnicity, class, or gender extraction, is marginalized by hegemonic power and have no voice in a power structure.

The Subaltern reflects the people who are subject to the marginalization of the ruling class. In the last two decades, Subaltern studies gained momentum, especially in globalization in Third World countries. Subaltern is used by historians like Ranajit Guha, Shahid Amin, David Arnold, and Gyanendra Pandey in postcolonial studies to express class, gender, and race. The group has formed 5 volumes of *Subaltern Studies* – relating to the history, politics, and belief systems in postcolonial states (96). Later, in 1988 – the seminal essay *Selected Subaltern Studies* was edited by Ranajit Guha, and Gayatri Spivak with a foreword by Edward Said.

The concept of the subaltern gained prominence in South Asia by Indian literary critic and postcolonial theorist Gayatri Spivak (b-1942) 1988, who borrowed the concept of subaltern from Gramsci's book *Prison Notebook* (1948). Basically, Spivak challenges the postcolonial historian group's assumptions that oppressed voices can be recorded. And later her critique was against French thinkers Michel Foucault and Gilles Deleuze who believed that if the oppressed were given a chance they could speak and highlight their conditions (102). Spivak used the distinction of Marx's statement and stated that: "they cannot represent themselves, they must be represented" (83), and that these unheard voices can only be represented by other voices, especially by writers and historians.

In her famous essay *Can the Subaltern Speak?* (1983), Spivak explores the long-silenced questions regarding women's history and position in third-world countries, where she stands against the practice of Sati, "that is widow self-immolation" (98). Women in India were not allowed to set themselves free after the death of their husbands and were supposed to be buried with their late partners. Basically, for Spivak, subaltern women are those individuals in society who are subjugated by hegemonic power, and patriarchal structures and have no meaningful position from which to speak. Spivak's work condemns the treatment of women in third-world countries. These women were led to believe that because of the gender imbalance, they could not stand on an equal footing with the dominant class.

Moreover, Spivak's contribution to Postcolonialism came up when she defined Female Subaltern in her essay; "subaltern studies reflect women's voice being silenced by the male-dominated society and giving little hope to the women's voice to rise and stand against social institutions that oppress her" (364). Third-world feminist discourse heavily relies on West-centric patriarchal terms of empowerment which is a big concern.

Most noticeably, Spivak's idea of a female subaltern has also generated debates in literary circles about postcolonial women. That refers to the observation that women's voice is subjugated by colonial domination and male domination of patriarchy, whereas, male voices are heard as superior and rigorously control women's speech and choice. Consequently, both the state and patriarchy have control over female subjects, who are colonized, oppressed, and doubly marginalized. She states that:

"The ideological construction of gender keeps the male dominant. The subaltern has no history in the context of colonial production, and they cannot speak, in this regard, the female is the one who is in the shadow" (366).

In contrast, Spivak claims the voice of colonial women in "gendered subaltern" (367), as a major insight into the ability to speak and choose to act freely against the patriarchal social orders, that treat women as subordinate and considered inferior. Spivak's writings reflect the struggle of women and their oppression. Her writings had an iconoclastic effect as she challenged basic assumptions of females that all women are not the same and there are some variations among these women concerning their status, color, and creed. From the above discussion, it is concluded that this paper is critically analyzed through the theoretical underpinning of the Female Subaltern by Spivak. The book *Behold, I Shine* portrays the issue of women being double marginalized in a colonized by hegemonic power.

Moreover, due to gender imbalance, the condition of women is being suppressed. They have been doubly marginalized and their voices are being subalterned both by the Indian military and

patriarchal society. The paper is written under the qualitative method of research. Primary and secondary resources were used to write the paper. For the primary resource the textbook *Behold, I Shine* was studied to analyze the perspective of the writer. For secondary resources online material, journals, and articles were used to analyze more deeply about marginalization and suppression of women in Indian-occupied Kashmir and how their voices are politically subaltern.

Discussion

Kashmir is a land that has been declared a dispute between India and Pakistan. Both countries have fought three wars over the region but none of them have to care about the lives of innocent Kashmiri people. The book *Behold I Shine* highlights the continuous struggle for freedom by Kashmiri women and children in Indian-occupied Kashmir. Freny Manecksha who is an independent Indian journalist has spent ten years studying and interviewing the untold stories of Kashmiri women and children. She compiled the stories into a book which she named *Behold, I Shine: The Narrative of Kashmiri Women and Children*. The book contains ten chapters discussing and highlighting the harsh realities of human rights violations in the valley. These ten chapters focus on the question of the future of Kashmiri women and children and also whether their suppressed voices would be heard or not. The book also highlights the payment (ex gratia) given to the victims in order to lower their voices and they are being assaulted both by the military and patriarchy.

