Vol. VIII, No. I (Winter 2023)

Pages: 410 – 424

DOI: 10.31703/gesr.2023(VIII-I).36

Citation: Saif, S., & Safdar, S. (2023). Maximising Professional Growth: A Case Study Exploring Reflective Practices of Teacher Educators. *Global Educational Studies Review*, VIII(I), 410-424. https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023(VIII-I).36



Maximising Professional Growth: A Case Study Exploring Reflective Practices of Teacher Educators

Sajida Saif

Samina Safdar †

Corresponding Author: Sajida Saif (Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: F2022095004@UMT.edu.pk)

Abstract: This qualitative case study aimed to explore the reflective teaching practices used by teacher educators in their classrooms for professional learning and development in Pakistan. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with two experienced teacher educators from a public university. Using within-case and cross-case analysis, data analysis uncovered themes related to interactive teaching methods, student feedback, self-reflection, collegial support, evaluation techniques, and contextual constraints. The results of the study revealed that teacher educators used reflection-on-action and reflection-for-action techniques for the improvement of their teaching. However, they faced some barriers while implementing these practices in classrooms due to contextual settings. The study's findings emphasise the need for institutional support and the provision of professional development opportunities to teacher educators for facilitating reflective teaching practices. The study contributes meaningful insights into teacher educators' experiences employing reflective practices in their unique contexts.

Key Words: Reflective Teaching, Teacher Education, Professional Development, Qualitative Case Study, Thematic Analysis, Developing Countries

Introduction

Teachers are considered the most significant agents in the education process. It requires continuous effort to develop as a skilled teacher. Generally, teachers' effectiveness is measured by how well they can produce high-quality work (Biggs & Tang, 2016; Ryan et al., 2017). Therefore, committed teachers try to focus on their professional development to prevent losing their enthusiasm or practising in a stagnant manner (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017). Sometimes, it happens that teachers find their teaching stressful at the start of their

teaching careers, but as they get more experience, they develop different teaching skills, which aid them to cope with teaching difficulties. Consequently, they become able to move beyond traditional classroom teaching and get an understanding of their teaching styles. Based on this reflection, they take teaching decisions by themselves. In addition, they get more engaged in self-observation and reflection (Brock, 2014; Cigala et al., 2019; Hallet, 2012; Hayes et al., 2014). This style or approach used by teachers is termed "Reflective Teaching".

p- ISSN: 2708-2113 e-ISSN: 2708-3608 URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023(VIII-I).36

^{*} Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

[†] Assistant Professor of Education, Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Studies, University of Education, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Generally, teachers do not think about the reasons for happing things in classrooms, and they perceive things by their own beliefs. Reflective practices engage teachers in systematic, rigorous, and meticulous thinking processes. Reflective practices enable teachers to change their teaching beliefs and to bring innovation in their teaching which promotes effective learning among students. This approach brings value-added learning. Thus, the reflection process may go towards improvement and modification (Applevard & Appleyard, 2015; Dymoke & Harrison, 2008; Sellars, 2014). The reflection on teaching practices facilitates teachers to achieve the target of professional as well as personal development. Reflective practices are a way to look at what happens in the classrooms, consider what a teacher does, and use this process as a source of self-reflection and selfevaluation. By using the reflective approach, teachers analyse their hypotheses and opinions related to their teaching (Geng et al., 2019; Ghaye, 2011; Jennifer, 2005; Loughran, 2017; Loughran, 2002; York-Barr et al., 2016). Furthermore, when teachers are well aware of the reflective practices; they implement these practices in their classrooms to deal with learning diversity. Some studies revealed that most teachers limited their reflection to students' attitudes and behaviours rather than focusing on their teaching styles. As a result, rather than being a tool for professional development, this type of superficial reflection makes teachers stagnant. Thus, the target of effective teaching cannot be achieved without improving the teachers' ability for using appropriate reflective techniques by keeping in view the contextual setting (Abednia et al., Ahmed et al., 2020a; 2020b; Beauchamp, 2015; Farrell, 2003; Suphasri & Chinokul, <u>202</u>1)

Based on research studies, several effective strategies, including a critical review of assumptions and patterns of teaching, have been proposed in the literature to improve the professional performance of instructors. This supports the fact that reflective practices contribute to a greater understanding of instruction, which in turn promotes the growth

of efficacy and better teaching methods. Moreover, teachers can benefit most from their experience to improve the quality of their instruction (Ashwin et al., 2020; Brookfield, 2017; Combs, 2022; Rayford, 2010; Taggart & Wilson, 2005).

It is universally acknowledged that effective and influential teaching requires a reflective approach, so this approach has become a part of teacher education in response to the scantiness of teachers' effectiveness. However. reflective practices are more extensively used in developed countries as compared to developing countries. Pakistan is included in those developing countries where teachers occasionally find it difficult to apply reflective practices in classrooms because of various environmental constraints such as lack of training sessions and seminars, lack of resources, and environmental inaccessibility. (Al-Rashidi, 2018; Baporikar, 2016; Griffiths, 2000). Such difficulties are considered a great hindrance to the application of reflective practices by teachers in their classrooms (Abu-Sultan & Abu-Asker, 2017; Bawaneh et al., 2020; Chen, 2023; Hassan & Mojtaba, 2018; Naicker & Rensburg, 2018).

