



## Pakistan's Political Shift from Martial Law towards Democracy during Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Era (1970 – 1977)

\* Uroosa Ishfaq

† Kashif Ashfaq

‡ Khudija Sanam

- Vol. VII, No. IV (Fall 2022)
- Pages: 1 – 6
- p- ISSN: 2521-2982
- e-ISSN: 2707-4587

**Key Words:** Military Interventions, Consequences of Military Interventions, Zulfiqar era, Democracy

**Abstract:** Military is a well organized and disciplined institution of a country. The main function of the military is to secure the borders from external aggressions but in the case of Pakistan there are uncertainties and political instabilities which provoke the military to take over and rule the country. After the martial law of Ayub Khan, formal elections were held in which Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was nominated to govern the country. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto has won the elections and became the prime minister of Pakistan. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto implanted democracy in true sense. It was proved that democracy is far better than dictatorship. The paper aims to throw light on the political shift from martial law to democracy in Pakistan during Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto era.

### Introduction

Pakistan tastes martial law periods many times. Military are a well organized and disciplined institution of every country. General Ayub Khan was the first martial law administrator of Pakistan. He imposed the first martial law on 7 October 1958. He appointed Mr. Yahya Khan as the Martial Law administrator of Pakistan. When the military action started in East Pakistan, Pakistan People Party (PPP) leadership demanded that the political power should be transfer to the elected representative of West Pakistan. East Pakistan was separated from West Pakistan on 16 December 1971, which was the fall of General Yahya Khan. General elections were held in Dec 1970. There were at that time only two political parties which nominated the candidates from their respective parties to fight in the general elections. One of them was Awami League which was led by Sheikh Mujeeb Ur Rehman, while the other party was PPP which was led by Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. Soon after that, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, and Sheikh Mujeeb Ur

Rehman took the charge of West Pakistan and East Pakistan respectively.

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto has announced his new cabinet to run the government operation smoothly. He introduced different new reforms which include Agricultural reforms and Labor Reforms for the welfare of the countrymen. He also enforced the democratic values in the country, and he gave the message to the world that now Pakistan is no more in the hand of dictators, but it is a purely democratic state right now (Naheed Kauser 2009).

Bhutto also focused on the foreign policy of Pakistan. He had a vast knowledge about intelligence, awareness of post-World War II. Bhutto wanted to minimize the relationship with the United States and soon Pakistan left CENTO and SEATO. Butto was interested in a relationship with Arab countries. Bhutto held the second Organization of Islamic Conference (OIC) in 1974 in Lahore. All Muslims leaders were invited in the conference (Hamna Fatima 2017). Bhutto also

\* Lecturer, Department of Political Science, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Women University, Peshawar, KP, Pakistan. Email: [uroosa.ishfaq@gmail.com](mailto:uroosa.ishfaq@gmail.com) (Corresponding Author)

† M.Phil. Scholar, Department of Pakistan Studies, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad, Pakistan.

‡ Visiting Lecturer, Department of Political Science, Government Girls Degree College Shiekhmaltoon Mardan, KP, Pakistan.

started the politicization of bureaucracy. Bhutto introduced administration reforms for the purpose to weaken the civil services of Pakistan because Bhutto says policy making is the responsibility of the political leader and politicians (Naheed Kuser 2009). The other reforms of Bhutto as following:

1. Domestic Reforms
2. Higher Education Reforms
3. Foreign Policy
4. Land Reforms
5. Economic Policy
6. Labor reforms

Constitution is an important document of every country. The constitution of Pakistan was made by the Butto government in 1973 (Aisha Arshad 2013). This was the main job of the newly established government that framed the constitution for Pakistan. A constitutional committee was appointed and the interim constitution which was unique in its nature was promulgated 12 April 1972. After nearly two-year discussion and debated in the National Assembly a new constitution was framed and passed by National Assembly on 14<sup>th</sup> August 1973.

The people witnessed that the 1970s general elections were the first general elections held in the history of Pakistan. Pakistan since independence in 1947, which was based on adult franchise and one-man vote, had never seen such practice. Before the 1970's general elections, indirect elections were also held in 1964 by General Ayub Khan. But through those elections candidates were elected through Electoral College of approximately 80,000 basic democrats. 1970's elections proved Pakistan is a democratic state in the region. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto has won the general elections in 1970 and became the first civilian to rule Pakistan. After the fall of Dhaka and the separation of Bangladesh there was no justification left for Yahya Khan to continue his power in Pakistan. His gun military colleagues want Yahya to leave the government and handover to Butto. Because his party emerged as the majority party in west Pakistan (Faruqui, A. 2001). Bhutto took concrete steps for the constitution of Pakistan. The national assembly of Pakistan emerged/elected in December 1970's elections. The interim constitution came into force on 21 April 1972 on the withdrawal of Martial Law. (Pattanaik, 2001).

