A Comparative Analysis of Implementation Outcomes and Consequences of e-Governance Reforms in Education and Police Departments in District Mardan (2013-2017)

Safia Jawad *   Brekhna Gul †   Younas Khan ‡

Abstract: Nowadays, electronic governance has got importance due to its significant role in both developed and developing states ushered as a modern tool of governance. The core aim of e-Governance is to supervise and ease governance for residents, government, and businesses. There are basically four types of e-government services provided: Government to Business (G2B), Government to Government (G2G), Government to Citizen (G2C), and Government to Employee (G2E) along with Electronic-Right to Information (E-RTI). In all provinces of Pakistan E-G and E-RTI have been applied. This research has undertaken the less developed area under district government within the jurisdiction of the provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa for the purpose of assessing the worth of implemented e-governance reforms package by actors dominating national politics.

Introduction

The word governance has been derived from Latin and ancient Greek, and the real meaning is to control, manipulate and guide. Its meaning had long been overshadowed by using the connotation of government and was largely used for administering citizen matters and political functions under national authority. During the 1990s, it was converted into unusual and modern meaning by western political thinkers, scholars, and researchers. The word then has been practiced much more as compared to the ancient times and is entirely different from what was the mindset of people towards the literal meaning of government. It is simply in use by people in various European languages except for a prior political terminology; it is commonly used mutually for social, economic, and defensive aspects of the state.

The World Bank practiced the word "crisis in governance" for the very first time in 1989 due to severe political turmoil in Africa._(Keping, 2018) After that, governance as a word has been particularly used in the studies of political development in a significant manner for highlighting the weak political statuesque of developing states. Different thinkers and analysts belonging to different regions laid down five vital propositions for governance as a theory. 4) Governance emphasizes the significance of independent self-governing networks of actors. A self-government community as such has the authority to issue orders in a positive sphere and work with the government and share its duties for publication administration

They are as follows 1) Governance is regarded as a comprehensive set of actors and institutions which can be drawn from additionally previous regimes. It puts up an interrogation mark on the authority of the country or the government within the conventional terms and continues that the government doesn't remain the only best power center of a country. So long as the power practiced by using public or personal groups has been identified through the general public, it is feasible to become a power center to a specific degree.2) Governance also identified the camouflaged limitations and obligations for

---

* Lecturer, Department of Political Science, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, KP, Pakistan.
† Lecturer, University College for Women, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, KP, Pakistan.
 Email: brekhanagul@awkum.edu.pk
‡ Assistant Professor, Islamia College University, Peshawar, KP, Pakistan.

tackling many different issues like social, religious conspiracies along with economic troubles. It suggests that, in modern-day society, the nation is shifting its once special duties for civilians (i.e., volunteer or private zone organizations that might be considering increasingly duties that have been vivaciously inside the arms of the country). As an end result, the bounds among the states and society and among public and private sectors are getting increasingly more blurred, as pertaining to the meaning of their duties. 3) Governance has been determined by the power reliance concerned in the relations among institutions linked in collective motion. It has to negotiate to rely no longer only on the sources of a single sector, but also pertaining to the rules and principles of the game and the existing surroundings wherein the change occurred .4) government emphasizes the significance of the independent self-governing bodies or agents coloured the network. An autonomous governing community who are entitled to grant orders and guidelines in a positive way and functioned along with the particular regime and performed its duties an ardent of serving sound administration of public affairs 5) Governance focused upon the ability to accomplish the targeted goals and without relying on the command of the government or implement its power and authority. In the arena of mass affairs management, there are various management equipment and strategies, and the government has the duty to apply them to persuade and look after public affairs. ([Stoker,1999](#)). Initially, the most essential or maybe crucial distinction among them is that governance needs power, not just like government; this authority does no longer always assumed through various organs of the specific regime. But the strength and power of government always rested in the country. The frame of government has always portrayed the general public institutions as a whole working in a society, at the same time as the frame of governance can be seen by both private and public institutions or maybe coordination and cooperation among them

, i.e., government along with non-governmental organizations, which can be cooperative, compulsory or voluntary. Efficient governance refers to the management of public affairs and dealing aimed to maximize public welfare and interest. Most essential feature related to an essential type of mutually supportive and collaborative efforts towards public affairs practiced by state and its residence and a fresh connection among state and human society, as the optimum state of them both. The entire perspectives of sound and good governance, we can visualize the core six features:

1. Legitimacy may be referred to as state or high-quality due to which social setup and power are deliberately identified, managed, and followed. Legality is ensured with the help of written rules and procedures.