Research studies conducted on the reflective practices of teachers indicate that teachers achieved their teaching excellence not only through teaching experience but the use of critical reflection became a base for their professional Teachers development. believed that reflective teaching opened learning opportunities for them, and as a result, they were able to use innovative teaching techniques of instruction to address the diversity of students' learning styles. In addition, they were in a position to evaluate their instructional effectiveness and student learning outcomes (Dinkelman, 2023; Imran et al., 2022; Kuswandono, 2012; Nurkamto & Sarosa, 2020; Pirzada et al., 2021).

Prior research has examined the role of reflective teaching in teacher education and its impact on teaching quality (Beauchamp, 2015; Dinkelman, 2003; Gheith & Aljaberi, 2018). However, there is limited empirical insight into the reflective practices that teacher educators

their adopt within institutional can environments, particularly in developing country contexts (Ahmed et al., 2020a; 2020b). This study addresses this gap by investigating the reflective teaching practices that teacher educators find feasible and valuable in Pakistan. This study might provide empirical insights into the reflective practices that teacher educators can employ within their institutional environments in Pakistan. The findings of the study might have implications for promoting reflective teaching in teacher education programs in developing countries.

Purpose of the Study

Teaching effectiveness is perceived as vital for students' positive learning outcomes (Graham Flamini. 2023). With the growing recognition of this link, there is an increased focus on strengthening teacher training programs that prepare future teachers (Mifsud, 2023). Reflective teaching has emerged as an essential approach to enriching teacher education by fostering continuous professional growth among educators. Therefore, the purpose of this qualitative case study was to explore teacher educators' experiences with employing reflective teaching approaches in their classrooms. The following research questions guided the study:

- 1. What reflective teaching practices do the teacher educators use in teacher training programs?
- **2.** How does teaching experience affect the performance of teacher educators who use reflective teaching practices in teacher training programs?
- **3.** What are the perceived effects of reflective teaching practices on the performance of teacher educators in teacher training programs?

Methods

The qualitative social constructivist case study design focusing on Schön's theory of 'reflection-in-action' and 'reflection-on-action' was used for the study. Stake (2013), and Diem et al., (2023) contend that by using the social constructive approach, the researcher attempts to construct knowledge rather than discover it. Two female teachers from a public sector university were selected as potential participants for the case study. They had 12-14 years of teaching experience at master's levels in teacher training programs.

Table 1Demographic Information of Participants

Participant	Gender	Academic Qualification	Experience
Participant 1	Female	M.Phil Education	12 years
Participant 2	Female	M.Phil Education	14 years

Semi-structured interviews were conducted to gain in-depth insights into participants' experiences based on their reflective practices in classrooms. The interview guide was developed by following the steps suggested by Brinkmann and Kvale, (2015; 2018), Seidman (2019), and Tight (2017), and finalised after piloting. Moreover, with the participants' consent, interviews were audio-recorded and complemented by note-taking, since Flick (2022), Roulston and Choi (2018) mention that doing so makes it easier for the researcher to verify the interviews. Thematic analysis was used to analyse the data gained through semi-

structured interviews of teacher educators. By following the steps proposed by Halkias et al., (2023), Taylor et al., (2016), Thomas (2021) and Yin (2018), interview recordings were transcribed verbatim and translated into English. The analysis of interview transcripts followed a two-step procedure: a within-case analysis of each interview and a cross-case analysis. Data analysis was done in a Microsoft Excel sheet by reading transcripts repeatedly to identify codes and themes guided by the theory of reflective teaching practice.

Several strategies were used to ensure trustworthiness and address ethical concerns.

Strategies used to ensure trustworthiness included member checking of transcripts, piloting of interview guide, cross-case analysis, and reflective journaling. In addition, strategies were used to address ethical concerns, including taking informed consent from each participant before data collection. Furthermore, confidentiality was maintained by using pseudonyms and keeping data secure. All ethical concerns were addressed by keeping in view the suggestions given by Candela (2019), Crabtree and Miller (2022), Creswell and Poth (2018), Mills and Jordan (2022), and Tracy (2020).

Findings

This section presents findings related to the study to explore reflective teaching practices used by teacher educators in their classes of teacher training programs. The first section presents the within-case analysis of the teachers. The second section deals with a crosscase analysis of the interview transcripts.

Participant 1

Participant 1 is a female teacher and holds an M.Phil Education degree. She has been working as a Lecturer in a public sector university for the last 12 years and teaching master's level students enrolled in teacher training programs.

