

A Quest of Legislative Governance in Pakistan: A Comparative Study of Punjab and Sindh During 2013-2018

Maham Razzaq *

A.D. Hassan Sajanka †

Muhammad Nawaz Shahzad ‡

Abstract: *Governance is commonly considered the use of power and influence by the political elites for the welfare of its citizens. A parallel concept of Good governance is used for a process where public institutions conduct public affairs, manage public resources and guarantee the realization of human rights. The federal form of government is comprised of provinces. If provinces perform properly, the federation considered as secured and supportive. The present study aims to explore and compare a quest for legislative governance in Pakistan and a comparative study of Punjab and Sindh during the period of 2013-2018. A qualitative method with comparative analysis adopted to find the answer of the research questions. It is found out that a close harmony and partnership required among the national and provincial governments in Pakistan. Transfer of power should be in an appropriate way in all stages from federal to local government.*

Key Words: Local Government, Legislature, Power, Authority, Legislation, Sindh, Assembly

Introduction

Originally governance means manipulation, control, and guidance. The word “governance” is derivative from prehistoric Greek and Latin words. Word governance especially refers to political and administrative activities regarding national public affairs. However western political scientists and economists gave it a new meaning in the 1990s. Since then, governance has implicit more than it did customarily and is obvious vary from what the word governance means as a substitute for an absolutely English word, it is commonly used by the people who speak different major European languages; In spite of completely political phrase, it is extensively used in societal trade and industrial field while trying to conclude what was occurring in Africa 1989. The World Bank initially used the word ‘crisis of governance. Since then political development studies has been used this term far and wide, particularly for explaining the political ranking of post-colonial and rising countries. (Keping, March 2018)

In the contemporary world, the words “Governance” and *Good governance*” are frequently employed in the literature where poor or bad governance is considered a core source of all inequity throughout societies. International fiscal institutions are granting aid or loans for ensuring good governance.

The interaction between state and society identify as governance. Governance is a comprehensive concept with broad implications. It has many-sided because of the fast-changing international environment. In this age of globalization, no country can afford an outdated, slow, ineffective, expensive and corrupt system of governance. As governance is an old term in spite of being used increasingly. This term was firstly used in the fourteenth century. It was used in two ways at that time. Firstly means action, way of ruling and second means manner of governing.

Governance has a double meaning as on the one side it means experimental demonstration of state adjustment to its exterior environment which came forward in the late twentieth century. Secondly, it indicates a hypothetical version of harmonization of the public system and for the most part, the function of the state in that course. Generally, it may too refer, to which manner people rule, now the state enforce and administered the affairs as well as political systems of the nation and relation of all these functions to public management and law. A way of government focusing on efficient and answerable institutions, democratic values and electoral procedure, image and accountable institutions of

* Visiting Lecturer, Government College for Women University Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan.

Email: Mahamrazzaq289@yahoo.com

† Visiting Lecturer, Department of Pakistan Studies, Government College University Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan.

‡ Visiting Lecturer, Department of Pakistan Studies, Government College University Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan.

government to make sure an open and legal association between the state and civil society is called 'governance'.

In a wide range, governance includes the presentation of the government together with private and public sectors, national and international measures, official and unofficial standers and performance and structured and unstructured system of management ([Adnan, January - June 2018](#)).

Governance is widely concerned with the political practice that tries to lift the standard of the public to generate an environment for them to enjoy the advantages of independence uniformly. Significant factors such as the political attitude, as well as the aims of diverse governments, the financial policies, the interior and exterior defence of the country and also the interaction with other countries form the kinds of governance:

The study has attempted to denote in a simple way, what the 'governance' and 'good governance' stand for and the principle according that the performance of governance being comprehended and the technique by which social players corporate in special perspective is called good governance as it is a normative notion. In 1980s and 1990s the phrase "Good Governance" appeared. Good Governance is explained in various processes depending upon the institutions like governance whereas Good Governance survives when there is strong growth of organizations defined by the World Bank.