2. Transparency; It referred to the exposure of all related political records. All residents are enabled to the data on state rules which are associated with their specific means and interests, like legislative function, policy formulation, policy implementation, financial administration, and furthermore public expenditure and different applicable relevant facts. Transparency calls for the foreknown political testimony to be dully propagated to residents with the help of numerous media channels so they may take part in the policy-making process and steward the method of public management in a powerful way.

3. The accountability approach retains everyone accountable for one's personal conduct. In the arena of public management, it refers especially to the responsibilities associated with a positive role or institution and its corresponding duties. Accountability stands that administrative branches and organs need to satisfy the features and ensure obligatory acts related to the positions they possess. If they neglect to meet their assigned capabilities or responsibilities, and if they accomplish that in an accurate way, their particular behaviour results in the dilapidation of obligation or loss of accountability.

4. The rule of law basically means that law is the best principle in public political management that ought to be discovered through all government officers and residents, who should try to be identified earlier than the law. The prior aim of the law is to check, mold, and regulate residents' conduct, control social dealings and hold a regular order in social existence, while its remaining aim is to defend citizens' fundamental rights, whether political, social, economic, educational, etc., which includes fraternity and freedom.

5. *Responsiveness* is firmly linked with the above-mentioned concept pertaining to accountability. It is stretching of accountability in the other sense. Essentially, it means that public administrators and administrative organs must respond to the needs and demands of citizens within time and in a responsible manner tended to ensure further

effectiveness. 6) Effectiveness is especially referred to as management performance. It has to stand in various important values such as rational management in the light of reshaping manner, scientifically administrative strategies and bendy administrative functions and overcoming on administrative costs. Subsequently, correct and good governance is naturally mingled with democratic system democratic regimes.

In an autocratic setup, it is feasible to stress upon accurate government when the particular system is at its exceptional. However, it isn't possible to have sound and good governance. The term Good Governance is a valuable concept that applies that governance can be strengthened, reformed, and sharpened. Governance has three main working dimensions like process, content, and services or deliverables. (Mander, 2004)

Excellent and organized governance can most effectively be carried out in a restricted free environment and stable political system because it cannot originate without freedom and a truly democratic nature.

Democratic culture is the most vital feature of the newly globalized world. The democratic pattern can be perceived in numerous ways, public awareness process towards their primary role in sound administration and efficient governance. Governance measures to improve transparency and accountability of bureaucrats and to enhance and improve urban society activities as well as rural societies. In a democracy, every individual can participate in politics through freedom of expression on different political issues, may debate and even give his/her opinion on public affairs, by using the vote in the election, being a part of any particular political organization or political party, portfolio in the democratic election. Every party, after becoming empowered, tends to cope with different problems. Political parties always remain the core of debates and discussions about reforms and change in society or state. The main institutions of democracy are political parties. For that purpose, political parties initiate specific agendas in their tenure. Generally, political parties start with education and health. Every Child's Right to education is clearly mentioned in Article 25A of the constitution of Pakistan. "The political structure of a society, accepting all elements and factors influencing mutual decisions, the political system thus consisting procedures of recruitment and the process of socialization resulted by social movements, parties, and voters which was not a formal part of the regime." (Easton)

The strategic goal of e-Governance is to guide and simplify governance for residents, businesses, and civil servants along with the government. The riding pressure can also be a public call for online services and data that increase democratic participation, responsibility, transparency, and the quality and velocity of services. E-government refers to the working pattern of ICT by public administrators, politicians, or any other authorized entity entitled to institutional change to enhance efficiency, boost up the quality of services and ensure people's participation in the democratic system. (Makarava, 2011).