## **A Weak Democratic System and Susceptibility to Military's Intervention**

After the separation of Pakistan from the British government, Pakistan was divided into two wings, East and West Pakistan. The main purpose of Pakistan was to establish strong and independent institutions within the country but unfortunately, they have failed to do so for many reasons. Firstly, the founder of Pakistan Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah aimed to establish a constituent assembly and give them the most important task to draft and frame new constitutions of Pakistan. According to Philip Olden-Burg (2010), Quaid-i-Azam was the first governor general of Pakistan consent on execution and political partition and reducing the power of the prime minister and increasing the authority of bureaucracy and military. This was a golden chance for the military to intervene in the political affairs of Pakistan's politics.

## **Pakistan's Political Culture**

Political culture sets the parameter for the military to intervene in politics. He also said that the lackness of political culture in society will leave the military to govern the society, political culture can be defining the underlying rules that determines the success and failure of the political system. The lackness of political institutions also led the military to intervene in politics. When the newly elected government came into power, they wanted to cut the military spending's and transfer the payer away from the military to themselves (Majeed 2010).

In this case military dismiss the government and take over the country. They increase his expenditures when they are takeover. The military struggle for the people's confidence for this purpose they provided new facilities of jobs, hardware. They also increase the salaries of current servants. When the elected government wants to reduce the power of the military, it created indirect domestic instability. The military does not intervene in politics directly. Firstly, they controlled the establishment of the country secretly and destabilize the elected political leaders. Military has dominated position and affective command on the state power since Pakistan's creation.

## **The Untimely Demise of Quaid-i-Azam and Leadership Crisis**

---

After independence Quaid-i-Azam became the first governor-general of Pakistan. He appointed Liaqat Ali Khan as the first Prime minister of Pakistan they both work hardly for Pakistan. Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad and Liaqat Ali Khan opted for a parliamentary system. But unfortunately, after one year Quaid-i-Azam died and Liaqat Ali Khan tenure was also short cut because he was assassinated in Oct 1951. Pakistan deprived from this loyal leadership. After Quaid-i-Azam's death the leadership crises started. There was no sincere leadership in the country. Quaid-i-Azam and Liaqat Ali Khan started "Parliamentary Democracy" with Liaqat Ali soon after the death of these both leaders that parliamentary democracy began to vanish. The upper-class elites started interventions and wanted to convert the office of the governor general into a bureaucratic home. Bureaucracy also started intervention in the provinces and grab the governor's rule. The chief minister of the province was dismissed from his seat and despite the fact that their parties had a majority in the provincial assemblies. Jinnah has always emphasized the supremacy of civilian government. He said that civilians should rule upon the people who are elected by the people for the country's development. This crisis began to instable the political system of Pakistan. We can catchword the political instability from this angle that from 1951 to 1950 Pakistan had only two governor generals and one commander in chief while seven prime ministers toppled one after the other. The façade of Parliamentary parties continue but in reality, they focus on power has shifted to the military. Sikander Mirza was appointed the first president of Pakistan who set the stage for the ascendancy of the bureaucracy. Sikandar Mirza supported the military and had a close relationship with Ayub Khan. He appointed his first commander in chief. He invited Ayub Khan to impose martial law and convert the political system of the country. The sudden demise of Quaid-i-Azam and assignation of Liaqat Ali Khan, the political elites came in to power and the East Pakistan crises started. Pakistan headed by Ghulam Muhammad and Sikander Mirza had no trust on democratic institutions.

## **Failure of Political Leadership Post Independence**

---

Leadership plays an important role to develop his country. But unfortunately is deprived of the true and sincere leadership which were loyal with his country and people. When leaders of the nation are loyal they know how to deal with crises situations. The activating leadership of Jinnah is a attestant to this reality. The Muslims of the sub-continent was fought for freedom under the leadership of Jinnah and they successful against the forces of British imperialism and Hindu Nationalism. Pakistan always has been deprived from sincere leadership since 1947 till to this time. They always protected his interest in his era and welcomed to the armed forces of the country.