Kaufmann explains that Good Governance can be considered in six contexts as they are: influence and answerability, political solidity, lack of aggression, government efficiency, and lack of

authoritarian burden, control of corruption and rule of law. On the state level, players such as media, lobbyists, global donors, multinational corporations etc. may affect the governance. Expect the government and military all the players to be included as part of civil society. So in a few countries, this civil society includes structured crime syndicates that affect the process of decision-making on the national level and urban level (HUSSAIN, 1993).

Punjab Provincial Assembly 2013-18

The Assembly was set up according to Article 106 of the Constitution 1973 of Pakistan. Punjab Assembly performs three functions administration, public money and policymaking. During the first session members take an oath. Speaker and Deputy Speaker are elected among members of the assembly by the assembly. After this Chief Minister was elected by the president on a specified day in a special session.

Then within 60 days, Chief Minister gains a vote for confidence from the assembly. Punjab Assembly consists of 371 seats and 297 are filled by a direct election. Religious minorities hold 8 seats; women have 66 seats, general seats are 297, the minority have 8. Religious seats are reserved for them ([Lahore, April 11, 2019](#)). The study will focus on a few departments. The Provincial Assemblies elections in Punjab were held on May 11, 2013. Pakistan Muslim League (PMLN) was the winning party in these general elections, PMLN occupied 248 general from the total of 297 seats, and appointed Shabaz Sharif as the Chief Minister of Punjab.

Legislation on Education in Punjab

Table 2. Punjab Government Education Bills

Date	Type	Status	Title
February 16 th , 2018	Government Bill	Passed	The University ⁷ of Sialkot Bill 2018 (Bill No. 9 of 2018)
February 16 th , 2018	Government Bill	Passed	The University of Narowal Bill 2018 (Bill No. 10 of 2018)
January 31 st , 2018	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Tianjin University ⁷ of Technology ⁷ Lahore Bill 2017 (Bill No. 3 of 2018)
January 31 st , 2018	Government Bill	Passed	The University of Veterinary ⁷ and Animal Sciences Bahawalpur Bill 2018 (Bill No. 5 of 2018)
January 30 th , 2018	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Compulsory ⁷ Teaching of the Holy Quran Bill 2017 (Bill No. 1 of 2018)
September 13 th , 2017	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Education Initiatives Management Authority ⁷ Bill 2017 (Bill ' No. 24 of 2017)
May 24 th , 2017	Government Bill	Passed	The Rawalpindi Medical University ⁷ Bill 2017 (Bill No. 12 of 2017)
May 24 th , 2017	Government Bill	Passed	The Faisalabad Medical University Bill 2017 (Bill No. 13 of 2017)
May 24 th , 2017	Government Bill	Passed	The Medical University ⁷ Bill 2017 (Bill No. 14 of 2017)

Date	Type	Status	Title
January 25 th , 2017	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Private Educational Institutions {Promotion and Regulation} {Amendment} Bill 2017 [Bill No. 03 of 2017]
October 19, 2016	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Christian CdIlleze Labora {^uiEiidmEnt} Bill 2016 jBill No. 42 of 2016
August 24 th 2016	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab University OF Hom e Ec od omit s Lab ora Bill 2016 £BillNo. 38 of 2016
February 1 st 2016	Government Bill	Passed	The PuDjab EducatioD FoDDdation {,Am=ndmsDt} Bill 2015 CBdl No. 4 of 2016
February 1 st 2016	Government Bill	Passed	The Fatim a JiDDab Medical University LaborE {,AmEndniEnt} Bill 201 5 ^Bill No. 6 Df 201.6)
October 7 th 201 5	Government Bill	Passed	The PuDjab Frivate- EducatioD al iDstitutions J]Promotion and REEulatioD) {,AmEDdmEDt} Bdl 201 5 £Bdl No. 46 of 2015)
October 7 th 2015	Government Bill	Passed	The Ali InstitutE oFEducation LaborE {,AmEDdmEDt} Bdl 201 5 £Bdl No. 47 oF 2015)
October 7 th 2015	Government Bill	Passed	The Gb azi University, D Era GbazL Kb ed {SecoDd AmEDdmEDt} Bid 2015 ^BillNo. 4B of2015)
August 27 th 201 5	Government Bill	Passed	The Ftmjab T EzhDizal Education, Aad Vocational Train-in an Authority OAmandmaDt) Bdl 201 5 jBdlNo.43 of 2015)
June 10 th 201 5	Government Bill	Passed	Th = Punjab InstitutE of and ^@^t Studias jAmsndmsnt) Bill 2013 jBillNo. 32 of2015)
May 21 st 2015	Government Bill	Passed	The Gb azi University, □ =ra GbazL Kb an {, AmEDdmEDt} Bdl 201 5 £Bdl No. 24 of 2015)