The riding forces can also be a public call for online services and information that enhance democratic participation, responsibility, accountability, transparency, and the quality and velocity of services. The World Bank practiced the word "crisis in governance" for the very first time in 1989 due to severe political turmoil in Africa. (Keping, 2018) There are total of 48 plus countries around the globe exercising e-governance reforms along with Pakistan. E-governance culture is adopted by the previous PTI regime in 2014 in overall departments working as an administrative unit. Usually, those methods of delivering data are termed as records technology or "IT." Use of its far made in government centres is a good way to generate a technique that is effective in operating, rapid in reaction, and obvious in outlook. (Ilyas, 2016). but the increase of e-governance varies from country to country and from one place to another concerning degree in their preparedness that pertains to availability and the character and stage of ICT use, and in appreciation of getting ready and presenting service at the desires and ease of resident (Hoque,2005). In the arena of mass affairs management, there are various management types of equipment and strategies, and the government has the duty to apply them to persuade and look after public affairs. (Stoker, 1999)

This research has undertaken the less developed area under district government within the jurisdiction of the provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa for the purpose of assessing the worth of implemented e-governance reforms package by actors dominating national politics. This study is confiding to two main departments, education and police, in KP district Mardan.

Major Outcomes of E-Governance Reforms in Education

Department in KP District Mardan

- total 101 data became open to the public by the implementation of e-governance reforms.
- Due to IMU reports and research analysis, find out the gradual change that has been occurred in past tenure from 2014 to 2018.
- In 2014 total ratio of closed schools or ghost schools was 7% while reduced to 0.78 in 2018.
- In 2014 illegal occupied schools (wholly) were 6 and now turned to 02 in 2018.
- In 2014 illegal occupied schools (partially) were 11 but came to 02 in 2018.
- In 2014 teaching staff absentee were 25 to 30%became low to 15% in 2018.
- In 2014 non-teaching staff absentee was 14% converted into 4.75% in 2018.
- According to 2014 reports, those schools which are lacking teaching staff were 25% reduced to 0% in 2018. It shows that teachers have recruited fulfilling requirements and concentration on merit allocation as well.
- In 2014 students without stipends were 8%, but now 0% in 2018.
- In 2014 electricity nonavailability was 328 means 18.82% while in 2018, it is covered up to 104 means 5.71%.
- In 2014 water nonavailability was 120 means 6.88%, and became 19 means 1.04% in 2018.
- Those schools which weren't covered by boundary wall were 82 (4.70%) in 2014 while turned in to 10 (0.54%) in 2018.
- IMU has also converted six non-functional schools into functional or operational schools in district Mardan with the help of information communication technology as the main direct connection channel between institutions and government.
- Two schools buildings were also reconstructed due to their worst condition.
- Schools are also linked with their local police station for tackling trouble situations. The Head of the school will make a call on a specific number to inform the police staff rendering their services to maintain law and order conditions, ensuring peace and tranquillity in that particular locality with the help of e-governance.
- Regular teacher training is started aimed to enhance education standards in schools to produce a significant outcome in student compatibility.
- IMU has also conducted surveys to verify those students who enrolled in government schools from private schools through this government schools status will be further properly weighted age for future planning and policy formulation process to bring and contribute more effectively in the education sector as the main pillar in generating active, competent citizens for the state.
- The entire staff of IMU uploaded all relevant reports and data to the main server during their monitoring per month which is further maintained by concerned computer operators and conveyed to the head office without any minor change. This e-governance pattern ensured transparency and accountability without any hurdle.
- The district steering committee was made to punish those who were lacking in performing their assigned duties within time. Many teaching personnel was warned and punished by DSC. This action removed ambiguity regarding the gap between theory and practice in the context of information communication technology.
- Parent-Teacher Council has been made to ensure close, in-depth collaboration among teachers and parents to solve study-oriented problems of students. The establishment of this council is fruitful in the removal of harsh traditional attitudes by teachers towards both students and parents.

Consequences

- In district Mardan biometric system is installed only in higher secondary schools both male and female along with colleges but still, primary and middle schools are deprived of this system because of limited budget and financial crisis. KP government allotted a limited budget to the district government prior to the installation of a biometric system in higher secondary schools at Mardan.
- Instead of Independent Monitoring Unite, still concerned staff of the DEO office lacked professional skills and public dealing as compared to the DPO office.
- No doubt, teacher absentee is controlled by the application of information communication technology, but still,

teaching methodology is not as effective as compared to trained police staff with the initiative of e-governance reforms.

