



Comparative Analysis of ESL Learning in Public and Private Sectors at Primary Level in District Khairpur



Sonal Khan Maitlo	M. Phil. English (Linguistics), Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.
Akbar Tumrani	PhD in Development Studies, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan.
Perveen Akhter Farhat	Assistant Professor, Department of English, Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Abstract: *The present study comparatively analysis of ESL learning in public and private sectors at the primary level in district Khairpur. The researcher used both qualitative and quantitative methods for data collection. This study was conducted in the district of Khairpur Sindh and the population of the study was educated persons from different areas of district Khairpur. The researchers face to face met 180 educated persons and asked the questions which they have included in the printed questionnaire. The data was gathered and analyzed by using mathematical analysis and presented in the tables. The findings of the study revealed that private-sector primary schools' performance is better than public-sector primary schools' performance regarding ESL learning. The findings also disclosed that the English language as a medium of instruction in private schools enhances ESL learning. While the public sector schools are not using English as a medium of instruction so far behind private sector schools.*

Key Words: ESL Learning, Primary Level Education, Public Sector Schools, Private Sector Schools, Comparative Study

Corresponding Author: Sonal Khan Maitlo (M. Phil Scholar, English (Linguistics), Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: Sonalkhan3634@gmail.com)

Introduction

Humans are naturally societal and gaining information is their basic need which can be achieved in educational institutes. The supremacy of educational enlightenment is felt in the contemporary period because of commercial, societal and educational advancements, and people understand the position of education in this modern age

(Dag, 2015). Pakistani kids are familiar with the English language from the preschool age, in childhood from three to five years of age. Though, English language is 2nd language of Pakistanis, but taught as a core subject in the classrooms from the primary level and seen as an entrance to achieve further education (Ahmad, Shahid & Farhat, 2023). Similarly, English is taught at all educational levels in Pakistan. The presence of the English

language as a subject in the provisional educational syllabus is necessary and directed by the language in educational programs. But, it is non-compulsory for the students to pass this subject to complete their studies at the primary and secondary levels. The English language is widely used in the Pakistani educational system. Rapid change can be seen in the structure of the Pakistani education system to find the requirement of universal standards (Ahmad, Iqbal & Rao, 2023). Shamim, (2008) highlighted tendencies, problems and encounters while attaining English language education in Pakistani settings. These kinds of problems are discussed in this study in detail and the main purpose of this study was to make a comparison between the primary level schools of private and public sectors in district Khairpur Sindh to conclude the result that which sector's performance is better in ESL learning. This was the main objective of this study.

Statement of the Problem

The research problem is principally linked to the analysis of ESL learning in private and public sectors at the primary level of education. The researchers tried to highlight this problem through comparative analysis. The difficulties and complications in the Pakistani educational sector are not new but when Pakistan emerged as an independent country in 1947 poor education system was inherited by Pakistani nation. Unfortunately, we are still facing these problems after 75 years to date. The previous governments have not sufficiently worked for the education sector. But in the contemporary age, some developments are seen. The researchers conducted much research in this field and highlighted problems. The researchers of the present study observed the problem that there is no proper ground for ESL learning in Sindh. So, they decided to conduct research which will prove beneficial for ESL students, ESL teachers, parents, and

private and public sector institutes of all levels.

The Research Questions

- I. Are private sector schools better for ESL learning than public sector schools?
- II. What are the positive and negative points of Private and public schools in ESL learning?

Significant Instead of Limitations

Although the present research study has some limitations regarding the educational levels and faculties as this research work is only limited to primary-level ESL students. The population and sampling of the study and questionnaire are also limited but instead of these limitations, the study is significant. The present research study is worthy because it deals with ESL learning in both types of educational sectors, public and private schools of the primary level. The English language is viewed as an international language and widely used in the world by almost all departments, so this is a desire of every person to learn the English language to attain better chances of progress and to build their future carrier. For this purpose, they take admitted to different institutes for attaining education in the English language. The present study will guide them to choose the best institution for ESL learning to fulfil their purpose.