Similarly, the book describes how Kashmir has been a devastated land. Oppression over Kashmiri women and resistance by them have also been highlighted by the author. The author highlights the themes of marginalization, victimization, and rape of Kashmiri women and how their lives have been made hell by the military. Women like Hameeda, Mehbooba, etc. have been victims of rape even though young girls are not safe in their homes. Their voices are never heard and they are repressed by the payment called ex gratia as discussed in the book *Behold, I Shine*. Ex gratia has

been defined as money given as a favor to keep them silent (p.33). Manecksha through her book *Behold, I Shine* has tried to give voice to the voiceless Kashmiri women, she has highlighted the untold narratives of repressed women like Hameeda, Pakeeza, etc. who suffer violence every day but cannot do anything to avoid, and their voice is repressed and politically subalterned.

However, there are stories of half-widows and women whose husbands have disappeared or gone missing. The author explains how brutalities from the Indian military have created jihadi movements in Kashmir where people have rebelled against the military and do not even think about their lives. They feel proud of giving their lives for freedom. Among the men, women also came to stand for the cause of independence. The young ones being born in the war have traumatized minds and they join the militant groups who sacrifice their lives for the cause of independence. Focusing on some women characters that Manecksha has addressed in her book *Behold, I Shine* are Alia Bashir, Zamurd, Mehbooba, Pakeeza, Ameera, and many more. These are the women who have faced repression and violence for their actions because they are women and are weak, and cannot speak for themselves.

Although, it seems like women have been marginalized and kept voiceless by the military in Kashmir at some point society is also responsible. Gender discrimination and double colonization have been major issues where a raped woman does not hold any position in society. Mahescha has highlighted the narratives of those women who refused the payments *ex gratia* but did not get the desired respect from their people after being the victims. They are voiceless by the military violence and also by the patriarchal violence, Mehbooba, is a survivor of the Mashali Mohalla carnage. She was the first woman who received the payment of *ex gratia*. Shazia Yousaf was the one who documented her story.

Particularly, women being a subaltern, Spivak poses a question: can the subaltern speak? Describing this question Manecksha interviewed Kulsum who refused the money of *ex gratia*. Manecksha states that: It was Kulsum and her husband Nasir Ahmed in Shopian,

and their grief started in March 2003. When the second among three sons, Naseer went missing and he never returned after offering prayer. Kulsum got the news that her eldest son Nevli Hilal received a phone call when he was informed that his brother was missing. He was shot dead by an army official; he didn't bear the news and had a heart attack and died. After Five years, Kulsum's youngest and only son Sajjad was also shot dead when he was coming back after offering prayer at his brother's grave. They were also given the amount of *ex gratia* but they refused to accept it.

Kulum and Nazir were told they would receive the payment of *ex gratia* for the death of their youngest son. But they refused to accept it stating that: they would rather beg on the streets but would not accept this money. (p.52)

Similarly, in another interview, Mahescha talks about Mehbooba who was sexually assaulted by the military officials in front of her husband and children and she was forced to accept the payment of *ex gratia* at first she refused but her own family did not accept her because she was now an impure one. She was kept voiceless and was doubly colonized and marginalized. Mehbooba states that while preparing dinner she heard loud noises of gunfire and shouts. The security officer came inside the house. As she closed her eyes she heard gunfire. Her family died that night. She yelled for help but no one came not to help and she was also shot in the shoulder. Although she escapes the rape, but her family was long gone and there was nothing she could do for her family. Mahescha states that:

The next morning, Mehbooba was hospitalized and her two sons and husband were dead. Former Divisional Commissioner Wajahat Habibullah met her in the hospital and proposed monetary compensation but she refused to accept. After this incident she faced many difficulties, her family refused to accept her and she also had no right over her husband's property. So, she had no other way but to accept the payment from Habibullah. (p.51)