Major Outcomes of E-Governance Reforms in Police Department in KP

District Mardan

Electronic reforms introduced and implemented as a whole in police department i-e Registration or digitization of FIRs, Vehicle Verification System (IVS), Identification Verification System (IVS), Criminal Record Verification (CRV), Police Access Service (PAS), and Police Assistance Line (PAL), SOS (Save or Solve system) and Geo Tagging

- From 2009 up till now, a total of 132888 FIRs are registered and digitized forever, which removed the threat of record expiration, all data rendered safe for future perspective.

- For Vehicle Verification System, from 2015 to 2018 total of 74 SIMs were issued for this process. 910655 vehicles were checked, and 583 were found suspected under CRPC. In 583 suspected vehicles, 59 were confirmed as a stolen vehicle under 411 PPC (section 411 of Pakistan Penal Code is about a car stolen), and 353 vehicles declared under 419/420 PPC that used in criminal and terrorist activities.

- Under the Identification Verification System (IVS), from 2015 to 2016, in the duration of one year total of 4 SIMs were granted for checking procedure 34 suspected persons were detained out of 222061. But from 2017, this service was blocked because of departmental issues raised in other linkage departments. Actually, police were in search of social criminals; NADRA was performing the task to access Afghanis living in Pakistani territory whose CNIC had been cancelled by the government, and the army (GHQ) was in search of those suspected persons who were involved in terrorist activities. Both three departments were linked with each other with the implementation of IVS with the special addition of a Barcode reader. At a time, IVS was practiced by police and beneficial for the army, NADRA and agencies as well. The relevant information was also provided by DSB (District Special Branch) and other secrete agencies, which further provide data about suspected people. Electronic governance created mistrust among the police and military during the checking process with the help of IVS at Jhalakai check post of Abbottabad district in which suspected persons were automatically marked in army main DHQ server, but those people were not ranked in that category ambiguity was created between army and police. The army gets annoyed by the police that they are using this device for their own interest. The army's forceful attitude showed the drawbacks of e-governance, and IVS was blocked in this regard.

- From 2015 to 2018 total of 70 CRVS SIMs were allotted for Criminal Record Verification Systems. With the help of CRVS total of 1018 out of 1196910 persons were declared offenders up till now and referred for the court trial.

- Police Access Service was started in 2017 through which people are directly typing messages to DPO. There is a total of 2025 complaints, 1989 replies were made on time, 1965 complaints were resolved, and just 24 are pending due to biased information. This showed a sudden change in the elite responses towards the masses.

- Police Assistance Line was established in 2015 to cope traditional way of dealing by police in various public matters. Different cost-free services were provided to the masses, i-e, misplacement of things, mass facilitation, vehicle verification, Tenant information, Tenant registration (KP government did a new act pertaining to rent registration if FIR captures anyone failed in rent payment within 10 days). Driving license verification, every form is available free, and submission is also free. Receptions facilitated total of 58579 people, 16850 clearness certificates were issued, 4627 legal advisers have been given,274 arms licenses were issued, a total of 80330 services were granted to the masses without any bargaining.

- The establishment of the Police Assistance line removed the traditional code of conduct by police in public dealing with the slogan of serving humanity without money.

- SOS (Save or Solve system) service is also available. Special software was made due to which relevant App is installed in the Android mobile phone of head of the institution by the police department in all other institutions both governmental and non-governmental to tackle the problem on the spot lessen the threat of destruction. The local police station is in touch with all governmental and non-governmental

organizations with the help of SOS service to defend them in trouble.

- The geotagging initiative is also taken by the police department. Under the police department at the district level, there are five circles of administration. In each circle, there are two trained operators, and 2 to 4 police stations came in the jurisdiction of one circle. DSP is in charge of each circle along with SHOs. All schools, Colleges, Universities, hospitals, NADRA, banks, money, and jewelry shops are tracked on a location basis with the help of a Google map installed in the main computer of all authorised offices and computer lab of the DPO office with red symbol inclined towards targeted location In district Mardan, 1815 governmental institutions and 691 private institutions collectively 2506 institutions are traced with the help of Google map and relevant information was provided to all police heads, inspectors and staff, they can easily be reached at the interrupted place by an offender with the help of this geotagging.