Teaching Strategies

She reports that she uses various teaching methods to involve learners in the classroom, maximise their understanding of the topic, and minimise misconceptions. She often uses different strategies in her class to involve students actively, as she believes that a teacher can achieve learning objectives only if she tries to use a variety of teaching methodologies rather than traditional teaching methods. Furthermore, she believes that by using novel teaching methods, teachers can handle learners' diversity easily and be able to fulfil students' learning needs.

Furthermore, she uses teamwork and group discussion to make students more responsible for their learning and to develop critical thinking skills in students. She states that she uses teamwork to enable students to work collaboratively. Sometimes students cannot perform an activity alone, so she divided them into a team where they can quickly complete the task by sharing the responsibility. She prefers the discussion method as it helps students to process information rather than receive it. It also encourages students' participation in class so every student can get a chance to share her ideas and knowledge with other students. This practice makes students more interactive and participative in the learning process.

She relates her lecture with real-life practices to make learning more realistic rather than traditional. She states that the lecture is more interesting if a teacher relates it to daily experiences. Further, it explains the course material more clearly and concisely. It also helps students to get more conceptual clarity. She also tries to engage students in hands-on activities to make learning more experiential and authentic. She believes that the engagement of students in real-life learning activities is less likely to become bored and disinterested.

She always gets feedback from students by using different methods to make her teaching more effective. Primarily, she practices the question answers technique. She also encourages her students to write their reflections about the previously learned lectures. She prepares some tests to get feedback from students and encourages them to ask questions if they feel ambiguity in any topic. She believes such practice develops students' critical thinking skills and allows them to reproduce their learning.

She gives her students comments regularly to help them enhance their performance and learning. She consistently makes an effort to review their work and provides verbal and written feedback. She provides regular feedback to students, which makes them more responsible for their learning, and they try to complete their tasks well on time. This practice is also linked with the purpose of the lesson plan and required students' performance. She

appreciates students while giving feedback on their good performance. This feedback facilitates students to be well aware of their learning progress and consequently, they can evaluate their performance according to predetermined criteria.

Self-reflective Practices

She always tries to improve her teaching procedures through reflection and self-assessment techniques. She believes that thinking for a few minutes about what works well in class and how it can be different for the next session helps her to improve her teaching. It also motivates her to do something different in her next class and to make much preparation for her next session. A significant part of this practice includes improvement in teaching methodologies.

She always gets better solutions to learning problems/issues by sharing them with her experienced colleagues and friends. She believes that our colleagues are often the best people we can turn to for help. Therefore, she does not feel shy to seek guidance from her experienced coworkers regarding different classroom problems, and it always helps her to get a better solution for the problem as all her colleagues are very cooperative and helpful. It makes her more comfortable to discuss classroom problems with them and try to handle the situation wisely.

She always attempts to identify her weaknesses and strengths by getting students' reflections after every session. She thinks getting a response at the end of every session helps to improve the next session. She prepares a test at the end of the unit or module to get feedback about what students have learned and what she taught them. This feedback helps her to identify her weaknesses and strengths, and she can try to improve her teaching methodology considering the student's feedback.

Learning Evaluation

She evaluates students' learning by using different assessment practices. She uses the

question-answer technique at the end of class to assess her performance. Sometimes, she takes a short test based on MCQs to evaluate the previous lecture. She states that using these evaluative techniques could make her lesson more exciting and modify her teaching strategies. She could identify students' needs through different evaluation techniques and plan her lesson accordingly. Therefore, she constantly evaluates her lecture using different practices to get student feedback.

She states that teaching might be improved by keeping different learning records of the students. She believes that maintaining portfolios of students encourages them to reflect on their learning. Students may come to understand what they have and have not learned. It also helps her to identify students' learning difficulties and encourage them to take more ownership and responsibility for the learning process. She tries to keep her students' learning records but does not practice them formally. Sometimes, she keeps a diary to note essential teaching activities and maintain teaching records.

She uses different reflective practices to make her teaching more effective, but these practices may not be used properly due to many environmental constraints. She never shares her teaching experiences in any particular reflective journals or web blogs, but she has completed some research papers on teaching and learning published in different research journals. She neither writes any autobiography nor asks her colleagues to observe her class and give feedback, as she believes it is impossible at the university level. Also, she never records her teaching as such facilities are unavailable at the university.

She identifies learning difficulties using formative assessment techniques and plans teaching according to students' needs. She uses these techniques in her class frequently and repeatedly asks questions to students. She uses quizzes and tests to engage students in learning the subject matter. It helps her to analyse what she has taught students and how she can make it much better than previously.

She can manage different classroom problems by understanding students' needs and designing teaching strategies accordingly. She faces many classroom problems like demotivation in students, less interest in lectures, irregularity, and other disciplinary problems. She attempts to solve these problems by using different techniques.

She can overcome classroom issues by developing positive, and friendly relationships with students and encouraging them to share their problems freely. She talks to them individually and encourages them to share their problems freely. She motivates her students to learn by involving them in individual and group activities. She establishes reliance among students for active engagement in learning activities, and a supportive, safe, and value-based environment is created by her for maximum learning productivity.