Following Kashmir, a place where a woman has to suffer everything when she is brutally raped and marginalized. She is kept voiceless not by the military

but by her family as well. She is double colonized and doubly marginalized. Giving money to lower the voice of the victim becomes a major concern in Kashmir where a woman cannot speak about the brutality because she is being paid in the money of ex gratia. In the chapter "How do I tell my story?" Manecksha highlights the Gujjar community, those who were loyal to India while living in Kashmir but even their loyalty was questioned when a woman from the Gujjar community was sexually abused. During her visit to south Kashmir in May 2013, Manecksha interviewed the victim named Pakeeza (name changed). In her home, Pakeeza was making tea for her relatives (militants), and when they saw troops approaching they ran away. The security personnel dragged Pakeeza to another room where he assaulted her in front of her husband and her family members. Manecksha states that:

Security personnel were enforced around her family which made it difficult for Pakeeza to record the crime in a police station. After some days an army officer came and offered 5, 00,000 in exchange for silence. This created marital discord and her husband divorced her. Pakeeza also said that her husband was promised a job if he divorced her. (p.66)

Similarly, Manecksha highlights the incident of Hameeda, a young girl who was raped in the police station but the tragedy happened when her family members refused to accept her. Manecksha states that she was at school when a policeman came and said that she was needed at the police station for interrogation. In connection with a murder case in which Hameeda's cousin (militant) was suspected. She told Manecksha in her interview that two police constables beat her demanding her cousin and they sexually assaulted her. Hameeda said:

What transpired is unknown to me. All I can recall is the cop stomping on me and kicking me in the groin. I passed out, and when I regained consciousness, all I could think of was my ripped uniform and the severe bruises on my chest. My parents hurried to the police station and pleaded with them to let me go. My father begged for my release as

he removed the cap from his head, set it down at the office's feet, and did so. (p.73)

This was devastating to see a girl in such a condition. Later Hameeda was hospitalized and Manecksha learned from her fellow journalist that her medical reports indicated severe injuries to her sexual organs. Despite their efforts, Hameeda and her family were not able to file an FIR. On the other hand, the police filed a case against her and her cousin. This not only destroyed their lives but also destroyed the household's links and now Hameeda was questioned again and again by her relatives. She states: Relatives told my mother that I was no longer acceptable in the family and that I was impure. My aunt said, *Ye hamari kuch nahi lagti!* (She is nobody to us!). (p.73) although it seems devastating to hear the world from the people you know it shows the bitter truth of women being the victim of double colonization.

In contrast, Mahescha highlights the stories of pregnant women who suffered violence from the security personnel. Narrating the story of Shazia Yousaf, who is a journalist, and professor in media studies at Islamia University Manecksha highlights that When Shazia's mother was pregnant with her. She was forced by army personnel to uncover that she might be hiding something. She protested against it and decided not to go to the hospital and gave birth to her daughter at home. This was common in Kashmir, where women prefer to give birth in their homes rather than in hospitals. Manecksha states that "during my stay in Kashmir I traveled with Dilnaz and other reporters and I heard from locals that military stop ambulances and their relatives beaten up and assaulted (8)". Women who are not safe even in the hospitals in Kashmir how devastating is that for them? What could they do against it, or raise the voice which is suppressed again and again?

However, Shazia in her essay *The Hidden Damage* states: Finally, without any medical intervention, I was born in the house I had grown up in. My siblings and I were both born in the same room. My birth doesn't come to mind fondly. It merely brings back the trauma, as my mother informs me (p.45). this explains the powerlessness of Kashmiri women that

they cannot do anything for themselves. Kashmiri woman who is treated like a third-world woman is voiceless and helpless in her world. She is a subaltern who cannot speak for herself. She has a voice of her own but it is controlled by the colonizer and she cannot do anything against it.

Apart from this, in order to gain their voice and the voice to be heard Kashmiri women started their struggle in the cause for freedom. All they wanted was to have their voice where they could speak by themselves. The idea was highlighted by Spivak in her work *Can the Subaltern Speak?* She focuses on the problems of the women, reflecting on their struggle and oppression in society. She claims that women obeyed the whim, and they had a voice within themselves, a voice of dissent and disapproval (202). Women along with men have been continually struggling hard for the independence of Kashmir; they have lost their sons, husbands, and everything. In the chapter "Josh tha, Jawan thay" Manecksha states that women called for *Azadi* in the 1990s when a *tahreek* (movement) was started by Zamurd Habib of the Muslim Khawateen Markaz (MKM). Zamurd states that:

We were firmly dedicated to the Azadi concept. We plunged headfirst into the conflict. In the field, *Bina kissi siyasat se iss* (we were in this field without any political interest). Our main purpose was to change how men and women perceived and heard women. (p.37)