The Research Gap

Khan, Kazmi & Latif, (2005) in their research study comparatively analyzed the NGOs and private rural primary schools in Pakistan. Zafarullah, et.al, (2016) in their study compared the public and private sector schools in the district Hyderabad of Sindh province. Qadir & Rizwan, (2020) studied the effects of IPA symbols on ESL learning in Hing Oria of district Khairpur Sindh but there is no single research which is conducted on the present topic. The main

focus of the present research work is generally on making a comparative analysis of ESL learning in public and private sectors at the primary level in District Khairpur Sindh. The researchers find this gap and decided to conduct their research work on this topic which was always disregarded in Sindh, especially the district Khairpur area.

Literature Review

The literature review gives numerous advantages as it provides an overall indication of the research framework and discloses what previously has been completed, providing new ideas about your research study. It aids you in determining complications and faults in present research work. It enables us to place our research work in a greater setting, thus we can demonstrate advanced assumptions from our investigations (Knopf, 2006). The literature review comprises ESL learning in Sindh at primary level education, primary education in the private sector, and primary education in the public sector, followed by some previous studies.

ESL Learning in Sindh at Primary Level

The English language is widely used in this global world for the purpose of communication and for communication basically there is an extensive need to learn two creative skills. Among the four skills of language, speaking and writing are considered creative skills of language used to convey messages. The English language is used as a native language in English-speaking countries such as England, America, Canada, Australia, and New Zealand. In other countries of the world English is used as a foreign language abbreviated as EFL while some countries used the English language as a second language abbreviated as ESL, but in Pakistan English is used as a second language so Pakistan is listed as an ESL country.

Ahmad, Farhat, & Choudhary (2022) stated that English as Second Language has great importance principally, and is commonly used in instruction precincts. Sindh is the second largest province of Pakistan and English is widely taught there as a second language on all educational levels. As Qadir & Rizwan, (2020) studied the effects of IPA symbols on ESL learning in Hing Oria of district Khairpur Sindh by using two government schools and four private schools as the population of the study. They take an eighty-five students' sample for this study. He conducted his research on the primary level. Many other researchers led their research on ESL learning in Sindh province on all educational levels which proved the presence of ESL learning in Sindh.

Primary Education in Private and Public Sectors

Education performs an essential role in the progress of a country and develops a living standard of life by providing chances to all persons (Ashraf, & Ismat, 2016). From this statement, there is evident that education is important in life for all humans. No one can progress without education so it is essential for all to acquire education to meet the national and international standards. Ashraf, & Ismat, (2016) stated that it plays a vital role in the accomplishment of a country. So, keeping in mind this statement one must acquire knowledge and education because it increases the literacy percentage which eventually produces employment chances. But unfortunately, the educational sector is alitames ignored by the government's ministries of education and the provincial governments (Ashraf, & Ismat, 2016). On the national and international level there are two categories of schools are found so called private and government schools. Ali & Maqbool, (2021) stated that schools are very significant for making and developing the characters of individuals. The two types of institutes are found in Pakistan and all over

the world. These are public schools and others are private schools.

Private schooling is developing very rapidly since the start of the 21st century and there is seen that admission in private institutes is day by day growing for the reason that their quality of instruction is better than in government schools. Although the educational system of private schools is better than the public sector schools it is very expensive and in a developing country like Pakistan it is difficult for common people to afford high fesses of private schools. But in spite of this reality, some parents are forced to send their children to send them to private schools for the better future of their kids (Ashraf, & Ismat, 2016). Private schools are a challenge for public schools. Zafarullah, et.al, (2016) stated that private school is recognized as a sign of accomplishment and success in the mind and hearts of Sindhi persons. In this contemporary age, private schools are considered better than public schools in all fields (Ali & Maqbool, 2021). In most private schools, the principal is the owner of the school and he wants a better reputation for his school so that more and more students get admitted to his school and his school develops as a profitable institute. This competition between the owners of private schools plays an important role in the development of the education sector (Khan, Kazmi & Latif, 2005).