Mentoring

She attempts to create a healthy learning environment by using reward strategies only to motivate students towards learning. She appreciates students and avoids punishment as it promotes uncertainty among students. Moreover, it can also dishearten them and they can become less motivated in their learning.

She enables her students to talk about their problems freely, but if the problems prolong, parents and administration may be involved where necessary. She tries to resolve students' problems at the class level, but if the problem persists and may be related to her personal or home issues, she involves parents to get a deeper understanding of the issue. However, it rarely happens as students are mature enough so the issues/difficulties can be overcome sensibly. She involves administration where it appears necessary by using all available means.

She uses supporting strategies to prepare students for future challenges and help them to solve different academic, personal, and professional problems. She thinks guidance and counselling prepare students for future challenges by supporting their academic, career, personal/social development, and

community participation. She always assists them to ensure that they can make the right decisions for them in terms of their personal and professional needs. She always remains available for her students to support them with any problem.

She believes that teaching could be improved through self-reflective practices, which helps teachers get much insight into their teaching methodologies. These practices can be improved if the institutions regularly provide different professional development opportunities to their teachers. She states that institutions should provide professional development opportunities so that teachers may excel in their professional fields and perform well in their classes.

Participant 2

Participant 2 is a female and holds an M.Phil Education degree. She is also working as Lecturer at the same university for the last 14 years and teaching master's level students enrolled in a teacher training program.

Teaching methods

She uses differentiated instructional methods for classroom activities and to achieve learning objectives. She thinks that a teacher should try to use a variety of teaching methodologies rather than a traditional one so that students can learn better and actively. On the other hand, a teacher can get immediate feedback about her teaching to frame her teaching strategies according to students' needs. She also gets high participation of students in her class by using various teaching methods. She her students in PowerPoint presentations and discussion methods rather than only using a lecture method. She also arranges different activities for students to engage them in the learning process. She also uses discussion methods in the classroom to enhance students' analytical and communication skills.

She involves students in group work and discussion-based activities to enhance their self-confidence, as she believes that it is essential not only for learning but also to perform different life responsibilities. She thinks that working in groups enhances students' ability to work collaboratively, as they learn to share win and loss stories collectively—promoting teamwork spirit among students.

She provides more realistic examples from daily life to relate learning with everyday life experiences, which offers concrete learning experiences. She thinks that it enhances students' interest in learning and makes the learning objective and evidence-based. It makes learning more robust and more vibrant also. Students learn better by getting their own experiences which build more realistic concepts towards learning material rather than theoretical or rote learning.

She always gets student feedback using different methods to make her teaching more effective. Primarily, she uses question answers technique to get feedback from students. She also encourages students to write their reflections about the previously learned lectures. She gives short tests to get feedback from students. She believes that getting feedback from students is helpful to refine her teaching and learn more innovative teaching methods accordingly.

She always provides feedback to her students regularly to make them more responsible towards learning and improve their performance. She provides regular feedback to students in both verbal and written form, which provokes them to try to complete their tasks well in time. She thinks that giving regular feedback to students motivates them to work quickly and brings more refinement to their learning.

Self-reflection

She improves her teaching through self-reflection and by using self-assessment techniques. She believes that thinking provides guidelines for more improvements. She believes that teaching without reflection is imperfect. It helps to make teaching livelier and more exciting. She also tries to overcome her

teaching deficiencies based on these reflections.

She reports that she gets a better solution to learning problems/issues by sharing them with trustworthy friends and colleagues and getting guidance. She believes that problemsharing with trustworthy friends minimises the problem difficulty. She does not feel reluctant to seek guidance from her co-workers regarding different classroom problems, and it always helps her to get a better solution to the problem.

She identifies her flaws and strengths by getting students' reflections after every session. She also measures students' learning and her teaching by using different evaluative practices to maximise classroom engagement. She considers that reflection on teaching helps to make teaching more exciting and motivational according to students' needs.

Lesson Evaluation

She can better understand her students by keeping their learning records in various forms. She states that keeping students, records helps her to monitor students learning over time. It also helps her to identify students learning problems, raising their spirits to show more concern and take responsibility for the learning progress. Record keeping also helps teachers to evaluate their teaching and to refine their teaching methodologies according to the learner's needs. Therefore, she tries to keep her students' learning records but not in any formal way, but she recommends that her students maintain their portfolios and keep all their learning accomplishments in them. She often uses a diary to write down the essential things in it.

She further mentioned that she can use different reflective practices to make her teaching more effective, but these practices may not be used properly due to many environmental constraints. She never shares her teaching experiences in reflective journals or web blogs, but she has some research publications on teaching and learning. Since it is occasionally impossible due to her coworkers'

hectic schedules, she didn't request any of them to observe her class and provide comments. Further, she never records her teaching as such facilities are unavailable at the university.

She has designed different assessment techniques after short intervals to identify learning issues and improve the students' learning. She believes it is the best way to get quick feedback from students. She believes that a teacher can modify the teaching strategies based on these periodic assessments to maximise students' learning. It also identifies the target areas which are needed to improve.