Consequences

Besides major contribution, there are some consequences which are as under:

- The online FIR system has been with drawl because of improper use of this facility. Full and accurate information wasn't provided by the claimant, which in turn created problems due to biased information. Online FIR service is not applicable due to masses illiteracy towards modern electronic governance.
- TETRA system is still not operated in district Mardan.
- In 2015 Identification Verification System (IVS) was introduced and worked. This system produced fruitful results but was blocked in 2017 due to the emergence of departmental issues among police and military in the Jhalakai check post.

Major Outcomes of E-Governance Reforms in the form of E-RTI as Main Check upon all Government Departments and Public Bodies.

The KP provincial assembly has been passed the RTI Act. In response to this, the RTI Commission has been established as an autonomous body presided by KP Chief Information Commissioner, other staff like RTI Commission, and two Commissioners as well. The seat of Public Information Officers (PIO) has been organized by

each public body under the light of K-P RTI laws and regulations are responsible for the implementation process of these laws and procedures. The main offerings of E-RTI are E-complaint, E-recruitment, E-showcase which in turn ensure transparent recruitment process focuses on merit and expert coping the main societal evils like nepotism, corruption, and partiality-RTI is working as a watchdog of government with the speedy correspondence made by public when they challenge and show grievances towards any suspicious appointment or favour.

Role of E-RTI in Education and Police Department

Further, E-RTI will be more helpful in the appointment procedure of well-trained and competent staff in both education and police departments bitterly practice e-governance instead of those talented and deserving candidates among the masses have also been recruited in both departments from 2015 till now. These two departments will become more stable with the application of this E-initiative.

Conclusion

A few impediments blocking the effective working capacity of information communication technologies under the light of e-governance like illiteracy towards the use of ICTs, weak feedback, insufficient finance, and cultural embargoes are coping with the working nature of e-governance. Instead of huge contribution here is also few consequences as an outcome of E-governance practices in both Education and Police department such as occurrence of department clashes with other departments due to misunderstanding (Identity Verification System), presence or attendance oriented rather than efficiency / expertise (biometric attendance system) and information ambiguity leads to negative image of Civil servants in the eyes of superior officials (Police assess service).

In a nutshell, information communication technologies have greater impacts on the right governance. In district Mardan, the basic services of e-governance reforms are serving well. Like G2G: Government to Government> Federal government to Provincial Government and Provincial Government to District Government. Like G2C: Government to citizen>Polices Assess Service, websites for online complaints But G2C is not working properly online FIR system is blocked. Feedback channels are also not following so due to illiteracy towards the use of electronic governance tools. So G2C is still not accurately applicable in district Mardan.

Like E-RTI: Electronic Right to Information has started working in all departments and institutions at district Mardan

Instead of G2B, the three main services, G2G, G2B, and E-RTI, are serving in the true sense, and G2C is needed to be implemented by awareness, training, and motivational programmes of masses. Among four services, three services of e-governance proved fruitful in the realm of administration and good governance related to this current research. So it is witnessed that E-governance is more yielding in the way of good governance rather than a paradox to the restoration of good governance in the light of this research.

References

Ilyas, M. (2016). E-Governance Practices And Models; Options For Pakistan. *Institute for Strategic Studies, Research and Analysis (ISSRA)*.

Hoque, S. M. (2005). *E-Governance in Bangladesh: Initiatives and challenged.* Bangladesh: Institute of Bangladesh Studies Rajshahi university.

Keping, Y. (2018, March). Governance and Good Governance: A New Framework for Political Analysis. *Fudan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*.

Pakistan, F. i.-G. (2010). *'Digital Information Management (ICDIM) Fifth International Conference*, (p. 120).

Stoker, G. (1999). Governance as theory: Five propositions. *International Social Science Journal 50, 17–28. (Chinese edition)*.

Survey, U. N. G. (2014). *E-Government for the Future We want.* Press.