The private sector of education is not merely perceived as a resolution for the educational difficulties which the Pakistani education system is confronting nowadays (Ashraf, & Ismat, 2016). The governments of all levels for instance central, provincial, and local administrations equally take part in the development of public sector education because public schools are the basic need of our country. Pakistan is a developing country and lacks resources so it is difficult for most of the people to meet both ends of life. This makes it impossible for them to send their children to the private schools. The

government of Pakistan should provide free education chances and scholarships on all levels for students belonging to poor families.

Related Previous Researches

[Al-Duwaila](#), (2012) in his doctoral dissertation in Kuwait compared public and private sector primary-level schools regarding procedures of instruction and students' attainment. Dag, (2015) in his research work compared private and public schools in Turkey results demonstrated that private schools' students performed better than public schools' students in the examinations. [Jokhio](#) & Saeed, (2015) analyzed the part of private English medium schools in developing English-speaking skills in Khairpur district. The research population contained private institutes and sixty teachers were selected as a sample. Two kinds of research tools were used to assemble data. The results revealed that private schools are performing better than public sector schools in English language learning especially English-speaking skills with the help of visual audio practices in ESL teaching space. The private institutions were much more successful than public institutions in imparting English language skills and their performance in the examination is much more spectacular than that of public institutions. Some more related studies were conducted by researchers such as [Arif](#) & Saqib, (2003), the invention of intellectual skills in Pakistani public and private institutes. Khan, (2010), had highlighted the difficulties in universalizing Pakistani primary schooling. [Farah](#) & Rizvi (2007) pointed out insinuations for Pakistani primary schools of public and private sectors. Khan, (2010), suggested some complications in Pakistani primary instruction. But these researches are not enough for the related topic. So there was a need of conducting research which fills the gaps left by the previous researchers in their research works.

Research Methodology

In the present research study, the researchers used both qualitative and quantitative methods for the purpose of data collection. This present research study was conducted in the district of Khairpur, Sindh and the population of the study was educated people from different areas of Khairpur district as Kingri, city Khairpur, Gambit, Rani Pur, Khuhra, Hin Gorja etc. The researchers face to face met 180 different educated persons and asked the questions which they have included in the printed questionnaire. The questionnaire was used as a research instrument and was contained in three parts, part A of the questionnaire contained demographic information of the participants which includes frequency analysis of the participants as their gender, locality and qualifications. Part B of the questionnaire contained six close-ended questions while Part C of the questionnaire contained two open-ended questions. [Ahmad](#), Maitlo & Rao, (2022) used this kind of questionnaire for their study. The data was gathered from the sample size of 180 educated persons and

gathered data was analyzed by using mathematical analysis and presented in the tables.

Results and Discussion

This part of the current study presents the analysis of data and results. In the first part, it shows demographic information about participants. The second part illustrates a frequency analysis of the quantitative data collected from the research participants of the district Khairpur of province Sindh Pakistan. The third part presents a thematic analysis of qualitative data. In the last part, a discussion of the findings is presented.

Demographic Information

Demographic information includes gender, ages and locality of the research participants which were 180 educated persons from the district of Khairpur Sindh. They contributed to the present research work for data collection. Their demographic information is presented in table number one, table number two and table number three below.

Table 1

Genders of the Participants

Participants	Gender	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Female	90	105.9%	105.9%	105.9%
	Male	90	105.9%	105.9%	211.8%
	Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 1 displays that there were a total of 180 (100%) respondents out of these 90 (105.9%)

were female and similarly 90 (105.9%) were male from the district Khairpur Sindh.

Table 02

Ages of the Participants

Participants	Ages	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	25 to 45 yrs.	100	117.6%	117.6%	117.6%
	45 to 60 yrs.	80	94.1%	94.1%	211.8%
	Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 2 presents the age of the research participants, the 100 (117.6%) were between

25 to 45 years old while 80 participants (94.1%) were between 45 to 60 years age.

Table 3

The Locality of the Participants

Participants	Locality	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Urban	90	105.9%	105.9%	.325
	Rural	90	105.9%	105.9%	211.8%
	Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 3 displays, that there were a total of 180 (100%) respondents out of these 90 (105.9%) belonged to urban areas whereas 90 (105.9%) participants belong to rural areas of the district Khairpur Sindh.