Source-<https://www.pap.gov.pk/>

Legislation in Punjab Assembly on Health

The Punjab government was determined to introduce new reforms in the health sector in the

province, so many bills were presented from time to time and passed and later executed (see table,3).

Table 3. Punjab Government Health Bills

Date	Type	Status	Title
January 3 1 st , 2018	Government Bill	Passed	The Puniab Hepatitis Bill 2017 (Bill ' No. 2 of 2018)
October 25 th , 2017	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Medical Supplies Authority Bill 2017 (Bill No. 32 of '2017)
March 13 th , 2014	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Mental Health [Amendment] Bill 2014 (Bill No. 13 of 2014)
March 13 th , 2014	Government Bill	Passed	The Punjab Reproductive, Maternal, Neo-natal and Child Health Authority Bill 2014 (Bill No. 12 of ' 2014)

Source-<https://www.pap.gov.pk/>

Local Government Performance in Punjab

The Punjab government after the 18th amendment is now responsible for Local Government Affairs and the Punjab assembly has granted authority to legislate for the LG. It has passed different bills and was later implemented for strengthening the local governance.

the time period of the assembly is 5 years. Deputy Speaker and Speaker supervise the house (Sindh, JANUARY 18, 2018).

Sindh Government Education

The provincial government was focused to bring new reforms to amend the educational system in Sindh. The assembly passed different bills (see table, 06)

Sindh Provincial Assemblies 2013-18

The Sindh Provincial Assembly is the legislative body of the province and also represents the province. Sindh Assembly has 168 seats, 130 constituencies, 29 seats are reserved for women and minorities have 9 seats in the assembly. According to the Constitution 1973 Article 52,

Sindh Government Health Reforms

Sindh government focused on the regional health departments and the Sindh Assembly passed many health bills (See table, 7).

Sindh and Punjab Assemblies Performance: A Comparative Analysis 2013-18

The performance of the Sindh government and Punjab government is being discussed for concluding which province has good performance or governance. So three departments are under consideration for the above purpose. As these departments are, Health Department, Education Department, and Local Bodies Department. A comprehensive analysis is given below of Sindh and Punjab's performance in three departments.

- Health Department
- Education Department
- Local Bodies Department

Sindh has been countering different issues including poverty, unemployment, corruption and terrorism. In 2010, the government conceded the 18th Amendment to the constitution. Due to the 18th amendment parliament became more powerful and provinces gained more autonomy. After this amendment education, local bodies and health departments have been shifted to the provinces so that all the provinces took measures for the betterment of these sectors by offering greater satisfaction to the taxpayers.

Health Department of Sindh

The government of Sindh planned Health Sector Strategy 2012-20 for the betterment of the health status of the public of Sindh. It has the objectives of defining service delivery, health managing information, human resources, medical commodities, machinery and vaccines, financing and leadership. This also offers a planned framework to get these purposes. The new program required an investment of Rs 318 billion in the health department especially towards new fiscal systems to minimize out of pocket expenses by the poor. The plan also gave particular stress on the development of districts and urban Primary Health Care.

