

Arab World's Criticism on Indian Islamophobia: Understanding Islamic Perspective

Zaeem Yasin * Hassan Siddique † Lubna Shaheen ‡

p- ISSN: 2521-2982

e- ISSN: 2707-4587

L- ISSN: 2521-2982

Headings

- [Introduction](#)
- [Literature Review](#)
- [Theorizing Islamic Perspective](#)
- [Research Questions](#)
- [Methodology](#)
- [Findings & Discussion](#)
- [Islamophobia in India](#)
- [Deteriorating Indo-Arab Ties](#)
- [Conclusion](#)
- [References](#)

Abstract

Post COVID-19 Islamophobia in India led to an unprecedented reaction from the Arab World, which had been quiet against the persecution of Indian Muslims, especially after Narendra Modi's premiership. This study has highlighted the international media coverage regarding Islamophobia in India & its impacts on Indo-Arab Relations and also evaluated how can Islamophobia in India impact Indo-Arab ties in future. A thematic qualitative study has been conducted to comprehend the important themes and subthemes discussed in the renowned international media outlets. For this purpose, twelve articles from reputed international media outlets were selected for the qualitative thematic analysis during the month of April & May 2020. This study has discussed the notion of the Islamic concept of Ummah, which ultimately led the Arab world to object to the persecution of Muslims in India. Thematic analysis of the content of reputed international media outlets concluded that if the situation does not improve in India, then the Islamic world may unite itself against Indian policies, which can leave a major dent in India's international image and its economy.

Key Words: Indian Islamophobia, Arab World, Muslim Ummah, Thematic Analysis.

Introduction

Islamophobia was initially developed as a concept during the 1990s by political forces to draw attention towards rhetoric and actions focused on Islam and Muslims in liberal democracies (Bleich, 2012). It is commonly known that Islamophobia in its present form was developed after 9/11, but the literature suggests otherwise. Islamophobia was first defined by the Runnymede Commission of Britain in 1997 in which they termed as "barbaric, irrational, sexist, violent and aggressive".

The history of Islamophobia is not new in India; Muslims have been facing tough times since the partition of 1947. The recent wave of Islamophobia can be linked to the demolition of the Babri Mosque in 1992. Shakoore (1993) deplored the sad state of affairs in Indian democracy. She was of the view that

* Assistant Professor, Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: zaeem74@hotmail.com

† PhD Fellow, Institute of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

‡ Assistant Professor, Institute of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan.

secularism remained some sort of deterrent of communal fights between Hindus and Muslims for the first 45 years, but the demolition of the Babri Mosque has chipped secularism's veneer.

The recent wave of Islamophobia across India was seen during the spread of COVID-19. After a religious congregation, Muslims were attacked after an alleged increase in coronavirus cases. ([Puranam, 2020](#)). Renowned American newspaper, Washington Post (2020) lambasted India for scapegoating Indian Muslims, arguing that "the search for scapegoats during the coronavirus pandemic has focused squarely on the country's sizable Muslim minority, a community of 200 million that felt under threat even before the advent of covid-19."

Foreign Policy Magazine (2020) reported how India has made significant in improving relations with Arab states over the recent years while maintaining excellent relations with one of the two significant antagonists in the region: Saudi Arabia and Iran. Magazine further deplores that years of hard work has been ruined due to Islamophobia. A significant amount of reputed international articles have also discussed India's limited space in the Gulf region.

This research has discussed the recent wave of Islamophobia in India and consequently deteriorating Indo-Arab relations. For this purpose, a qualitative thematic study of the news articles in reputed international media outlets has been conducted.

Literature Review

Islamophobia is not only causing wars across the world but also limiting the social space for Muslims in the west. [Beydoun \(2016\)](#) comprehensively explored the difficulties Muslims have been facing in the United States of America; he found out that "Millions of Muslim Americans are interlocked between indigence and Islamophobia. This intersection exposes indigent Muslim Americans to the hardships linked to poverty, the dangers posed by private Islamophobia, and the compounded injury inflicted when the two converge" (p. 1500-1501)

[Cheng \(2015\)](#) discussed the parliamentary discourse of Switzerland regarding Islamophobia; according to him, there is a growing fear among Swiss politicians that eventually, Muslims want a Shariah law imposed on Switzerland. He further elaborates that, in Islamophobic discourses, Islam is considered a religion only with its 'troubling' aspects.