Table 4

Private-sector Schools are Better than Public-sector Schools for ESL Learning.

Participants	Statement	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly agree	25	29.4%	29.4%	29.4%
	Agree	130	152.9%	152.9%	182.4%
	Neutral	05	5.9%	5.9%	188.2%
	Disagree	11	12.9%	12.9%	201.2%
	Strongly disagree	09	10.6%	10.6%	212%
	Total	100	100%	100%	100%

Table 04, shows the result related to the statement that “Private sector schools are better than public sector schools for ESL learning”. The 25 (29.4%) strongly agree, 130 (152.9%) agree, 11 (12.9%) disagree, 09 (10.6%) strongly disagree, and 05 (5.9%) remained neutral.

Table 5

Private Sector Teachers’ Level of Proficiency is Better than Public Sector Teachers’.

Participants	Statement	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly agree	43	50.6%	50.6%	50.6%
	Agree	114	134.1%	134.1%	184.7%
	Neutral	10	11.8%	11.8%	196.5%
	Disagree	10	11.8%	11.8%	208.2%
	Strongly disagree	03	3.5%	3.5%	212%
	Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 05, shows the result related to the statement that “Private sector teachers’ level of proficiency is better than public sector teachers”. 43 (50.6%) strongly agreed with the statement, 114 (134.1%) agreed, 10 (11.8%) disagreed, 03 (3.5%) strongly disagreed and 10 (11.8%) respondents remained neutral about the statement.

Table 6*Parents Prefer Private Sector Institutes to Public-sector Institutes for ESL Learning.*

Participants Statement	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly agree	41	48.2%	48.2%	48.2%
Agree	100	117.6%	117.6%	165.9%
Neutral	13	15.3%	15.3%	181.2%
Disagree	19	22.4%	22.4%	203.5%
Strongly disagree	09	10.6%	10.6%	214%
Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 06, shows the result related to the statement that “Parents prefer Private sector institutes to public sector institutes for ESL learning”. The 41 (48.2%) respondents Strongly agree, 100 (117.6%) agree, 19 (22.4%) disagree, 09 (10.6%) strongly disagree, and 13 (15.3%) participants remained neutral about the statement.

Table 7*The Medium of Instruction Plays an Important Role in ESL Learning.*

Participants Statement	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly agree	27	31.8%	31.8%	31.8%
Agree	109	128.2%	128.2%	160.0%
Neutral	09	10.6%	10.6%	170.6%
Disagree	21	24.7%	24.7%	195.3%
Strongly disagree	14	16.5%	16.5%	212%
Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 07, shows the result related to the statement that “Medium of instruction plays an important role in ESL learning”. The 27 (31.8%) participants strongly agreed, 109 (128.2%) agreed, 21 (24.7%) disagreed, 14 (16.5%) strongly disagreed and 09 (10.6%) participants remained neutral about the statement.

Table 8*The Principals of Private Schools are the Owner of the School so They run the School in a Better Way*

Participants Statement	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly agree	39	45.9%	45.9%	45.9%
Agree	124	145.9%	145.9%	191.8%
Neutral	02	2.4%	2.4%	194.1%
Disagree	07	8.2%	8.2%	202.4%
Strongly disagree	08	9.4%	9.4%	212%
Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 08, shows the results related to the statement that “The principals of private schools are the owner of the school so they run the school in a better way”. 39 (45.9%) strongly agreed, 124 (145.9%) agreed, 07 (8.2%) remained disagreed, 08 (9.4%) remained strongly disagree, and 02 (2.4%) respondents remained neutral about the statement.

Table 9

Government should Develop the Public Sector and Make Education Free for Poor People.