Classroom problems /challenges

She recognises different classroom challenges and tries to change her teaching methodology to minimise these learning issues. She notices many classroom problems like de-motivation in students, less interest in lectures, irregularity, and other disciplinary problems. She tries to solve these problems by using different techniques. She thinks that a teacher must have the ability to overcome different classroom issues so she might be able to handle learning diversity in the classroom.

She develops a good relationship with students, so they can share their problems with her, and disruptive behaviours can be controlled by establishing a good rapport with students. She communicates with them individually and encourages them to share their problems freely. She motivates them towards learning by appealing to them in different individual and group activities. She establishes a conducive learning environment where every student can feel valued, safe and secure.

Mentoring

She monitors students' progress by using formative and summative assessment techniques including oral or written tests, quizzes etc. This way, she identifies the learning weaknesses and strengths of the students and suggests them appropriate measures to promote their learning. This assessment also facilitates her to improve or

modify her teaching methods. She encourages the students to provide feedback on her teaching so she can improve it. She also arranges informal meetings with students for more rapport building. These meetings facilitate students to discuss their learning difficulties comfortably. She also encourages shy students to discuss their learning difficulties individually.

Cross-case Analysis

Both participants use various teaching methods like teamwork, group discussions, relating concepts to real life, and engaging students in hands-on activities. This shows their focus on student-centred approaches and making learning interactive and experiential. The participants commonly use student feedback through questions, reflections, and tests to improve their teaching. This reflective practice helps them to modify their teaching strategies. Both participants provide regular verbal and written feedback to students on their work. This helps to enhance student learning and responsibility.

Both participants engage themselves in self-reflection and self-assessment to improve their teaching. They also share problems with colleagues to get guidance. Student feedback also helps them to identify their weaknesses and strengths. Participants use techniques like questions, tests, and maintaining records to evaluate student learning and teaching. These techniques help them to monitor students' progress and make improvements in teaching. The participants face constraints in using specific reflective techniques like writing research journals, classroom in observation, and autobiography writing. The participants build positive relationships with students and use motivation and rewards rather than punishment. They involve parents and administration when required to resolve persistent issues. The participants provide students with academic, career and personal guidance and counselling to support their development. Both participants acknowledge the need for support from the administration of the institutions to provide professional development opportunities to teachers for enhancing their skills.

This cross-case analysis reveals strong commonalities between the two cases in using reflective teaching practices for continuous professional development. The key differences were found in using specific techniques. The main differences are that Participant 1 uses more hands-on activities, record-keeping, and research publications than Participant 2. The comparative analysis yields insights into personal preferences for shaping specific techniques. This analysis is summarised in Table 2:

 Table 2

 Cross-Case Analysis of Similarities and Differences in Reflective Teaching Practices

•	••	•	
Participant 1	Participant 2	Similarities	Differences
Uses teamwork, group discussions, relating concepts to real-life, hands- on activities	Uses group discussions, relating concepts to real-life	Both use interactive, student-centred methods like discussions, reallife examples	PI uses teamwork, hands-on activities
Question-answer, tests, student reflections	Question-answer, written student reflections	Both use discussions, tests, and reflections for feedback	P2 focuses more on written reflections
Verbal and written feedback on work	Verbal and written feedback on work	Both provide regular verbal & written feedback	-
Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback	Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback	Both use self- assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback	-
Questions, tests, student records	Questions, tests, student records	Both use questions and tests for evaluation	PI maintains student records.
No journals/blogs, published papers	No journals/blogs, no publications	Both do not use journals/blogs	PI has publications
Positive relationships, motivation	Positive relationships, motivation	Both build relationships with students, use motivation	-
Support through guidance and counselling	Support through guidance and counselling	Both provide guidance and counselling	-
Need for more opportunities	Need for more opportunities	Both acknowledge the need for more professional development	-
	Uses teamwork, group discussions, relating concepts to real-life, handson activities Question-answer, tests, student reflections Verbal and written feedback on work Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback Questions, tests, student records No journals/blogs, published papers Positive relationships, motivation Support through guidance and counselling Need for more	Uses teamwork, group discussions, relating concepts to real-life, hands on activities Question-answer, tests, student reflections Verbal and written feedback on work Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback Questions, tests, student records No journals/blogs, published papers Positive relationships, motivation Support through guidance and counselling Need for more Uses group discussions, relating concepts to real-life Uses group discussions, relating concepts to real-life Verbal and written feedback on work Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback Verbal and written feedback on work Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student records No journals/blogs, publications No journals/blogs, no publications Positive relationships, motivation Support through guidance and counselling Need for more	Uses teamwork, group discussions, relating concepts to real-life, hands- on activities Question-answer, tests, student reflections Verbal and written feedback on work Self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student records Questions, tests, student records Questions, tests, student records Positive relationships, motivation Support through guidance and counselling Need for more opportunities Uses group discussions, real-interactive, student recitive, student centred methods like discussions, real-life examples Both use discussions, tests, and reflections for feedback Both provide regular verbal & written feedback Both use self-assessment, guidance from colleagues, student feedback Both use questions and tests for evaluation Both do not use journals/blogs publications Both build relationships with students, use motivation Both provide guidance and counselling Both acknowledge the need for more opportunities opportunities