Islamophobia has also been a topic of discussion in top political discussions of the United Kingdom too, as [Moosavi \(2015\)](#) says that different forms of Islamophobia existed in the speeches of the ministers, and "Islamophobic representations by mainstream politicians must be challenged by pointing out the inconsistencies, misconceptions and contradictions that are contained within them." (p. 670).

Similarly, in India's case, Islamophobia turned violent with the demolition of the Babri Mosque in 1992. While discussing the Babri Mosque incident, [Shakoor \(1993\)](#) claimed that "Secularism lost whatever little appeal it had with the emergence of parties like the BJP, when the Congress which claims to have adhered to the secular tradition of India failed to take on forces like the BJP" ([Shakoor, 1993, p. 35](#)).

The situation after the demolition of the Babri mosque in India worsened with the passage of time; [Lancy \(2002\)](#) argues that Bharti Janata Party belonged to the upper 20 percent segment they used communal riots in directing the anger of the lower classes away from a dysfunctional state. Referring to the Gujarat riots in India during 2002, Lancy related BJP's policies with Hitler, arguing that "Hitler's consolidation of power was marked by breaking the Weimar Constitution bit by bit. In India, too, we see BJP's consolidation of power by attacking and breaking the Constitution and wanting to change it" (p. 4849).

[Sundar \(2004\)](#) exposed the hate agenda of BJP and RSS in the schools. He claims that RSS and BJP (political wing of RSS) have used both state power and civil society to inculcate their radical agenda in the educational institutes.

Owing to the controversies around Narendra Modi's role in persecuting minorities, Narendra Modi was also once banned from entering the United States before coming into power (Times of India, 2005). Casting apprehensions of Modi's campaign as Prime Minister [Teltumbde \(2014\)](#) feared that Modi would be far more 'jingoistic' than any of his predecessors. [Desai \(2014\)](#) feared that the failing economic policies like to induce Rashtria Swami Senak to implement its 'core agenda'.

Today, it seems that the radicalization of Indian society is at its peak, and the seeds of Islamophobia which were sown by RSS, are having now become huge trees, which has shadowed a large segment of India.

Theorizing Islamic Perspective

Abu Sulayman (1993) attempted to present a roadmap for Muslim Ummah in the modern world. He wanted to further the ideas given by Islamic thought 1400 years ago. Lamenting upon the troubled state of Muslims around the world, he urged self-analysis by Muslims to defeat the sad state of affairs in the Muslim World.

Although there is never-ending debate lies regarding Islamic influence on politics and international relations, but this study primarily deals with the issues pertaining to the human rights abuses against Muslims, so this realm is discussed in the pretext of Islamic Theory of International Relations. Though the Organization of Islamic Conference (OIC) is the biggest Muslim body to protect their collective rights, one of the agenda items they regularly discuss include the rights of the Muslim minority. According to [Kizilbash \(1982\)](#) "the OIC is capable of playing an important role in shaping the international politics of the future. Unfortunately, it continues to be subject to all the trials and tribulations of the factional politics that has kept the Islamic States weak in the past" (p. 151)

To understand the concept of Muslim Ummah (one Muslim nation), this Hadith provides the basic guidelines for various concepts regarding the relationship of one Muslim with another.

Research Questions

- RQ₁:** Which issues were highlighted by international media regarding Islamophobia in India & Indo-Arab Relations?
- RQ₂:** How can Islamophobia in India impact Indo-Arab ties in future?