Participants	Statement	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly agree	52	61.2%	61.2%	61.2%
	Agree	120	141.2%	141.2%	202.4%
	Neutral	00	0.0%	0.0%	202.4%
	Disagree	05	5.9%	5.9%	208.2%
	Strongly disagree	03	3.5%	3.5%	212%
	Total	180	100%	100%	100%

Table 09, shows the result related to the statement that “Government should develop the public sector and make education free for poor people.”. The 52 (61.2%) respondents strongly agreed, 120 (141.2%) agreed, 05 (5.9%) disagreed, 03 (3.5%) strongly disagreed, and no one remained neutral about the given statement.

Close-Ended Questions

The abstracts were derived from the responses of the research participants from the district of Khairpur Sindh Pakistan. The positive and negative points of both types of institutes are highlighted.

Table 10

The Positive and Negative Points of the Public Sector Institutes for ESL Learning

Public sector institutes	
Negative points	Positive points
<p>The medium of instruction is Urdu and only English subject is taught using English medium instruction.</p> <p>Although teachers are well-educated but not hardworking and there is no proper checking in these schools.</p> <p>Lacking facilities for new technologies.</p>	<p>Low fesses and affordable for poor parents to educate their children, the primary level education is almost free.</p> <p>Everyone can take admission without facing any difficulty or competition.</p> <p>Now a day’s government trying to facilitate students with laptops etc.</p>

The research participants responded to the first open-ended question; the abstracts of their responses are presented in the above table number 10. They see the Urdu language medium of instruction, teachers’ laziness and

lack of facilities as negative points of public sector schools. While low fesses or affordable are seen as a main positive point of these schools.

Table 11

The positive and negative points of the private sector institutes for ESL learning

Private sector institutes	
Negative points	Positive points
<p>High fesses of the private schools.</p> <p>The private sector is unreachable for poor parents. Because they cannot afford fesses.</p>	<p>Medium is English which is very helpful in ESL learning.</p> <p>Teachers are well disciplined; there is a check</p>

Poor parents are often forcefully sending their children to these schools for ESL learning in the best way.

on teachers because the school owners are principals who want to make beneficial their schools.

The research participants responded to the second open-ended question; the abstracts of their responses are presented in the above table number 11. They see the English language as the medium of instruction, well-disciplined teachers' etc. as positive points of private sector schools. While high fees are unaffordable are seen as negative points of private sector schools.

Discussion

The discussion is grounded on the findings of the research questions. In Pakistan, there are two types of schools named as public-sector schools and other one private-sector schools. The first type of institutes are belonging to the government sector and are run or owned by the government, the second type of institutes belong to the private sector often run by NGOs or rich persons for financial purposes. The demographic information of the participants is presented in the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd tables, while table number four to nine are contained close-ended questions to answer the first research question. In the last two tables, open-ended questions are presented to answer the second research question. The abstracts from the responses of the participants were derived and presented in tables. In the close-ended questions mostly, participants agreed about the statements that the private sector institutes are better for ESL learners and ESL learning than the public sector institutes. In the last two tables, most of the research participants regarded the English medium of instruction as helpful and beneficial for ESL learning. The results of the present studies match with the results of many previous studies as they also observed the private educational system is better than the public sector educational system on all educational levels in the world.

Conclusion

It was concluded from the findings of research that in the public sector schools medium of instruction is the Urdu language and only English subject is taught by means of English medium. On the other side in private schools' the English language is used as a medium of instruction from primary level to upward. In this way, private sector schools are more helpful for ESL learners in ESL learning. One more point which is noted is that the private sector schools are run by their owners for commercial purposes, and in most of the private institutes, it is seen that the school owner himself is the principal of the institute. There is a desire of every owner that his institute makes progress more than others and gets fame so that more and more people become attracted to his institute and prefer it for their children's admission. To make his school beneficial he continually checks the teachers while in public schools there is no proper check system.

Recommendations

The government must take forward steps to promote ESL learning at the Primary level and for this purpose, English is essentially used as a medium of instruction in all educational levels similarly as it is used in private schools as a medium of instruction. The teacher must take responsibility and must teach the ESL students in a professional style and prove himself as the best teacher for his students. He needs to be honest with his profession. It is the duty of the school to inform parents about the school activities and progress of their child. It's the duty of the school staff to arrange seminars, instructive discussions and programs in the schools to enhance ESL learning. Scholarships must be awarded to the students and the need to hire

highly qualified staff and English subjects should be made compulsory from 1st class to upward. This research is conducted on the primary level further research can be

conducted on other levels such as middle, and higher levels of education and also in the other fields of education.