Discussion

This qualitative constructivist case study aimed to explore the reflective teaching practices used by teacher educators in teacher training programs at a public university in Lahore. The findings reveal that the participants use various reflective techniques to improve their teaching practices in the classrooms. The study's results showed that the participants employed student-centred, interactive teaching methods like teamwork, group discussions, hands-on activities, and relating concepts to real-life situations. This finding is consistent with Prince's (2004) study results, which showed that students' engagement and knowledge retention were boosted through involvement and experiential learning. The participants' adoption of these instructional strategies demonstrates their comprehension of active learning theories and their capacity to apply them despite contextual limitations.

Both participants extensively use student feedback to evaluate their teaching and identify areas for improvement. Their feedback practices, like verbal discussions, written reflections, and short tests. reflect commitment to ongoing growth—a fundamental tenet of reflective practice. These reflective practices were found to be effective in the study findings of different researchers (Ashwin et al., 2020; Farrell, 2015; Zulfikar & Mujiburrahman, 2018). Moreover, this finding is consistent with study results conducted by Pacheco (2011) and Olaya (2018). Participants believed that seeking guidance from colleagues can broaden their viewpoints and address classroom challenges. This relates to the concepts of reflection-on-action and reflectionfor-action developed by Schön (1983).

However, it is evident from the within-case analysis and cross-case analysis that limitations in using certain practices existed. This is consistent with studies showing that reflective teaching adoption requires organisational support (Ahmed et al., 2020b; Twining et al., 2014). Due to university norms, participants cannot formally share their experiences through journals or observations, still, they use other appropriate techniques. This

demonstrates their ability to creatively navigate obstacles in the environment.

An interesting contrast is Participant 1's greater use of interactive techniques, record-keeping, and research publications, indicative of more initiatives enabled by her context. Nevertheless, both cases depict the thoughtful application of reflective techniques adapted to their unique situations.

The study has certain limitations: The small sample size of two cases which constrains generalizability (Gomm et al., 2000; Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Further qualitative research could involve more participants from different universities and programs. In addition, quantitative research can address the issue of generalizability and produce more generalisable findings. There is also scope for 'longitudinal studies' (Saldaña, 2003) to assess reflective practice changes over time.

However, findings have valuable implications for teacher training programs that can deliberately work towards promoting teaching practices. The study reflective highlights the importance of an enabling institutional environment where faculty can access professional training, peer collaboration opportunities, and resources to use reflective practices. Such organisational support can help overcome barriers and encourage continuous professional growth as indicated by Ashwin et al., (2020) and Williams et al., (2012).

Conclusion

The study makes a valuable contribution by providing in-depth insights into teacher educators' first-hand experiences employing reflective teaching approaches. The findings have implications for teacher training institutions that promote reflective practice among faculty members. The results emphasise the need for a supportive environment with professional development, peer collaboration, and resources to enable reflective teaching. Despite its limitations, this study sheds light on the reflective teaching practices that teacher educators find feasible and helpful for continuous improvement. The cases reveal how faculty members thoughtfully adapt techniques to their unique situations while navigating organisational constraints. The research findings can help the administration and policymakers to support teachers by

implementing the necessary actions and promoting reflective practices in their classrooms, hence enhancing professional development and teaching quality.

References

- Abednia, A., Hovassapian, A., Teimournezhad, S., & Ghanbari, N. (2013). Reflective about teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *53*(1), 33-43.
- Abednia, A., Hovassapian, A., Teimournezhad, S., & Ghanbari, N. (2013). Reflective journal writing: Exploring in-service EFL teachers' perceptions. *System*, *41*(3), 503–514.
 - https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2013.0 5.003
- Abu-Sultan, A., & Abu Asker, M. (2017). The reflective practices of science teachers' action strategies. United Kingdom: SAGE Publications.
- Afshar, H. S., & Farahani, M. (2017). Inhibitors to EFL teachers' reflective teaching and EFL learners' reflective thinking and the role of teaching experience and academic degree in reflection perception. *Reflective Practice*, 19(1), 46–67. https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2017.1351353
- Ahmed, F., Muhammad, Y., & Anis, F. (2020).