## **Civil-Military Dynamics and Pakistani Politics**

---

Civil-Military relationship portray the connection between common society as an entire and the tactical association or associations laid out to safeguard it. Despite the fact that Pakistan had encounter a civilian personal administration before 1971 Bhutto' administration was the primary time of regular citizen matchless quality rule 13 following the country most memorable military over time in 1958. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto attempted to upgrade the regular citizen control of the military, He started setting up paramilitary and knowledge associations for checking his opponent military officials and surprisingly, his own party chiefs. Government Security Force (GSF) was made to limit the reliance on the military as well as shorten military coercive power. Since he partook in the well-known backing of the masses in the underlying phases of his administration, hence he was briefly effective in affirming the management of set up military high command authorities of the top of every one of the three administrations bosses was change from C-in C to Chief of Army/ Naval Forces/ Air Force staff and were set under order joint chief of staff committee and president of Pakistan as commander in Chief. The residency of separate chiefs was likewise decrease from four years to two years. Also, the high conspiracy provision under Articles 6 was consolidated in 1973 constitution 18 with respect to the Bhutto regime became unavertable violent and more

repressive as commander in chief. The residency of separate chiefs was likewise decrease from four years to two years. Also, a high conspiracy provision under article 6 was consolidated in 1973 constitutions with respect to infringement of constitutions, fundamentally pointed towards beating the tactical intercessions down. Non-Military personals incomparability of Bhutto's attestation did not demonstrate strong progressions of time. Bhutto's system became horrendous, savage and more abusive.

The job of the Pakistan military has gone through a significant change during the fifty years of freedom continuously extending its job to turn into a significant entertainer in the dynamic interaction by straightforwardly accepting power.

The creator plot this slow ascent of the military by looking at the tactical legacy and recognizing the materials advantaged to the military. He noticed the degeneration of the political organization and the contention between the political power and military rules as well as the post-withdrawal common military relations. He finished up by expressing that the civil government needs the help and favors of the military to remain above the water announcing that the military's dominant job in the state is in this way guaranteed. (Tahir, K. 2008).

Pakistan can be despite as a praetorian state where the military has gained the ability, well and adequate experience to rule the center political foundations and cycles. As political power is unique and limited the tactician's attitude firmly affects the course of political change including the exchange of force starting with one group of the first class then onto the next. Such as extended job is at fluctuates with the customs and disposition of the military at the hour of autonomy in 1947.

Pakistan's military acquired the British practices of civil citizens matchless quality of the military detachedness from dynamic governmental issues, obligations to amazing skills, and help to the regular citizens specialist as for peace and lawfulness and public catastrophes. Its job extended progressively from the outset. It arose as a significant leader in the dynamic cycle particularly in guard and security undertakings. In 1958 General (later Field Marshal) Muhammad Ayub Khan Chief of Army Staff (COAS) from 1951 to 1958, toppled the swaying nonmilitary personal

government. He controlled under military regulations until June 1962. In March 1969, general Yahya Khan, COAS from 1966 to 1971, took the power after Ayub Khan's renunciation following mass unsettling contrary to his standards. Notwithstanding the honor of practicing power, different contemplations which affect the senior echelons of the military to keep up with interest in legislative issues incorporate by and large political soundness, the size of the protection financial plan, security and international strategy, proficient interests, particularly the independence of the military in its inward undertakings, and corporate interest, including in the honors and advantages for the military workforce, particularly higher authorities (Rifat, K. 2015).

### **The Unintended Consequences of Z.A Bhutto's Reforms**

---

Bhutto has installed an exceptional agenda of political, institutional, constitutional, bureaucratic, and administrative reforms and this is without any doubt. He tried his best to strengthen civilian control over all institutions of the state in the letter and spirit. Similarly, he has been dragged by an undemocratic disposition in even exclusive political issue (Maluka, 1995). He has also tried to launch a reformist strategy to centralize and accumulate all powers inside the Prime Minister's office. He was the only one who introduced a wide range cataclysmic change in the society of Pakistan. Bhutto did a lot of reforms which includes strengthen of political as well as infrastructural institutions, socio-economic reforms, Pakistan People's Party's (PPP) role for the socio-economic change, extracting popular support for the maximization of civilian supremacy over the military. The leadership of military was observing these measures very keenly (Rizvi 2000).

Due to the aforementioned reforms, the military leadership did want him in the Prime Minister's office. His claim to civilian hegemony over military ended in the blink of eyes due to variegated factor. Bhutto has failed very badly in recognition of the bitter ground realities. Due to his dictatorial rule, the opposition has turned against him. Similarly, this act exhilarated the military to come to the fore tooth and nail. Z.A. Bhutto's self-centered and personalized quaked the foundation of democracy of the Parliament in

Pakistan by giving a chance to the opposite forces to react heatedly, to turn the tide. His political muscles bid to flex which proved a wild goose chase. The leadership of the military took the opportunity of the situation by discrediting his government as well as retrieving political reforms taken by the civil regime of Bhutto (Rifat, K. 2015)..