References

- Ahmad, A., Farhat, P. A., & Choudhary, S. M. (2022). Students' Insights about the Influence of Text Messaging on Academic Writing Skills. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(4), 522-533. [https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022\(3-IV\)49](https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022(3-IV)49)
- Ahmad, A., Iqbal, B., & Rao, I. S. (2023). Efficacy Of Blended Learning Technique in Enhancing ESL Students' Linguistic Skills. *Global Language Review*, 8(2), 9-21. [http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023\(VIII-II\).02](http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023(VIII-II).02)
- Ahmad, A., Maitlo, S. K., & Rao, I. S. (2022). Teachers' Perceptions on the Use of PowerPoint Presentations in ESL Classrooms at University Level in Lahore. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 6(3), 489-499. [https://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022\(6-III\)42](https://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022(6-III)42)
- Ahmad, A., Shahid, H. S., & Farhat, P. A. (2023). Comparative Analysis of Syntactical Errors in the Writings of ESL Students at Secondary Level in Pakistan. *Global Language Review*, VIII(II), 203-213. [http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023\(VIII-II\).18](http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023(VIII-II).18)
- Ahmad, et.al. (2013). Analysis of the problems of primary education system in Pakistan: Critical review of literature. *Academic Research International*, 4(2), 324-331. <https://www.academia.edu/download/76202349/20134.2-34.pdf>
- Al-Duwaila, A. (2012). *A comparative study between Kuwait's government and private sector primary schools in methods of teaching and pupils' achievement in mathematics* (Doctoral dissertation, Brunel University School of Health Sciences and Social Care PhD Theses).
- Ali, U., & Maqbool, I. (2021). Comparative Analysis of Sindh Education Foundation and Private Educational Institutions: A Case Study of District Khairpur. *Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies*, 14(4), 26-33. <https://www.pacificlibrary.org>
- Arif, G. M., & us Saqib, N. (2003). Production of cognitive and life skills in public, private, and NGO schools in Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 42(1), 1-28. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41260519>
- Ashraf, M. A., & Ismat, H. I. (2016). Education and development of Pakistan: A study of current situation of education and literacy in Pakistan. *US-China Education Review B*, 6(11), 647-654. <https://doi.org/10.17265/2161-6248/2016.11.003>
- Dag, I. (2015). An overview and comparison of Turkish public schools and private schools. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 3(6), 191-196. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1078271>
- Farah, I., & Rizvi, S. (2007). Public-private partnerships: Implications for primary schooling in Pakistan. *Social Policy & Administration*, 41(4), 339-354. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9515.2007.00557.x>
- Jokhio, G. B., & Saeed, A. (2015). Critical analysis of the role of private English medium schools in the development of English speaking skills. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 5(1), 285-295. <https://www.academia.edu>
- Khan, S. B. (2010). Problems in universalization of primary education in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences (PJCSS)*, 4(2), 147-155. <http://hdl.handle.net/10419/188006>
- Khan, S. R., Kazmi, S., & Latif, Z. (2005). A comparative institutional analysis of government, NGO and private rural primary schooling in Pakistan. *The European Journal of Development Research*, 17, 199-223. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09578810500130823>

- Knopf, J. W. (2006). Doing a literature review. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 39(1), 127-132. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1049096506060264>
- Qadir, A., & Rizwan, S. (2020). Effect of International Phonetic Alphabet (IPA) symbols on the English language of Sindhi students. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 17(6), 12974-12985. <https://www.palarch.nl>
- Shamim, F. (2008). Trends, issues and challenges in English language education in Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 28(3), 235-249. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188790802267324>
- Zafarullah, et.al, (2016). Teachers' time management and the performance of students: A comparison of government and private schools of Hyderabad, Sindh, Pakistan. *World Journal of Education*, 6(6), 42-50. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5430/wje.v6n6p42>