 Developing Secondary School Teachers'
 Positive Attitude towards Reflective
 Teaching: A Collaborative Action
 Research Study. Sjesr, 3(4), 43–53.

 https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol3-iss4-2020(43-53)
- Al-Rashidi, F. (2018). The level of using the reflective practices among secondary school teachers-from their points of viewin Baredah governorate. *Journal of Faculty for Basic Education in Educational and Human Sciences*, 38, 284-294. https://www.iasj.net/iasj/article/142198
- Appleyard, K., Appleyard, N. (2015). *Reflective* teaching and learning in further education. United Kingdom: Critical Publishing.
- Ashwin, P., Boud, D., Calkins, S., Coate, K., Hallett, F., Light, G., . . . McLean, M. (2020). *Reflective teaching in higher education*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Baporikar, N. (2016). Technology Integration and Innovation during Reflective

- Teaching. International Journal of Information and Communication Technology Education, 12(2), 14–22. https://doi.org/10.4018/ijicte.2016040102
- Bawaneh, A. K., Moumene, A. B. H., & Aldalalah, O. (2020). Gauging the Level of Reflective Teaching Practices among Science Teachers. *International Journal of Instruction*, *13*(1), 695–712. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13145
- Beauchamp, C. (2014). Reflection in teacher education: issues emerging from a review of current literature. *Reflective Practice*, *16*(1), 123–141. https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2014. 982525
- Biggs, J., Tang, C. (2011). *Teaching for quality learning at university*. United Kingdom: McGraw-Hill Education.
- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2015). *Interviews:*Learning the craft of qualitative research interviewing (3rd ed.). London: Sage.
- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2018). *Doing interviews (2nd ed.)*. London: Sage.
- Brock, A. (2014). *The early years' reflective practice handbook*. United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis
- Brookfield, S. (2017). Becoming a critically reflective teacher. United Kingdom: Wiley.
- Candela, A. G. (2019). Exploring the Function of Member Checking. *The Qualitative Report*, 24(3), 619-628. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2019.3726
- Cigala, A., Venturelli, E., & Bassetti, M. (2019). Reflective Practice: A Method to Improve Teachers' Well-Being. A Longitudinal Training in Early Childhood Education and Care Centers. Frontiers in Psychology, 10.
 - https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.025 74
- Crabtree, B. F., & Miller, W. L. (2022). *Doing qualitative research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design:*

- Choosing among five approaches (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.
- Darling-Hammond, L., Burns, D., Campbell, C., Goodwin, A. L., Hammerness, K., Low, E., McIntyre, A., Sato, M. (2017). *Empowered educators: How high-performing systems shape teaching quality around the world.* United Kingdom: Wiley.
- Diem, S., Good, M. W., & Walters, S. W. (2023). Toward critical approaches to case study research. In M. D. Young & S. Diem (Eds.), Handbook of critical education research: Qualitative, quantitative, and emerging approaches. New York: Routledge.
- Dinkelman, T. (2003). Self-study in teacher education: A means and ends tool for promoting reflective teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *54*(1), 6–18. https://doi.org/10.1177/002248710223 8654
- Dymoke, S., & Harrison, A. (2008). *Reflective teaching and learning*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Farrell, T. S. C. (2015). Reflective practice in ESL teacher development groups: From practices to principles. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Flick, U. (2022). *Doing interview research: The essential how-to guide*. London: Sage.
- Geng, G., Disney, L., Smith, P., & Black, P. (2019) (Eds.). Yoshi Budd's reflective practice in teaching: pre-service teachers and the lens of life experience. Germany: Springer Nature Singapore.
- Ghaye, T. (2011). Teaching and learning through reflective practice: A practical guide for positive action (2nd ed.). London: Routledge.
- Gheith, E., & Aljaberi, N. (2018). Reflective Teaching Practices in Teachers and Their Attitudes Toward Professional Self-development. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, *14*(3), 161–180. https://doi.org/10.29329/ijpe.2018.146.
- Gomm, R., Hammersley, M., & Foster, P. (2000). *Case study method: key issues, key texts*: SAGE Publications.

- Graham, J., & Flamini, M. (2021). Teacher Quality and Students' Post-Secondary Outcomes. *Educational Policy*, *37*(3), 800–839.
 - https://doi.org/10.1177/089590482110 49429
- Griffiths, V. (2000). The reflective dimension in teacher education. *International Journal of Educational Research*, *33*(5), 539–555.
 - https://doi.org/10.1016/s0883-0355(00)00033-1
- Halkias, D., Neubert, M., & Harkiolakis, N. (2023). Multiple Case Study Data Analysis for Doctoral Researchers in Management and Leadership. Social Science Research Network. https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4423757
- Hallet, E. (2012). *The reflective early years'* practitioner. United Kingdom: SAGE Publications.
- Hayes, C., Daly, J., Duncan, M., Gill, R., & Whitehouse, A. (2014). *Developing as a reflective early pears Professional: A thematic approach*. United Kingdom: Critical Publishing.
- Imran, A., Muhammad, Y., & Waqar, Y. (2022). Prospective teachers' conceptions of reflective teaching: A qualitative study. Research Journal of Social Sciences & Economics Review, 3(3), 75-82. https://doi.org/10.36902/rjsser-vol3-iss3-2022(75-82)
- Jennifer, A. M. (2005). *Reflection in learning* and professional development: Theory and practice. United Kingdom.
- Kuswandono, P. (2012). Reflective Practices for Teacher Education. *Language and Language Teaching Journal*, *15*(01), 149–162.
 - https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.2012.15010 2
- Loughran, J. (2017). Foreword. In R. Brandenburg, K. Glasswell, M. Jones, & J. Ryan (Eds.), *Reflective theory and practice in teacher education (pp. v-vi)*. Singapore: Springer.
- Loughran, J. J. (2002). Effective reflective practice: in search of meaning in learning about teaching. *Journal of Teacher*