Methodology

A thematic qualitative study has been conducted to comprehend the important themes and subthemes discussed in the renowned international media outlets. Fifteen articles were chosen for the qualitative thematic analysis during the month of April and May 2020. Articles with the following criteria were selected

- Articles discussing Islamophobia in India & Indo-Arab relations
- Articles published in reputed international media outlets like the New York Times or Al Jazeera
- Articles on Indian Islamophobia published in reputed Arab media like Arab News or Gulf News, even if they did not discuss the Indo-Arab relations
- In order to minimize bias, no article was taken from an Indian or Pakistani Media outlet

The thematic analysis offers a highly flexible methodology that can be modified according to the demands of data analysis ([Braun & Clarke, 2006](#)). [Nowell et al \(2017\)](#) have identified six phases of thematic analysis. Based on Nowell et al's study, rigorous and exhaustive work was done to search, review, and name the themes.

Findings & Discussion

RQ1: Which issues were highlighted by international media regarding Islamophobia in India & Indo-Arab Relations?

Table 1.1 has listed all the themes and sub-themes discussed in the population of the study.

Table 1. Prominent themes and sub-themes regarding Islamophobia in India & Indo-Arab Relations

Major Themes	Sub-Themes
Islamophobia in India	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Spreading of misinformation to target Indian Muslims Social Media posts with hashtag #Coronajihan by extremist Hindu groups and BJP Targeting TablighiJamaat (Muslim Missionary Group) Viral footages of Muslims beaten up by police BJP calling boycott against Muslims segregation of Hindu and Muslim Coronavirus patients Islamophobic comments by Indians living in the Gulf and consequent prison or expulsion penalty& firing of Indian employees by UAE firms. Criticism of Indian Islamophobia by UAE royal family members.
Deteriorating Indo-Arab Ties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Warning of the Gulf States to India regarding hate messages against Muslims. Saudi scholar calls expulsion of Hindu supremacist from Gulf Calls to halt the export of hateful messages to Gulf Deteriorating diplomatic relations between Indian and Arab World due to Islamophobia

Islamophobia in India

Gulf News (2020) discussed the Spreading of misinformation to target Indian Muslims. Gulf News reported that "Over the past two months, AFP's fact check team has debunked hundreds of social media posts that falsely targeted Muslims in regards to the coronavirus pandemic in India." The hashtag #Corona Jihad was launched to target Indian Muslims.

Aljazeera (2020) reported that the ruling party in India, BJP, "issued a notice to one of its leaders after a video showing him asking people not to buy vegetables from Muslims surfaced amid a nationwide coronavirus lockdown." Similarly, Al Jazeera (2020b) also reported segregation of Muslim and Hindu coronavirus patients in the Indian state of Gujarat. Likewise, Arab News also lamented the stigmatization of a Muslim Missionary group TablighiJamaat and called this incident one of the numerous instances of the mounting marginalization of Muslims. In the same article, Arab News quoted Dr Hilal Ahmed of New Delhi based think, "The growing polarization has certainly affected everyday life in Muslim communities in India.

The media-driven, anti-Muslim public rhetoric will further demonize Muslims and could lead to a major crisis,"

Deteriorating Indo-Arab Ties

State-run Turkish TV Channel TRT (2020) discussed UAE-India ties in the pretext of Islamophobia in India. TRT quoted a member of the UAE royal family, princess Hend Al Qassimi who tweeted, "The ruling family is friends with Indians, but as a royal, your rudeness is not welcome". Princess voiced her consternation regarding changing social reality in India, where the Hindu-majority is intensifying the climate of hate against Muslims. TRT also discussed Islamophobic comments by Indians living in the Gulf and consequent prison or expulsion penalty& firing of Indian employees by UAE firms.

Aljazeera (2020c) also discussed Arab anger against Islamophobia in India, as they reported "A barrage of tweets and statements from individuals and institutions in the Gulf expressing their outrage over the hateful social media posts forced the Indian government to respond, including a Twitter post by Prime Minister Narendra Modi in which he stressed that "COVID-19 does not see race [or] religion" Aljazeera also discussed Kuwait's deep concerns over the treatment of Muslims in India, asking OIC to intervene. They also shared concerns of Sultan Barakat, director of the Centre for Conflict and Humanitarian Studies at Qatar's Doha Institute and other notable personalities and institutes.