The under-developed districts will be offered minimum Delivery Services Packages in every unit as well as Essential Service of Health Packages in the district's headquarters for secondary care. Unlike the other areas of the country, Sindh's performance is not good in infant mortality, maternal mortality, nourishment of children, child and maternal anaemia, food insecurity and utilization of the government health resources. Sindh's health department is divided into three sectors: Primary, Secondary and Tertiary.

- Primary health facilities in Sindh 1782
- Public-Private Partnership is 114

- Health facilities with PPHI are 1013
- Number of health facilities with Health Department 655
- The total number of health facilities in Secondary Health Care is 90.
- 14 DHQ hospitals are serving in 29 districts
- Tertiary level health facilities are 8
- 4,500 doctors are in the departmental health
- 6500 posts of doctors are vacant
- Only 4 professors are available at Jinnah Post Graduate hospital [\[Mahmud, 02 February 2011\]](#)

Punjab Health Department

18th Amendment has changed the main federal and provincial health terms and conditions through the legislative list. This amendment allocated more powers and autonomy to the provincial health sector. The government of Punjab had taken effective and comprehensive measures to:

- i. Improve Vaccination Coverage
- ii. make certain protected deliveries
- iii. Development of functionality of primary healthcare capabilities

Following are the steps were taken by the Punjab government:

- The "Prime Minister National Health Program" was launched.
- Health budget 81%, Rs 62 Billion in 2015-16
- The health budget increased Rs 112 billion in 2017-18.
- Budget for specialized healthcare and medical education 66%, Rs 74 Billion in 2015-16 and Rs 123 Billion in 2017-18
- National Health Insurance Scheme was launched in 19 districts of Punjab.
- National Health assurance Scheme aims to register 7.1 million deprived families in Punjab
- The Punjab Government allocated 5.67 Billion rupees for Hepatitis 2016-19
- Punjab Government introduced the 2017 Ordinance
- Passed Punjab Blood Transfusion Act 2016
- Establishment of Bacteriology lab
- Establishment of 108 Hepatitis Clinics across Punjab
- Licensing initiated for Barbers and salons
- Tuberculosis Control Programme and establishment of 125 public sector hospitals all over Punjab

- Punjab Government set up 22 HIV Centers
- 45000 posts were upgraded for the Lady Health Supervisors by the provincial government
- Punjab launched Non- Communicable Disease Control program
- The immunization program is launched by the provincial government.
- Punjab Government set up Punjab Public Health Agency
- 2520 BHU's
- Establishment of Mobile Health Units
- Steps for Reduction in Maternal and Infant Mortality
- Lessening in populace Growth Rate
- There are 26 DHQs at the districts level and 99 THQs at the Tehsil level working in Punjab.

Revamping of Secondary Level Health Facilities

There are DHQs (26) at the district level and THQs (99) at the Tehsil level that were operating in the many districts of Punjab. The Punjab government has approved 40 billion rupees for refurbishing and progression of hospitals across Punjab. A total of 25 DHQ and 15 THQ hospitals in phase 1 were revamped. In the next phase, the restructuring program was projected to flatten to the enduring 85 hospitals (1 in DHQ and 84 in THQs).

A total of 13,700 doctors' positions were announced and created in various THQs and DHQs. All DHQ hospitals were facilitated CT scan services and Hemo-dialysis, x-ray machines and dental hospitals were procured same as completely operational ICUs- cum -CCUs were established in all hospitals. At present, almost 85% of health care is freely available for patients. About 27 services were acquired ISO- 9001 and ISO 14001 certification.

The government inaugurated burn units in various hospitals in Lahore, Multan and Faisalabad and 205 beds, ICUs, HDUs and OTs were also provided for these units. A Surgical Tower at Mayo Hospital, 120-bedded Cardiology and Cardiac Surgery block and a Kidney Transplantation and Dialysis Unit at Bahawal Victoria Hospital and in Wazirabad district 10-bedded Institute of Cardiology was established. In Phase I, "Recep Tayyip Erdogan teaching Hospital" in Muzaffargarh and a nine-storey block has been established in Services Hospital.