Women in Kashmir started to help the resistance (militants) in their call for *azadi*. They gave their children and husbands to join the militant groups and fight for the cause of freedom. Secretly, they helped to aid those militants. Manecksha highlights that interviewing a writer and filmmaker Uzma Falak. She said that the troops could not understand Kashmiri women so women called them jokes, *Murga chor* (chicken thief) because they had a reputation for stealing chickens. Zamurd states that:

We prepared meals for them, did their laundry, helped them with their needs, and gave them food. Women were used by militants as messengers and to deliver important information *Kareebi rishta tha. Bas*

Josh tha, Jawan thay (we were passionate, we were young). (p.38)

Manecksha in her book *Behold, I Shine* proposed a question "I gave my son to *azadi*, what did one mean by that?" it was a small remark by a poor woman in Shopian who highlights the role of Kashmiri women by giving up their sons to join militancy and be proud of the ultimate sacrifice of their young warriors. Manecksha interviewed a woman named Misra who lost her son Tariq Ahmed Shah, a young militant, and her other son who became mentally ill and died later. She states that:

The boy of mine was only seventeen when he crossed the border with his friends. Later, he was martyred when he returned. Back then the prevailing sentiment in society was that families with three or more sons should be willing to make a sacrifice for the cause of *azadi*. (p.40)

The ideas that Spivak explained were highlighted by Manecksha in her book *Behold, I Shine* where she highlights women as being the victims of oppression and rape. She also highlights their struggle and gives voice to the voiceless by examining their narratives and highlighting their struggle for independence. Manecksha somehow answers the question that Spivak highlights can the subaltern speak?

Conclusion

From the above discussion, it is to be concluded that although the Kashmiri literature has not been discussed and highlighted properly it gave way to the movement of freedom from oppression and colonial rule across the globe. Manecksha an Indian journalist has highlighted the suffering of Kashmiri women in her book *Behold, I Shine*. She talks about the real-life incidents and the narratives of women in Indian-occupied Kashmir who have lost their voices even by patriarchal violence or the violence by the Indian military. Women have been raped, marginalized, victimized, and treated as non-living beings who cannot speak about the brutalities acted upon them in Kashmir. Manecksha has given a voice to these voiceless women highlighting their issues through the stories in their voices. This paper also focuses on the real-life stories of Kashmir women who face all the

brutalities but they could not speak about it. give voice to the voiceless by highlighting their fears
Manecksha in her work *Behold, I Shine* has tried to and struggles.

References

- DAWN. (2006). *New slogans for Kashmir campaign*.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- David, L. (ed). (2003). *Reading Subaltern Studies: Critical History, Contested Meaning and the Globalisation of South Asia*. Delhi: Permanent Black,
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Green, M. E. (2011). "Rethinking the Subaltern and the Question of Censorship in Gramsci's Prison Notebooks," *Postcolonial Studies*, 14(4), 385-402.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13688790.2011.641913>
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Guerin, W. L., Labor, E., Morgan, L., Reesman, J. C., Willingham, J. R., & Willingham, J. (1998). *A Handbook of Critical Approaches to Literature (4th ed)*. Oxford University Press.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Gayatri, S. (1988). Can the Subaltern Speak? in Cary Nelson and Lawrence Grossberg, eds., *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture* (London: Macmillan, 1988). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-658-13213-2_84
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Hobbs, J. J., & Christopher L. S. (2003). *Essentials of World Regional Geography*. 4th ed., Brooks/Cole, Cengage Learning,
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Kashmir Conflict. (2022). *Wikipedia*, Wikimedia Foundation, 17 May 2022,
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kashmir_conflict.
- [Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Kazi, S. (2015). Gender and Militarization in Kashmir. *Oxford Islamic Studies Online*. Oxford University Press.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Smith, D. E. (2015). *South Asian Politics and Religion*, Princeton University Press, 86-87.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?" 200.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?" 296.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?" 283.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?" 280.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Holst, P., Kirsten., & Rutherford, A. (1986). *A Double Colonization Colonial and Post-Colonial Women's Writing*. Dangaroo Press.
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)
- Thakur, S., & Santosh, T. T. (2016). Reasons Spivak Cites When She Says That Subaltern Cannot Speak, 7(2), <https://www.wandemag.com/conversation-freny-manecksha/>
[Google Scholar](#) [Worldcat](#) [Fulltext](#)