Foreign Policy magazine (2020) commented that over the years, Modi's active diplomacy and growing economic opportunities in India had shielded Indo-Arab ties, "But blaming Muslims for the spread of the coronavirus in India seems to be a step too far for important actors in the Gulf—and could even upend its relations with the region.". Meanwhile, Middle East Monitor (2020) reported that Saudi Scholar Sheikh Abidi Zahrani called the expulsion of Hindu supremacists for spreading hate against Islam and Muslims.

Gulf News (2020b) discussed warnings from UAE, Qatar and Oman against hateful messaging against Islam and Muslims. Gulf News also reported OIC's statement, which demanded urgent steps from India to protect the rights of Muslims and to stop Islamophobia in the country.

RQ2: How can Islamophobia in India impact Indo-Arab ties in future?

In order to address this question, it is pertinent to understand the latest rise in Islamophobia in India and its reaction from the Arab world. Table 1.1 explicitly explains the rise in Islamophobia in India, especially after the emergence of the COVID-19 pandemic and consequent aggressive reactions from the Arab world.

The first point is that this COVID-19 issue is a global issue, and news related to this pandemic has been a point of interest throughout the world; therefore, targeting Muslims in the time of human tragedy was taken very seriously by the Muslim World. Moreover, India's rise as an economic powerhouse shielded them from Arab outrage but this coronavirus related Islamophobia increased anger among the Arabs Modi's active diplomacy and growing economic opportunities in India had shielded Indo-Arab ties, as Foreign Policy Magazine (2020) reported, "blaming Muslims for the spread of the coronavirus in India seems to be a step too far for important actors in the Gulf—and could even upend its relations with the region."

Secondly, as Table 1.1 suggests, Arab opinion-makers started observing Islamophobic content being exported to the Gulf region not only through mainstream satellite channels of India but also via social media posts by the Indians settled in the Gulf. These Islamophobic expressions on social media raised the eyebrows of many Arab influential personalities, including a member from the royal families and intellectuals throughout the Arab World. Pressures from different Arab countries also forced OIC to demand urgent steps from India to protect the rights of Muslims and to stop Islamophobia in the country

Thirdly, as discussed in the literature review, Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan had been trying to direct Arab's anger towards India since August 2019 when Indian Administered Kashmir's special status was abrogated, and Kashmiris faced lockdown in the valley. Similarly, India also deprived a large population of

their citizenship which erupted nationwide protests, primarily by Muslims. At that time, the Arab world did not express any anger regarding these developments, unlike other powerful Islamic countries, including Malaysia & Turkey, which showed explicit support to the Muslims on both of these issues. It can be argued that Arabs might have taken both of these issues politically and has taken the issue of targeting Muslims during coronavirus on humanitarian grounds. But it is not as simple as it looks because Prime Minister Imran Khan, individually and Pakistani state collectively, had been trying to wake Arab conscience through his consistent stance against Islamophobia in India. So, it can be assumed that due to constant hits on the hot iron of Indian economic idol has started bearing fruits for Pakistan. Owing the unswerving stance of Pakistan on Islamophobia and its increasing support by Turkey & Malaysia has forced Arabs to disapprove of the Islamophobic policies of India.

It can be argued that due to the consistent Islamophobic actions of India, ultimately Arab world's enough is enough' moment has arrived, and if BJP India does not alter its anti-Muslim policies, it can badly affect the Indo-Arab relations in future because despite strong economic relations with India Arab world will ultimately pick Islamic values and tradition.

It should also be noted that Huntington & Jervis (1997) has predicted the Indian alliance with the West against Islam, so this situation would also lead to worsening Indo-Arab relations. [Akram \(2007\)](#) defined Ummah as the political unity of Muslims, unlike other definitions in which Muslim Ummah is only interpreted as a religious community. He also suggested applying the concept of Ummah is a category of transnational Muslims in International Relations. So, in the light of this study and previous literature, it can safely be stated that the ultimate commonality of the religion of Arabs and India Muslims may strengthen the Indian Muslims in future, and the Indo-Arab relations might face a dent due to the aforementioned reasons.

Conclusion

This study explored the reasons behind the strong reaction from the Arab world against rising Islamophobia in India and also highlighted the issues which caught attention from the Arab world. Table 1.1 showed illustrated the range of issues being seriously taken by the Arab world and consequent impact on the Indo-Arab ties.