In 2017, a 400-bedded Children's Hospital in Lahore was upgraded with new 680 beds and OTs (16) were also added. A 150-bedded Children's

Hospital in Multan was upgraded and added 150 beds. In Faisalabad, Children's Hospital added 200-beds was inaugurated. The "Punjab Institute of Neurosciences" with more than 500-bed facilities, is also operational. The Punjab government also erected two "Regional Blood Centers (RBCs)" in South Punjab districts Multan and Bahawalpur in collaboration with the German Government. It would work for blood banking, screening, and supply.

To sustain this growth recruitment of medical staff in the numerous hospitals;

- Nurses, 7787
- Medical Officers, 2723
- Senior Registrars, 262
- Assistant Professors, 122
- Associate Professors, 96
- Professors, 30

However more hiring was made, 12947 new posts were created for care facilities

- Biomedical Engineers, 77
- paramedics, 1129
- Nurses, 5380
- General Doctors, 4988
- Specialist Doctors, 345
- Senior Registrars, 679
- Assistant Professors, 149
- Associate Professors, 131
- Professors, 69

Overall an increase of beds (4500) had done in last year. A "State of the art Pakistan Kidney & Liver Institute" was inaugurated in Pakistan designed according to Commission International (JCI) Standards.

Punjab Government Steps towards Medical Education

The Punjab government focused on medical education to meet the requirements of the growing population.

- Upgraded 4 medical colleges to universities
- 10 new nursing schools
- 6 allied health schools
- 5 nursing schools are upgraded to colleges
- 6 health universities
- 11 medical and dental colleges
- 35 teaching hospitals
- 6 medical universities are working in Punjab
- 14 specialized hospitals
- 57 nursing schools

- 70 institutes for paramedics
- 8 institutes of allied health sciences
- Punjab Government enlarged the standard postgraduate programmers from 211 to 547 in the last two years
- Establishment of Districts Healthcare Authorities in 36 districts of Punjab [Mati, June 1, 2018]

Sindh Education Department

The Education Department of Sindh has also been encountering various challenges. Government of the Sindh 2013-18 has set four types of parameters to enhance this department:

- Development of equal access to quality ECE, primary and secondary education with the purpose of finishing social exclusion, promoting transitions, enhancing social cohesion and providing the best chances of access, contribution and learning to marginalized groups, especially girls.
- Developing the levels of learning outputs by strengthening the procedure of learning and teaching.
- Enhancing the functioning capability from the school-community level up to the provincial and districts level by empowering governance and services delivery.
- Developing the equity of resources allotment and enhancing the financial sustainability or efficiency of educational expenses.

Sindh Education Department adopts many trends but there has been no discernable achievement in the ratio of middle and high school. Students' enrollment remained very small. Learning outcomes are very slow but stable and substantial [Channa, 2019] al. Punjab Provincial Government has been working on the education department by using wide-ranging resources and energy. Reforms Agenda is also working in Punjab regarding this department since 2001, then in 2011 and finally late in 2016 [Aziz, January 2014]

Punjab Education Sector Reform program

It is started to provide a comprehensive systematic analysis of issues and gaps.

Punjab commonly has strengthened in education among all the provinces. The NEAS show that Punjab has the best score sheet than the rest of the country. Rationalization of teaching staff is the first work that was started in the province at the district level. For shaping the

advantageous and dynamic circle for reforms, there is powerful political will exists. Punjab has also been a revolutionary province in transferring its strategic focus towards 'quality' unlike the traditional approach of restrictive reforms to recovering access. There is a lot of vacuum for improving the educational level regional wise. Secondly, there are many differences in all the districts of the province. Poor maintenance and evolution levels expose problems regarding the quality of education services and inner insufficient in the school education department.

- There is also a quality gap in both the provinces according to the SED analysis report.
- Deficiency of incorporated information systems and research-based strategy planning and info cementation.
- The lack of standards administration and efficient monitoring schemes has caused low management and answerability.
- Shortage of capacity in terms of field expertise in the department for policymaking planning, administration and delivery procedure.
- Lack of coordination among provincial departments.
- Challenges and requirements according to the situation are faced by both provinces.
- Extensive approval procedure, shortage of capacity and an efficient monitoring for managing funds and autonomously inter-nation donors links to the instability of reforms.