- Education, 53(1), 33–43. https://doi.org/10.1177/002248710205 3001004
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation, San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons.
- Mifsud, D. (2023). Rethinking the concept of teacher education: A problematization and critique of current policies and practices. In D. Mifsud & S. P. Day (Eds.), *Teacher education as an ongoing professional trajectory: Implications for policy and practice* (pp. 1-23). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Mills, G., & Jordan, A. (2022). Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications (13 ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.
- Naicker, K., & Van Rensburg, G. H. (2018). Facilitation of Reflective Learning in Nursing: Reflective Teaching Practices of Educators. *Africa Journal of Nursing and Midwifery*, 20(2).

https://doi.org/10.25159/2520-5293/3386

Nurkamto, J., & Sarosa, T. (2020). Engaging EFL Teachers in Reflective Practice as A Way to Pursue Sustained Professional Development. *International Journal of Pedagogy and Teacher Education*, 4(1), 45–58.

https://doi.org/10.20961/ijpte.v4i1.260 82

- Olaya Mesa, M. L. (2018). Reflective Teaching: An Approach to Enrich the English Teaching Professional Practice. *HOW*, 25(2), 149–170. https://doi.org/10.19183/how.25.2.386
- Pacheco, A. Q. (2011). Reflective teaching and its impact on foreign language teaching. Actualidades Investigativas En Educación, 5(3).

https://doi.org/10.15517/aie.v5i3.9166

Pirzada, G., Muhammad, Y., & Ahmed, F. (2021). Vocational Education Practitioners Learning to Write Reflective Journal through Reflections on their Experiences during the Covid-19 Pandemic. Pakistan Social Sciences

- Review, 5(I), 701–717. https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2021(5-i)53
- Prince, M. (2004). Does Active Learning Work? A Review of the Research. *Journal of Engineering Education*, *93*(3), 223–231. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2168-9830.2004.tb00809.x
- Rayford, C. R. (2010). Reflective practice: The teacher in the mirror (Unpublished master thesis). University of Nevada, Las Vegas
- Roulston, K., & Choi, M. (2018). Qualitative interviews. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The SAGE Handbook of qualitative data collection* (pp. 233-249). London: Sage Publications.
- Ryan, J., Glasswell, K., Jones, M., & Brandenburg, R. (2017). *Reflective theory and practice in teacher education*. Singapore: Springer Singapore.
- Saldaña, J. (2003). Longitudinal qualitative research: Analyzing change through time. New York: Altamira Press.
- Schön, D. A. (1983). The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action (Vol. 5126): Basic books.
- Seidman, I. (2019). *Interviewing as qualitative* research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences (5th ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Sellars, M. (2014). *Reflective practice for teachers*. India: SAGE Publications.
- Stake, R. E. (2013). Multiple case study analysis. New York: Guilford Press.
- Suphasri, P., & Chinokul, S. (2021). Reflective Practice in Teacher Education: Issues, Challenges, and Considerations. *PASAA*, 62 (2021), 236-264. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ13349 98.pdf
- Taggart, G. L., & Wilson, A. P. (2005). *Promoting reflective thinking in teachers:* 50 action strategies. United Kingdom: SAGE Publications.
- Taylor, S. J., Bogdan, R., & DeVault, M. (2016). In-depth interviewing Introduction to qualitative research methods: A guidebook and resource (4th ed.). New York: John Wiley and Sons.
- Thomas, G. (2021). *How to do your case study*. London: Sage Publications Limited.

- Tight, M. (2017). Understanding case study research: Small-scale research with meaning. London: Sage.
- Tracy, S. J. (2020). Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact (2nd ed.). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Twining, P., Raffaghelli, J., Albion, P., & Knezek, D. (2014). Educational information systems research: Technical issues and methods for using new technologies to study teachers' on-the-job learning. *Education and Information Technologies*, 19(2), 403-416.
- Williams, R. B., Brien, K., & LeBlanc, J. (2012). Transforming Schools into Learning Organizations: Supports and Barriers to

- Educational Reform. Canadian Journal of Educational Administration and Policy, 134.
- Yin, R. K. (2018). Case study research and applications: Design and methods (6th ed.). New York: Sage Publications.
- York-Barr, J., Sommers, W. A., & Ghere, G. S. (2016). *Reflective practice for renewing schools: An action guide for educators*. United States: SAGE Publications.
- Zulfikar, T. (2018). Understanding own teaching: becoming reflective teachers through reflective journals. *Reflective Practice*, 19(1), 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2017 1.1295933