It should be noted that the Arab world's objections to India are not a knee jerk reaction. Arab countries and even the Organization of the Islamic Conference conveyed strong reservations regarding Indian treatment towards Islam & Muslims. Similarly, Islamophobic social media content, shared by the Indian diaspora in Arab, also added fuel to the fire. This policy shift was keenly observed by reputed international media organizations like Foreign Policy Magazine, Al Jazeera and TRT.

It should also be noted that the recent turn of events gives strength to three assumptions. First are the Huntington and Jervis' (1997) prediction of clash of civilization theory, which argues that India and Islam are two different civilizations and their clash is imminent, although clash of civilization also talks about other nations too as this study is about Indo-Arab relations, so the other civilizations are not under discussion. The second one is the concept of Ummah, which is repeatedly described in Islamic tradition. So, despite improving ties with India in recent history, the Arab world may not digest the continuous persecution of Muslims in India and especially cannot tolerate the export of hate content from India to their own territory.

Modi led India is not in a mood to shift its anti-Islam and anti-Muslim policies imminently; therefore, the future of Indo-Arab relations looks quite bleak. And if the situation does not improve in India, then the Islamic world may unite itself against Indian policies, as major non-Arab powers, including Turkey & Malaysia already supporting the cause of Indian Muslims for a long time. It would be extremely difficult for India to absorb the shock as millions of Indians remit tens of billions of dollars to India (Economic Times, 2020).

References

- AbuSulayman, A. (1993). Towards an Islamic theory of international relations: new directions for Islamic methodology and thought (Vol. 1). *International Institute of Islamic Thought (IIIT)*.
- AKRAM, E. (2007). Muslim Ummah and its Link with Transnational Muslim Politics. *Islamic Studies*, 46(3), 381-415. May 10, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/20839080
- Allen, C. & J. Nielsen (2002). Summary report on Islamophobia in the EU after 11 September 2001. Vienna: *European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia*
- Arab fury erupts on BJP MP for tweet on women. (2020, April 21). *Telegraph India*. <https://www.telegraphindia.com/india/arab-fury-erupts-on-bjp-mp-for-tweet-on-women/cid/1766686>
- Are the UAE-India ties going adrift after warming relations? (2020, April 20). *TRT World*. <https://www.trtworld.com/magazine/are-the-uae-india-ties-going-adrift-after-warming-relations-35586>
- As the world looks for coronavirus scapegoats, Muslims are blamed in India. (2020, April 23). *Washington Post*. https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/as-world-looks-for-coronavirus-scapegoats-india-pins-blame-on-muslims/2020/04/22/3cb43430-7f3f-11ea-84c2-0792d8591911_story.html
- Beydoun, K. (2016). Between Indigence, Islamophobia, and Erasure: Poor and Muslim in "War on Terror" America. *California Law Review*, 104(6), 1463-1502. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/24915731
- Bleich, E. (2012). Defining and Researching Islamophobia. *Review of Middle East Studies*, 46(2), 180-189. May 9, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/41940895
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3, 77-101. doi:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa.
- Cheng, J. (2015). Islamophobia, Muslimophobia or racism? Parliamentary discourses on Islam and Muslims in debates on the minaret ban in Switzerland. *Discourse & Society*, 26(5), 562-586. May 9, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/26376401
- COVID-19: Misinformation fuels hatred against India's Muslims. (2020, May 6). *Gulf News*. <https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/india/covid-19-misinformation-fuels-hatred-against-indias-muslims-1.1588745600280>
- Desai, R. (2014). A Latter-day Fascism? *Economic and Political Weekly*, 49(35), 48-58. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/24480495
- 'Do not buy from Muslims': BJP leader in India calls for boycott | news. (2020, April 29). *Aljazeera*. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/04/buy-muslims-bjp-leader-india-calls-boycott-200429034119722.html>
- Elias, A. A. (2019, April 29). Hadith on Brotherhood: Believers are one body in their compassion: *Daily Hadith Online* *الحديث اليومي*. May 12, 2020, <https://abuaminaelias.com/dailyhadithonline/2012/03/03/believers-like-body/>
- Fahmy, D. (2015). The Green Scare is not McCarthyism 2.0: How Islamophobia is redefining the use of propaganda in foreign and domestic affairs. *Dialectical Anthropology*, 39(1), 63-67. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/43895903
- Farooqui, M. (2020, April 9). Indian expat sacked, faces jail for insulting Islam in the UAE. *Gulf News*. <https://gulfnews.com/uae/indian-expat-sacked-faces-jail-for-insulting-islam-in-the-uae-1.70892472>
- India Highest recipient of remittances at \$79 bn in 2018. (2019, April 9). *Economic times*. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/nri/forex-and-remittance/india-was-the-top-recipient-of-remittances-worldwide-in-2018/articleshow/70310386.cms?from=mdr>