Punjab's performance was good as compared to Sindh as Punjab's primary enrolment level is 62% and Sindh's primary enrolment level is 15% [Shaheen, 2013].

Conclusion

This study was conducted to explore the performance of provincial assemblies in the three departments for suggesting a track for policymakers; in this concern, a number of research articles and books were revised. It is also observed the gaps in governance in Pakistan. According to the 18th amendment of 2010, the provinces got more autonomy and powers were transferred to the provinces. But the performances of provinces are getting affected by governance issues. So, to check the governance level, it is necessary to check the governance issues with accountability, responsiveness and participants etc. Issues in governance emerged due to the gaps and deficiencies. These gaps may be financial gaps, executive issues, internal disputes and country power.

Sindh and Punjab, both are having such types of gaps and issues. But both have introduced reforms to tackle these issues. This research examines both performances of provinces and then compare them with each other to evaluate which province is going well in three departments. As these departments are education, health and local bodies. Sindh and Punjab's comparative study shows the good performance of Punjab. But the performance of Sindh in the Health department is better compared to Punjab province.

Punjab province has passed 08 bills on health, 37 on education and 11 on local bodies are 11 while Sindh province has passed bills 08 on health, 36 on education and 11 on local bodies'. In Punjab during the 2013-2018 education sectors, performance at the top was strong as compared to Sindh. Conversely, Punjab always ranks top on the score sheet than the rest of the country. Punjab improved its education system by not passing laws, but also implementing them. However, there are also some issues facing Sindh

and Punjab education departments that are quality education, regional level educational differences, insufficient infrastructure and poor maintenance regarding teachers and students. Sindh enrollment in education is good, but input results are not good.

There is also insufficient faculty in Sindh institutes contrasting Punjab. Sindh's performance in the health department was excellent as it had introduced an immunization program and banned unregistered clinics across the provinces. Sindh has increased the health budget and has completed different projects as they were delayed. The two provinces were facing coordination problems at the regional level. Sindh also increased the number of universities as compared to Punjab. Both provinces initiated a monitoring system, but it has failed due to improper implementation. The performance of Punjab remained better as compared to Sindh.

References

- Adnan, M., & Fatima, B. (2018). Political, economic and social governance in Pakistan: its practices and issues. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 55(1).
- Channa, Z. A. (2019). School Education Sector Plan And Roadmap for Sindh (2019 - 2024). Sindh.
- Keping, Y. (March 2018). Governance and Good Governance: A New Framework for Political Analysis. *Fudan J. Hum. Soc.*, 1-8.
- Lahore, P. P. (April 11, 2019). www.pakinformation.com. Lahore.
- Mahmud, S. (02 February 2011). Prevalence of head lice and hygiene practices among women over twelve years of age in Sindh, Balochistan, and North West Frontier Province: National Health Survey of Pakistan, 1990-1994. Part of Springer Nature.
- Mati. (June 1, 2018). Progress of Punjab Health Department in Last 5 Years Against The Health Manifesto 2013. DND.
- Mehnaz Aziz, D. E. (January 2014). Education System Reform in Pakistan: EconStor.
- Mubeen Adnan, B. F. (January - June, 2018). Political, Economic and Social Governance in Pakistan. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 15,
- Mushahid, H. (1993). *Pakistan Problems of Governance*. New Delhi: Konark Publishers Pvt. Ltd.
- Seidman, J. (February, 2003). *Assessing Legislation - A Manual For Legislators*. Boston, Massachusetts.
- Shaheen, A. J. (2013). Punjab School Education. Lahore: School Education Department.
- Sindh. (JANUARY 18, 2018). *PPP will continue to support democracy*. Daily Times.
- Steffens, A. (2017). Is the good governance approach to combating corruption effective or should other approaches such as good enough governance be considered?: Guatemala: a case study. Leiden University.