In the general election of 1977 rigging was alleged which flared up a huge protestation by the opposition which was combined against the Bhutto's regime. With the passage of time, these massive protests adopted violent shade. Consequently, this situation weakened the footing of democratic Bhutto's government, which in turn encouraged and strengthened the military to react with full and fledge vitality to grab its lost leverage. Under General Zia-ul-Haq's leadership of military continued to obey its civilian government. After the retirement of General Tikka Khan from the army chief, Zia-ul-Haq was appointed on his chair to lead the army. A complete sense of romance in between civil-military relationship was affirmed which was deflected between Tikka Khan and Z.A. Bhutto. Bringing the army under civilian dominance has brought Bhutto to the honeymoon period of his regime which was ended after the successful management of General Zia-ul-Haq on July 5, 1977, as a consequence of the army coup in the state (Rifat, K. 2015).

## **Conclusion**

The civil-military relations and democracy are important topics in Pakistan's politics. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto has changed the dictatorship into a democracy. When Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto captured power, he introduced new reforms for the development of Pakistan. Such reforms are labor reforms, agriculture reforms and many more. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto also introduced democratic values in the country. He had given more importance to democracy by giving the message to the people that Pakistan is no more in the hand of dictatorship and now we are living in a democratic state. The Bhutto government is better than martial law because Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto gave many rights to the people of Pakistan like passport right to the citizens of Pakistan and job opportunities. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto also focused on foreign policy. He wanted to establish a relationship with Arab countries and to minimize the relationship with

United Nations. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto played an important role in a session of the organization of the Islamic conference (OIC) in Pakistan in 1974 in Lahore. According to Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, the Constitution is important for any state as it is the important documents of every state. The Constitution of Pakistan is framed by government of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto in 1973. This was a good job for the new establishment. The Constitution was promulgated on 12 April 1972 which was unique in nature. The 1970s election were the first general election held in the history of Pakistan because after the independence, Pakistan has never seen such type of election. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto won the 1970s election in west Pakistan that time. Although the results elections created a deadlock but Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was elected as Prime Minister of Pakistan in 1973. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto wanted to install political, institutional, constitutional, bureaucratic and administrative reforms. He tried his level best to rule the state in a democratic way. Bhutto dismissed many people from their position and started ranking position. He has also tried to centralize all the powers in the prime minister's office. He was the only one to change the society of Pakistan. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto initiated reforms for the development of the state like infrastructural reforms, socio - economic reforms. Due to all the above reforms military didn't want the leadership of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The Military took the opposition in his hand through power. The opposition was against Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and his leadership. The Bhutto government became weak with the passage of time. In the general election of 1977 rigging was alleged due to which all the opposition parties stood against the Bhutto government. Due to these situations again military strength was encouraged. Under general Zia ul haq leadership, the military continue to obey its civilian government. The Bhutto government time was so short it was dismissed after the success of general Zia ul haq. On July 5<sup>th</sup> 1977, martial law was enforced and the Democratic values were dismissed and the country once again came under the grip of dictatorship. Thus it can be concluded that civil-military relations played an important role in constitutional history in Pakistan. The internal political instability and clashes of politicians for power has always invited the military to intervene in politics due to which the State has suffered a lot.

## References

- Ahmad, I., Shahid, R., & Rafique, S. (2020). Z. A Bhutto's Bout for Civil Supremacy in Pakistan: An Analysis. *4*(1), 130-140. [http://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2020\(4-I\)11](http://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2020(4-I)11)
- Ahmed S. (2001) *The Fragile Base of Democracy in Pakistan*. In: Shastri A., Wilson A.J. (eds) *The Post-Colonial States of South Asia*. Palgrave Macmillan, New York. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-137-11508-9\\_3](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-137-11508-9_3)
- Ali, M. (1974). The Second Islamic Summit Conference, 1974. *Pakistan Horizon*, *27*(1), 29-49. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41393199>
- Chawla, S. (2001). Pakistan's military spending: Socio-economic dimensions. *Strategic Analysis*, *25*(5), 703-716. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700160108458990>
- Faruqui, A. (2001). Failure in Command: Lessons from Pakistan's Indian Wars, 1947—1999. *Defense Analysis*, *17*(1), 31-40. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07430170120041785>
- Finer, S. E., & Finer, S. E. (1997). *The History of Government from the Earliest Times: Ancient monarchies and empires* (Vol. 1). Oxford University Press, USA.
- Kumar, S. (2001). Sharif Vs. Musharraf: The future of democracy in Pakistan. *Strategic Analysis*, *24*(10), 1861-1875. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700160108455324>
- Majeed, D. G., & Hashmi, D. R. S. (2020). Baloch Resistance during Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's Era: Causes and Consequences. *South Asian Studies*, *29*(1).
- Maluka, K. (1995). *The Myth of Constitutionalism in Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.