- India's Muslims feel targeted by rumors they're spreading Covid-19. (2020, April 24). CNN. <https://edition.cnn.com/2020/04/23/asia/india-coronavirus-muslim-targeted-intl-hnk/index.html>
- Kizilbash, H. (1982). The Islamic Conference: Retrospect and Prospect. *Arab Studies Quarterly*, 4(1/2), 138-156. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/41857622
- Kuchay, B. (2020, April 30). Why Arabs are speaking out against Islamophobia in India. *Aljazeera*. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/04/arabs-speaking-islamophobia-india-200423112102197.html>
- Lancy, L. (2002). Adivasis, Hindutva and Post-Godhra Riots in Gujarat. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 37(48), 4844-4849. Retrieved May 9, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/4412907
- Locked down India sees surge in anti-Muslim rhetoric, attacks. (2020, April 21). *Arab News*. <https://www.arabnews.com/node/1662376/world>
- MEA slams Pakistan, Malaysia, Turkey's statements. (2020, October 4). *First Post*. <https://www.firstpost.com/india/mea-slams-pakistan-malaysia-turkeys-statements-on-kashmir-at-unga-says-imrans-call-for-jihad-provocative-irresponsible-7452911.html>
- MN, P. (2020, April 16). India hospital segregates Muslim and Hindu coronavirus patients. *Aljazeera*. aljazeera.com
- Moosavi, L. (2015). Orientalism at home: Islamophobia in the representations of Islam and Muslims by the New Labour Government. *Ethnicities*, 15(5), 652-674. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/24811014
- No entry for Modi into US: visa denied. (2005, March 18). *Times of India*. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/No-entry-for-Modi-into-US-visa-denied/articleshow/1055543.cms>
- Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16(1), 1609406917733847.
- Puranam, E. (2020, May 2). India Muslims targeted in attacks over coronavirus. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/05/india-muslims-targeted-attacks-coronavirus-200502141834870.html>
- Runnymede, T. (1997). Islamophobia: A Challenge for Us All. London: *The Runnymede Trust*.
- Saudi Arabia unwilling to back OIC ministers' meeting on Kashmir. (2020, February 6). *Dawn*. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1532746>
- Saudi scholar calls for expulsion of Hindu supremacists from the Gulf – Middle East Monitor. (2020, April 17). *Middle East Monitor*. middleeastmonitor.com
- Shakoor, F. (1993). Babri Mosque and India's Secularism. *Pakistan Horizon*, 46(2), 43-54. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/41393425
- Shariff, O. (2020, April 22). Indian embassies in Gulf states warn against hateful messaging. *Gulf News*. gulfnews.com
- Stop Indian media from exporting hate to Gulf. (2020, May 6). *Gulf News*. <https://gulfnews.com/opinion/editorials/stop-indian-media-from-exporting-hate-to-gulf-1.71355769>
- Sundar, N. (2004). Teaching to Hate: RSS' Pedagogical Programme. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 39(16), 1605-1612. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/4414900
- Teltumbde, A. (2014). More Than Secularism. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 49(19), 10-11. May 9, 2020, www.jstor.org/stable/24479570
- Three more Indians in UAE face action over Islamophobic social media posts. (2020, May 2). *Gulf News*. gulfnews.com
- Why Gulf States Are Backtracking on India. (2020, May 5). <https://foreignpolicy.com/2020/05/05/gulf-states-backtracking-india/>